

Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) captioning is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility. CART Captioning and this realtime file may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Welcome to the 2022 NYCETC Conference

Come on down, don't be shy!

Please everybody know there's no food or beverages in here. If you've come in with food or beverages, please go outside and throw it out. Otherwise you'll be kicked out not by us, but by the house. Sorry.

We're going to get started in two minutes, folks. Thank you.

Again, if you've got food or drink in here, you will be expelled. So please don't.

We have a big line up front causing almost a fire hazard so we're giving it some time.

It's with great pleasure that you welcome you to the New York City Employment and Training Coalition conference, advancing talent and equity for a thriving economy. Not only our first conference in three years, but also NYCETC's 25th anniversary! My name is Annie Garneva. I'm had the honor of working with many of you over the last 11 years at the coalition.

And I've had the privilege of serving as the interim CEO for the last 10 months.

Beyond its death toll and healthcare tragedies, the pandemic and subsequent recession highlighted and deanened our city's already unbearable inequity and uneven access to economic growth. Over 1 million New Yorkers lost their jobs. And while the job loss has impacted workers across every socioeconomic experience, the loss has disproportionately impacted women, people of color, low income workers, immigrants, and historically marginalized New Yorkers.

These are the New Yorkers that you, the coalition's members and parts, never start supporting through job placement and services over the last two and a half years, despite a skyrocketing demand for workforce services, while budget cuts,

staff layoffs and burnout ran rampant. In fact, our members met the pandemic's turmoil with urgency, pivoting programming, developing curricula and deepening wrap-around services.

New York City workforce development community is truly exceptional and its diversity, tenacity and steadfast commitment to ensure that the opportunities are driven by and for New Yorkers in our communities.

Today's conference is a celebration of the field's imagination and work, or as I have lovingly been referring to while organizing this conference for the last two months, an array of idea appetizers to whet your pallet and inspire you to build and collaborate.

I would like to extend my appreciation to Stephanie, Lena and MJ who is back there doing Zoom.

For all that they do and for helping to pull together today's program. I would also like to acknowledge our board of directors, representing 22 of the coalition's over 200 members, all incredible leaders who provide an invaluable service to the coalition and our great city each and every day.

I would also like to thank the volunteers here today who are giving their time to help produce today's event. We literally could not have done this without you.

Many people here today are dedicated members of the coalition, and our work to educate the field and increase investments in our communities. While many others are new to the coalition. Whether a committed member and partners, or joining for the first time, you have come together to listen, share, and learn from each other with one common mission: Become better at our shared craft of providing skilled training and education into high quality jobs and careers, and to work together to advocate, to advance policy, practice, and outcomes for the city's workforce system.

Throughout the day, please take a moment to share your experience on social media using the hashtag #nycetc conference and follow us on Twitter and Instagram.

This year's theme advancing talent and equity for a thriving economy will examine the systemic and programmatic business challenge and solutions. The morning's agenda is centered around the city's vision for an improved workforce ecosystem and equitable recovery. We're excited to hear from Mayor Eric Adams and other leaders from the office, on their vision and plans for creating a stronger system and services for New Yorkers and businesses and how service providers can collaborate and grow. As the day goes, we'll examine the landscape of workforce services and how organizations across the system are collaborating and developing functional and actionable programming for their clients to access careers in our 21st century economy.

Themes for the afternoon slate of programming include program structures and funding, talent development, the great resignation, labor market needs, and the role of unions and organizing.

Throughout the day you'll also hear from your peers through TED-talk-style presentations focused on innovative solutions to problems many of you have experienced in the workforce development sector. We hope you will be inspired to connect and implement similar efforts within your own organizations.

And without further ado I would like to introduce Cecilia Kushner, president of nontraditional Employment for Women and NYCETC's board chair.

[Applause]

>> Kathleen Culhane: Good morning all. Again, on behalf of the training and coalition and their board of directors, I want to welcome you to our conference today. And what I am confident will be a dynamic and informative series of conversations and presentations that will help us recognize the tremendous achievements of our members, and the complexity of this post pandemic workforce landscape.

As the president of New, an organization celebrating its 44th year -- thank you -- I lead a talented team that is committed to training, placing and supporting

women in the skill-building trades in New York City and beyond.

The tradeswomen that we work with were identified as essential workers two years ago. On the front lines, making sure that hospitals and other care-providing facilities were open from the start of the pandemic.

And during those years, we pivoted from in-person to virtual to hybrid. We found new ways to support our community. And we kept our graduates on track.

While caring for each other.

And I am guessing that sounds very familiar to many of you.

COVID has changed our work, but our coalition never wavered. We dug in, and we really dug in. And provided pathways to stability and success.

Give yourselves a round of applause for that.

[Applause]

At a truly transformative moment in the history of our city, the New York City Employment and Training Coalition is poised to reimagine the intersection between workforce development and economic development, and to position all New Yorkers for success in the 21st century. This would not have been possible without the skill and dedication of a truly powerful women-led team.

And I want to take a moment here to acknowledge and thank Annie Garneva for each one of her 11 years of commitment to the coalition, especially for her stewardship and diligence during these last two. Thank you, Annie.

[Applause]

And at this time, I am very pleased and proud to introduce you to the new chief executive officer of the NYCETC, Greg Morris. Greg joins us having spent 25 years in New York City as a leader, practitioner, and advocate on both a city and state level, for education and workforce development.

He is now tasked with guiding New York City employment and training and coalition's efforts to respond to and transform a fractured workforce system, and close the disproportionate gaps in employment and earnings New Yorkers face across race, gender, age, and industry.

It is fair to say that it is a heavy lift, and it will take time. But Greg, we got your

back. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> That's where my career started, 25 years in the sector. It started in education and workforce development programs, and I'm deeply, deeply proud of the teams and partners that I've worked with over the years to build communities, to be able to ensure job readiness and success, to move folk from a first job to a future job, to a career, to an education plan, to a credential, and to a degree.

Because that's what you do, and that's what we do together. And that's the pathway to economic mobility. That's the pathway to ensuring that someone can live in a city that, can we agree, is increasingly more and more difficult to afford?

It's truly an honor to be responsible for the coalition right now. And I want to move as quickly to the panels and chats, because we have a stacked deck today, of extraordinary leaders, from every sector, in every corner of our city, to stand together today to share their thinking with you, about what they believe the future holds.

But it's important for us to agree on the following point: That unless we start thinking about how we do together, we are not going to be able to heal a fractured workforce development system. And by the way, and I think we can all agree as well, that if our sole focus is simply on finding jobs, that's not enough.

That it's a career path that will always be the difference-maker. And to ensure that that's possible, you have to be at the front. You have to lead the pack. And you have to explain to folks how to make that real. Are you in on that? Is that something you believe in?

Is that something that matters to you?

We have reckoned with an unimaginable crisis in public health. And a disproportionately impacted Black and Brown New Yorkers, lower income New Yorkers, folks in high-poverty neighborhoods. That's what we've been through. And it's not enough right now to stand and say there's a North Star. We don't want to go back. It's not enough just to say it. We have to create the scaffolding

to reach that north star. And that requires systemic change. Because of the persistent and structural inequities that disproportionately impact Black and Brown New Yorkers, lower income New Yorkers, and folks who live in higher poverty neighborhoods. The way we teach and train, the way we partner, the way we fund and employ, the way we organize has to change.

But the way we think about our city's value and purpose as it relates to social mobility, and equity, and affordable, has to change first. That's what today is about. That's what today is planting the flag to focus on and believe in.

This 200-member coalition represents the interests and desires of 6 hundred thousand New Yorkers, 600,000. That's 15% of the entire workforce. And that's a body, by the way, that we work with, that you work with, that the coalition works with, primarily made of women, who still earn \$0.80 for every dollar a man does.

It's made up the 16-24s whose unemployment rate skyrocketed during the pandemic and hasn't yet bounced back. It's made up of folks we've trained who are older adults who have to make really hard choices every month about food, medicine, and rent and are thinking about a second career because they've got to figure out how to live in the city.

Who else do we drain? It's immigrant, parents, it's justice-involved individuals, it's the homeless, just to name a few. You're focused on their success, you're focused on the ready for what's next. You're focused on preparing them for a 21st century economy. And I know this, as I've said, because I've helped been a part of teams that have done this work for a very long time. Working in collaboration and coordination with teams and individuals, each of you who don't get caught up in where someone starts from. Don't get lost in the perceived limitations that some folks have. Like you, I believe in resilience. Like you, like you, it's about being relentless about potential.

We are the largest workforce association in the country. That's what you are part of. And that makes us a force for the change we seek. So today, my

friends, my peers, my colleagues, whether you're an educator or a job developer, whether you're a reporter, an analyst, you're an agency representative or a union rep, an employer or an elected official, because they're all coming today.

Whether you're an intern or the mayor of New York City who's coming today to see you, take the time you need to look outward at what matters. Take the time you need to look inward about what you're going to do. Because each of us, each of us carries the weight of changing the course. And each of us is going to be responsible for fulfilling our city's collective promise.

Once again I thank you for allowing me this tremendous opportunity. And like you know, we've got work to do. Thank you, everybody.

[Applause]

I need to acknowledge our tremendous sponsors that make today possible. Without them we couldn't put this together, we couldn't gather together in this space. Our premier and supporter level sponsors, JP Morgan, the mayor's office of talent and workforce development, common point Queens, grant associates and the Lester fund. So generous so supportive. Please give them a round of applause.

[Applause]

And please join us in welcoming one of our conference sponsors, Rafia Zahir-Uddin vice president of global philanthropy at JPMorgan Chase and Company. We need a large round of applause for this one.

[Applause]

>> Wow, I'm not sure how to follow that, but I'll try. Good morning, it's wonderful to be in community with you all. I see some familiar faces, colleagues, mentors and peers. Before I start, I want to acknowledge the amazing team at the New York City Employment Training Coalition for coordinating today's conference, and I also want to welcome Greg to the organization. It seems like he's hit the ground running.

My name is Rafia, I'm part of the corporate responsibility team at JPMorgan

Chase. In my role I help oversee our firm as philanthropy strategy in the northeast. Not just New York, but everything from Maine to New York. While I'm here today representing one of New York City's largest private employers and as a funder, I come to this work with over a decade of public service. Most recently having spent the last five and a half years working for the city of New York on workforce development policy and strategy. I not only understand the challenges, but I've been at the forefront codesigning solutions with some of you in the room to help New Yorkers with barriers to employment.

I think we've all heard through the remarks this morning how disproportionately impacting people of color, Black and Brown, immigrant, young adults without a formal education have had with the pandemic and with their employment opportunities. At JPMorgan Chase, we're invested in ensuring that there's an equitable economic recovery for all New Yorkers, and we're bringing the full force of our firm's expertise and resources. That doesn't just include money, it includes the work we do in policy and research and capacity building to support organizations on the ground.

In line with our \$30 billion racial equity commitment to support economic opportunity for Black, Latino and Latina communities in New York, we're prioritizing initiatives that support transversal skills development and support people of color to have the skills they need to success in a changing economy.

This include sector-specific investments in tech and tech-enabled jobs for New Yorkers that are pursuing careers in, as programmers, as coders, as customer success and operations associates, but also thinking ahead of how we're building and seeding investments to support career pathway opportunities and clean energy and clean tech.

Everything we do has a through line of ensuring that we're supporting equity and mobility for people of color. I believe that we're all here today with similar motivations. We want to better understand the workforce landscape. We want to understand how we can better support the ecosystem, and more importantly, how do we better collaborate. Things that you've heard Greg talk about in his

speech.

As I wrap up, I'll leave you, and hope that you take away from the presentations and panel discussions today, an opportunity to think collectively of how we can work together to advance equity, and also opportunities for job seekers in New York. We realize we can't do it alone. We need employers working with training providers, working with government, working with employment, employers, employment agencies.

And I hope that we all find opportunities to connect and network today and connect and network together. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: One more round of applause because the sponsors make all the difference in the world.

[Applause]

I told you we've got a stacked deck. Here it comes panel number one. I have the pleasure of introducing our first panel of the day. The city's economic the recovery and future of workers. Please join me in welcoming Louisiana, university associate provost of careers and industry partnerships at CUNY, Katy Gaul-Stigge the president of goodwill industries, Lisette Nieves, the president of the fund for city of New York. Abby Jo Sigal the director of mayor's office of talent and workforce development and Alicia Steinmann all in conversation with Errol Louis. Give folks applause as they come up.

[Applause]

>> Errol Louis: Good morning. And good morning to everyone watching on the live extreme. We have only a little bit of time so we're going to jump right into it. I know like many of you when you say government or public-private task force, people start to wonder will, is this just a place holder, is this just a way to frame a question, or is this really going to be something that guides and shapes policy.

And that's what I think we all want to know as well. So we're going to get into it.

Let me start by asking each of the panelists to say briefly, we've seen barriers

to entry to different career pathways. That of course is the task at hand. On the other hand we have a very unusual economy, so that many of the ways that we've developed techniques to deal with this may or may not apply in the age of work-from-home, or as we recover from the pandemic.

And would love to get your impressions as to how this task force can best address those issues. Let me start with you, Alysia.

>> Alysia: Sure thanks for having me. When we think about workforce development and the pandemic, we shifted to a hybrid model, right? So we all got used to working in a remote environment quickly. We adapted to Zoom and Teams and I think that gives us a unique opportunity to train and to hire, in many different ways that we didn't think were possible before.

So I'm excited to collaborate and getting more New Yorkers employed. So folks who maybe didn't have the same flexibility of coming to work every day at an office, or maybe folks with disabilities who have challenges, those are the folks that we're collectively targeting and hoping to reengage into the workforce.

>> I'm next. Thank you for having me. It's fantastic to be here. I think we have a real opportunity right now. I've often said the stars are aligned. We've learned a lot from the pandemic we also know a lot as a field. We have a lot of best practice and learn learnings. What we don't have is a system that's truly working for New Yorkers or for employers or for the economy overall. The goal here is to take those learnings from here in New York, from the work that all of you do, and also from around the country and around the world and say okay, we're New York we're going to have the best talent development system of any place and what do we need to do that and that's really the task at hand with this task force and to do so so it's not just one sector, one silo, just the public, just the nonprofit it's all of us together. It's not a single sector organization that's going to get us where we need to be.

I think we're at a good time. We have the state and city in conversations in ways we haven't seen before. We have the federal government that's supportive. So we're ready to go. So I think it's a good time.

>> Errol Louis: We have the voluntary sector as well. Lisette?

>> Yes, hi. We get to baseline what the field is doing already, what are the outcomes? Who do we know programming and standards that happen there and we can do that at a level. But more importantly also say where along the path of workers are there opportunities? Those with disabilities, those who are just out of school. Those who are older workers, right? And I think right now people don't get a sense of the continuum of the kind of sophisticated provider community that's out there. So we can give them a sense of continuity and we can give them baseline and it's really catching up to the field so I'm looking forward to that.

>> Thank you, sorry I had to run out there for a second and get a little water. I'm really looking forward to this people have been asking me what might be different about this task force. And I do think that what I'm looking forward to and what I think is really different is the building. We really have put a lot in place, what we've learned. In the last several years, not just from the pandemic but the work that we called for in the past and the building blocks are there. If we talk about common metrics, if we talk about the work with employers, if we talk about the industry partnerships. We've got a lot of great building blocks that I think this task force can really force forward. And I'm very excited to see the change and what could be different in this particular time.

>> Hi, good morning everyone. Good to see you all. Good to see some familiar faces. And also greetings on behalf of the co-chair of this task force and wishes he could be here and sends his regards.

This past decade and the past three years has seen so much evolution and really accelerated the kind of change that we knew was coming in the long run but had to tackle quickly and that will always be the case when it comes to workforce, when it comes to workers. There will always be change. I come from the tech sector where skills are evolving every single minute, every single year, it's hard to predict

So the thing that will allow us all to success and thrive in serving New Yorkers

and getting into jobs and helps businesses grow is building the muscle to anticipate and adapt to those changes as they come. This was a really interesting couple of years how that would work in accelerating that and this task force is sort of critical for not just information sharing, not just talking about this moment in time, but actually building off the learnings of the past and integrating how we build that muscle for working together so that when big changes happen in the future, which they will, we're ready for them, and we can work together as a system.

>> Errol Louis: Okay. I had a particular question for some of you. And Lisette, timely funding for providers, which I know a lot of people are concerned, it's always an issue. How do we make sure that promising programs don't suffer due to cashflow problems?

>> Lisette Nieves: I wish I could wave that wand too. It's an important question. This is an administration that's been focused on clearing up the backlog but that's a real issue, right? I'm proud to be at the fund because we get to do what we call bridge financing to support organizations to get that done.

But that's a really important part of this ecosystem in a way that it's very sophisticated and reliant on government funds, and we need to figure out a way to move that forward. We've done a lot better. I think there's certain agencies that need a little bit more attention, but there's no question that we're probably the only city that has a bridge financing backup option, and others.

And that actually goes a long way for many of the providers. But contracting in general for anybody in the sector, I guess I'll end on this, one in six employees are in the sector. So when we talk about what does it mean to say what does workforce look like in a braid you had system, we're also talking about everybody that's in this room.

We're talking about what's the talent they need, that they have and get support from. So it's all connected

>> Errol Louis: Right. And Alysia, in keeping with sort of asking about the overall architecture of how to make something like this work, do private sector

firms need sort of a one-stop access? What's the thing that will make sure that we unlock a lot of the potential. We hear, even as there are threats of a recession, there's still a lot of hiring going on, and that we're almost at our pre-pandemic levels.

>> Alysia Steinmann: It's a great question. We are constantly looking for talent. We are excited about hiring New Yorkers. It's just about finding the pathways for them to apply, for themselves to know the opportunities. And what's really exciting about this, and each one of these women is amazing in their own right. But collectively. So taking -- there's a lot of bespoke programs that run very well on their own. But you don't get the power and scale. You don't get the change effect

unless you come together and say let's create a system together that, from soup to nuts, right? So you start with the schools, with the chancellor of the DOE. You have them move through CUNY and then into employment. So it's really about the entire lifecycle of a New Yorker. It's about them starting in the schools, and getting meaningful employment through the whole process.

So working together to create a system that supports businesses more broadly, we always have higher needs, but some does every employee in the city. It's not about EY, it's about the worker and having them gain employment. For us that's working together and taking all the different pieces that already exist, and creating a system-wide change.

>> Errol Louis: And for as Lisette mentioned, there are seniors, there are lower income communities or families that may have had broadband access in the work-from-home era, there are younger workers who may have been out of the ability to sort of understand or learn office procedure firsthand over the last few years. How do we deal with that?

>> So R., there's a lot of opportunity. And I think through the pandemic it showed us, like I mentioned before, we don't need to be in an office to work every day. So where people were limited in their ability to travel and go to an office every day, that works for a lot of people, but it also doesn't work for a lot of

New Yorkers.

And to your point, there's a lot of older New Yorkers that have been out of the workforce they have great skills, but it doesn't match with the hiring needs of employers. So working together and saying, okay, this person has these skills but now, let's see if we can get them skilled in tech, which is obviously the largest growing facet sector.

So let's get them a program where they don't have to go back and get another degree, but we can certify them and get them a certification or training, and then they're qualified to work. So it's getting them back in those programs, re-skilling them, upskilling them and partnering with programs that can do that, that then will feed right into our employment

>> Alison Lands:

>> Errol Louis: To the extent that community colleges are vitally important here, tuition assistance, various programs, they're often geared toward full or part-time students who are pursuing a degree. So that certification, non-degree programming and training, often doesn't have the right support, doesn't have the right culture within any university, even CUNY doesn't have the right administrative backbone to make it happen easily.

How do we deal with that and make sure it doesn't get lost in all of this?

>> Lauren Anderson: I want to get something back it's important to have public officials who have the ability to meet New Yorkers where they are with the kind of skills and education they need. One of the things that was in the governor's budget this past year was tap for workforce credentials. That will be an exciting space. We're still exploring how it might be rolled out in various ways.

But that will take credentials that have proven industry values where students at community colleges can take advantage of those courses that articulate to credit so if they want to continue to a degree program afterward they can and it will provide support that we need for those programs.

In the meantime we couldn't have possibly gotten there without a lot of partners across the ecosystem who have taken time and invested to make sure

those credentials are actually meaningful and actually leading to employment. And that is something where, you know, over the past five years, there's been a lot of change in how much people are willing to work together, to Alysia's point. And that is going to be essential for proving what's possible as we get these new funding streams and scale them

>> Errol Louis: You know, Katy, the putting together of the task force, the surfacing of ideas and strategies is one thing. Building a constituency for it, and having it not just flow out of the administration, but also build support throughout the city, public and private sector, is a task unto itself. How do we and I guess the people who are watching, how do we make that happen?

>> Katy Gaul-Stigge: I'm really excited to be the nonprofit co-chair to represent all of you, so I really do want your feedback as well. This is a great opportunity for me to ask directly. New York City employment and training coalition will help me getting information directly from you for our task force and our five pillars and I would list them but I don't want to miss one.

I think it's really important that we, as a community of over 200 members here and other nonprofits, might not be classically workforce development. Our foster care systems, our -- that comes to mind. Other systems, other nonprofits that are a part of the ecosystem, really that all these voices, because exactly as Errol says, we are the deliverers of this product and we are the ones who are going to be making changes.

We also have to acknowledge that there might be change in behavior like you're asking with EY. For employers, can we still do things the same way as nonprofits, as workforce providers if there are some new pathways, and the answer is going to be no. We all are going to have to make some adjustments ourselves, maybe with a stronger WDB or a different kind of structure. Welcome everybody. We're excited you're here.

So I think that's the big thing is we really -- I really want to hear from you. I really take my role here seriously as the voice of the nonprofits, and I really want to make sure that as implementers, we are the ones that feed the hungry. We

are the ones that house the homeless. We are the ones that find folks jobs. We are the ones that bulldoze those barriers that makes sure somebody's got wifi at home, make sure they have that metro card, make sure they have they have that day care.

Those are the things that allow work to happen, that's our muscle, and that's what we do and that's where we need to be supported to do it

>> Errol Louis: Okay. So Abby Jo as the conductor of this orchestra, or one of them, talk about the concept behind the task force, why the different sectors and how, I guess, functionally you're going to take what they bring to the table and turn it into policy?

>> Abby Jo Sigal: We really need representation from across education, nonprofits, unions, the public sector, policy researchers. And we need to bring that brain trust together. A lot of folks said you can't do more than 30. There's over 60 people on the task force.

And again it's not just the folks on the task force, as Katy said. We really want the best practice learnings that you all have to really come up to this work.

The rationale behind it we're at the beginning of administration, we can really lay out a blueprint for what we want to do differently so we have a system that's designed for the outcomes we want, not the outcomes we currently get. So it's really to set the stage for the infrastructure that's needed to -- as Lauren said, we can build the muscle to work together across these different sectors, to address realtime challenges.

So if we're not serving a particular population or if something with technology accelerates and has unintended consequences, we can address it. We need to have that infrastructure in place otherwise we're all scrambling and New Yorkers don't do as well and employers don't thrive.

If you look at executive order 22 that the mayor signed in August it laid out citywide objectives when it came to event and workforce development. Those are the objectives that we all share and we are all aligned in working towards that. Will be critically important if we really want to start tackling the challenges of

unemployment or underemployment or not enough people in living wage jobs here in the city.

In addition to the task force, which is a sprint, it's happening between now and January, it's really laid the foundation, is we also set up an interagency cabinet, which will have chief workforce officers from all of the agencies. As you all well know, this work gets done by multiple agencies in the city, over 20. Probably about 75 different funding streams with different requirements, whether it's federal, state, or local.

So the idea with the cabinet is that we can bring together all of those entrepreneurs within the city who are doing incredible work within their agencies to come together to say we too are trying to achieve these objects. We know we need to do it in partnership with each other, and also in partnership with employers and nonprofits and other providers that we work with. How do we do a better job?

The idea again is to really have this task force develop a blueprint, a working document that sets the stage working with the cabinet to implement that over the course of the administration and to come out of this task force with a set of -- with infrastructure that's clear how we work together going forward. That's how we've set up the working group or pillars as Katy discuss used

>> Errol Louis: I know it may feel a little premature. Sort of like while you're building the scaffolding to ask about what color the penthouse room is going to be. But what are some of the metrics that you think are going to count? What do you think when the architecture of it is built out and we go into next year and something or other is asked for in the city budget, and it's all starting to hum.

What do you think are the numbers or the metrics or the indicators that will -- that you'll be watching?

>> Abby Jo Sigal: This is always a tricky question. There's been a lot of focus on what are the programmatic outcomes and end of the day that's really what matters. How many New Yorkers are employed in living-wage jobs. How many young people are launching into full filling economically secure careers. Making

sure we are looking at it and addressing any historic disparities when it comes to people of color or seniors or people with disabilities. Those are super important. So understanding what those are, and also understanding what programmatic measures ladder up to that. So what I think we need to be looking at are what are the institutional metrics. And we have a working group that's focused on that. What are the institutional metrics we need to measure to show that we're changing?

So for instance one of the things we look at is looking at CUNY, for example. Looking at their degree programs, how many of their degree programs are really incorporating learning from work into those degree programs? Because we know on-the-job training and learning from work is a really good way of connecting into the labor market.

Because in addition to gaining the skills in realtime in the place that you're working, you're also building those professional networks that are often so key. So part of the task force in one of the working groups is how do we measure impact on that.

Additionally from the task force another key piece is looking at -- focusing on critical occupations and skills. So this is one of the things that I hope we'll be able to, as a community have, is really agree that occupations are going to be the organizing unit. So we often talk about sectors, which is super important. Because that shows what's growing, what's shrinking, where the opportunity is, particularly where the jobs are that have economic mobility.

We also often talk about specific skills that are needed. I would say sectors are sort of too big and skills are too small. So the Goldilocks are there occupations and the bundle of skills that are related to them. If we can be very clear as a city, what are the occupations that are powering the city, that are powering the economy. And then really understand of those occupations, which ones are -- which ones are -- jobs for the future use is the framework, which ones are static.

Which ones are not getting you to a living wage job? Which ones are spring

board job. Maybe day one it's not a living wage but it's a pathway to get you there. And what are the lifetime jobs. So we have an understanding about the jobs that are powering our economy and which ones we need to move from static to springboard or lifetime.

And looking at those that create economic mobility and make sure we're using that to think about how do we expand apprenticeships in those occupations, because we know that works. How do we expand -- make sure we have enough talent developers, whether it's all of you folks in the nonprofit field, all of the folks at CUNY and other educational institutions. How do we make sure we're getting New Yorkers from those -- into those promising occupations.

Because we're a big city, so we can't all get around the table. We need to have some sort of organizing unit. So that's an example of if we can show that's how we're doing it, we can start building their infrastructure around it, so we can make progress on those bigger objectives and numbers

>> Errol Louis: And that is really, really hard. I'll put this out really for the whole panel. How often, how frequently do we have to have that conversation and make adjustments? Because a lot flows from a decision if you decide -- I'm making this up, but data entry is the occupation where you want to sort of put some effort, just like General Motors when they decide they want to build a new car it takes them a couple of years to train people and build and factor and inform and educate the dealer network around on and on and on.

>> Can I quickly answer that? I think one of the other things that we're looking at is how to expand on-the-job training and sort of apprenticeship, both registered and lowercase A apprenticeship. Because fundamentally the more we can have learning that's happening at work, that's paid and is also credentialed and helps folks get the credentials that they need from employers, the more efficient our system will be so we can respond in realtime to changes in the labor market, as well as those particular jobs. Because otherwise it takes -- by the time employers, which sometimes they're great and they figure out what are those skills that are needed and they tell the educational

institutions the education institutions figure out how to credentials and two or three years later. And the challenge is things happen with that.

>> Errol Louis: That is the challenge. How do we make that happen?

>> I would say as the employer side, it's up to us to community with the CUNY and with the task force. Where are our needs right now? Where are our skills that folks that are gaps. But also looking ahead. What roles in five years am I going to need that I need to adapt now? So we've worked with CUNY over the last year at EY and created a program with the jobs council doing just exactly that.

We have a software engineering degree, associate's degree that we created with the school. So we sat with the deans, with the professors and said let's go over your curriculum. Here's the skills that we are looking for, how do we incorporate this into your curriculum, number one.

And number two is how do we have them come to EY for a set number of works and get credit in lieu of sitting in a classroom. Hands-on, they're learning, they're getting credit, they're getting paid. Because that isn't realtime skills that are needed. We need to go a step further and say what skills am I going to need in five years, 10 years, that I can start working with the CUNYs and the other schools and say let's get that baked into the curriculum now, so that way the workforce is ready in 5 and 10 years

>> If I could just build on that, because I completely agree with everything you just said. The other thing too is, if tomorrow the hundreds of thousands of businesses in New York City suddenly turn to all of our organizations and said we want to build these things with you, we would need a lot more capacity in the field to be able to tackle that. So what is really I think helpful about this task force is that it is not just thinking about what training should we launch today or in three years, it's thinking about what is the entire underpinning of this operation that should happen and happen soon for us to be able to see involve when everyone comes to the door to be able to do this work.

That is an important piece, and it's something where as all of you know,

systems change, whether or not we're meeting that and setting it up it's hard to measure. But that's why we all have to do this together, which is why it's really reassuring that we're all up here together and with some of the other folks thinking through it

>> Lisette Nieves: I think we actually use a complicated system to avoid this transparency. This is the challenge. What are the transparent funds we have. When Abby speaks and said she's going to have every commissioner -- that's radical.

We sit down and we have the comptroller and the mayor looking at a back log of contracts. That's radical. This actually means there's a level of accountability because more eyes are on it saying we are not going to let it stay complicated and invisible. We need it to be transparent. This is a system that requires it as a whole.

What do I mean by that? For example we know there are a couple of things we could do right away. We know SYP works. We know getting young people engaged early works. We also know there's a whole population particularly women of color who are underemployed. They have stayed in wages and jobs that are below their credential and how do we think about that?

We know there are folks from the pandemic who have lost jobs who are over 50 that we need to reintegrate. We know both can be true. We have both the lowest unemployment rate, but we have a high invisibility rate of those who are underemployed and those who are not being tracked. So that's what this allows for as transparency across all of that.

>> Errol Louis: Lisette, just to push that a little bit further, do we need different kinds of metrics to sort of gauge whether or not all of this is working?

>> Lisette Nieves: Yeah, I think we just need to be transparent with the metrics. I think there are. It's going to be tough for the field too. Let me not make this a romantic notion, right? I've been a provider as well. This is a hard one as well too. It's like okay I'm doing really great at the inputs, now I've got to deal with the outcomes.

I work with all populations but I'm really gifted in working with this population. I do think barring metrics are really important but I think it's time for agencies to say we're both paying providers different rates for work what are we doing here, right? That outcome we can't secure, but this is part of the transparency piece. Which is we have a lot of skilled navigators on both sides who have worked well in a complicated system. But it hasn't been inclusive. So what does that mean to open that up? And there's going to be some difficulties in that. But in the end, the barb for what we mean is going to make a difference. Because it will be this is what we mean when we say where we can place them

>> Errol Louis: In our last few moments, Katy, I would love everyone to touch on when we meet again in six months how we'll know we are succeeding, what kind of numbers or outcomes or mood even if that's what it is will have changed by then.

>> Katy Gaul-Stigge: I just want to echo some of these thoughts and put a finer point on some of them, which is I believe in the power of government as a catalyst for us. The funders, the foundations, the corporations that fund us. The individual donors that give all these nonprofits money. They are asking the same question. What is the outcome, what are the measurements.

And we have to also, you know, hold everyone accountable for paying our own staff more. One of the measures that I would like to see in six months is that both these contracts pay the same rates as well as pay our own teams what they -- the same living wage and the same kind of work that we're saying that we want for everyone else.

What I always say these are the neighbors, friends, and cousins of clients. Our DSPs, our caseworkers, our line staff. So we really need to make sure that that is in the conversation. That's just one thing I would like to see in section months.

I think the -- six months.

The other thing overall I would like to see that infrastructure that Lauren talked about and Abby talked about where people are understanding what would it be

like to work together in this infrastructure rather than this one program is being released. That's the big change. It's not like big shiny program is released, yay. But we have an infrastructure and the way to work together.

And that is not measurable but I think would really change the dynamic.

>> Errol Louis: Alysia?

>> Alysia Steinmann: Sure. I think for me it's working together and holding each other accountable. So for me in six months if Lauren says to me, Alysia, as the employer you need to do better, we need to hire more, I appreciate that. So the transparency that Lisette talked about, but also holding each other accountable. We each have very important roles, and we're only going to be successful if we hold each other to the same standards.

>> Errol Louis. . Okay.

>> Lauren Andersen: I mean yes to all of that. And I think six months from now we will want a slate of recommendations that are reflective of things that are not just superficial and high level, but deep, and reflect deep challenges that are going to be hard to fix.

I think there is an opportunity now with so much buy-in and so much collective willingness to have team work, to actually put into what is produced by this task force, not just scaling up of a couple of superficial things, but a combination of here are the things we can do tomorrow that will make a big change and here are the deep things that we have to work on together. I think that will be big.

>> Errol Louis: That brings us to the end of our time. Please join me in thanking our panel for a really great discussion.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: One more round of applause, everyone!

[Applause]

So that's the way we kick things off. How was that?

Our second panel begins now implementing a vision for a stronger workforce system. I have the pleasure of introducing to you our next panel. Please join

me in welcoming Jill Berry first deputy commissioner for the New York City department of social services, Je'Nean Jones-Seo, Cecilia Kushner, the chief strategy officer at New York City economic development corporation, Denice Williams, deputy commissioner for the department of youth and community development and our conversation will be hosted by Nicole Hong of the New York Times. Please give this panel a round of applause to open our time together. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> Nicole Hong: Hi, everyone. Thank you all to our panelists for coming today. Let's dive right in, like we want to talk specifics today on this panel, of how each agency is going to implement the vision that the Mayor set out in his blueprint earlier this year. The workforce section of that focused on connecting New Yorkers to quality jobs and in-demand skills.

And I want to just start by kind of going down the line and just talking about how do you interpret this blueprint and what role do you see your agency playing in it? Why don't we start with Denice?

>> Denice Williams: I always think about the immediate next steps. I love vision, but if I'm not making moves, nothing is happening. So how many of you know SYP? Worked in SYP? Okay. So everyone knows SYP. Most of us don't know that we fund other workforce programs within our workforce connect systems. So immediately for us, we began thinking about how are we making better connections within DYCD.

Before I think about CUNY and all those others, how are we making sure that young people who have a 6-week experience know about other opportunities, is one of the first things. How do I make sure, and we run the youth homelessness system in New York City. We don't automatically connect the young people who are in our drop-in centers or other or tills with our workforce connect system.

So we have to do a better job internally of making those things happen. We call them service integration, as well as building on relationships that I hope to talk about later, that we have with CUNY and ways that we are thinking about

supporting their building out credentials and articulation to, from our capacity building, to credit-bearing, so that there are multiple pathways to have career opportunities in New York City.

>> Good morning everyone. I work for the economic development corporation. We're not per se a workforce agency, but the way this work translates for us is we really look at industries of the future. Many of them are based on innovation, but where we think there's going to be an enormous amount of jobs created over the next decade, tech being the one in the last 15 years we focused on.

And what we've realized is often we did not look at workforce and education and opportunities for all New Yorkers to pipeline into these jobs like at the very beginning of investing of an industry, we missed a big opportunity. So, for example, this morning one thing that came out of blueprints, the Mayor right now I'm sad to miss it but excited he's going to be here, he's announced a large project in Brookdale kips bay just 10 blocks away from here is the epicenter of life science and bioengineering in the biotech industry in New York City, which is an industry that has been growing tremendously over the next 10 years throughout the nation and that will continue. We want to make sure that New York City captures a number of jobs there. But we haven't seen good connection between students going up in the DOE and going into CUNY to be able to access these jobs.

And these are real economic mobility occupations that allow really good wages, even with a 2-year degree.

And so what we're really doing is creating a very strong connection and pipeline in an integrated campus that will have industry with life science employers, internships, DOE students, CUNY students, bringing four different schools and four different programs for CUNY that are scattered throughout the entire city into one location.

So really making sure that we're pipelining New Yorkers into future-focused economies. I think the way we are going to be focused as an agency over the next few years.

>> Hi, good morning everyone. So first I wanted to say how great it is to be in the room with so many workforce professionals. In person, right? And so many of you that I've worked alongside within my career over the last 10 years. Please, I can't wait to get out there, come see me, can't wait to hug people.

But the second thing I say is the obvious. The last four years have been absolutely devastating for all of us. And I think if there's any silver lining, it is that it has illuminated a lot of the inequities that have been embedded within the workforce system.

So what I'm really the most excited about is this administration's commitment to really ensuring that there is a more equitable economic recovery, and we're really doubling down on SBS. That really means expanding and increasing the services that we offer to targeted populations. Many of the times it's women, racial minorities, people with disabilities, justice-involved.

Far too many people that have been left out, and I see this as a really great opportunity for us to really step up and be really innovative in terms of the way we service people, and not just connecting them to jobs. Really offering them the wrap-around services and support that they deserve.

In addition to that, we have some really great and cool innovative partnerships that we're going to be having, not only with city agencies, but with partners really all across New York City. So we're really excited about that and really deepening our knowledge and commitment.

>> Jill Berry: Good morning, everybody. So we're very excited that we were a recipient of an \$18 million grant from the U.S. Economic Development Administration under the good jobs challenge program for our pink pathways to industrial and construction careers.

So pink, we've designed pink in a way to give access to our clients, cash assistance, SNAP clients, as well as public housing recipients, access to good well-paying jobs, often union jobs in the transportation and construction sectors. Places that our Black and Brown women have not traditionally had access to these jobs. And we've designed this program in such a way that our clients, they

don't have time for a 6-9-month training program.

They want to get back to work. They don't have the patience to sit through those programs. And so many of the training programs that our clients go to, they have these unforgiving attendance requirements and again our clients can't do that without a lot of support. Again during the pandemic we had a lot of opportunity to try out new things. And one of the programs we sent a bunch of women actually from a homeless shelter to a masonry training program. And with the support of the shelter provider, the workforce provider, and a business link program, as well as the training partner, almost all of those women graduated from that program. Something we don't see. So we're designing -- [Applause] thank you.

So pink, we're going to design more of these training programs that are short-term, get people to good, well-paying jobs, often union jobs right away. And give them all of the wrap-around will supports that they need to be successful in these training programs and keep the jobs once they get placed.

>> Nicole Hong: Yeah. So against the backdrop of this new blueprint is also the fact that the city is facing this looming fiscal crisis, agencies have been asked to cut back their budgets. So in light of that, I was wondering if each of you could also talk specifically about how this could change your current programming in your contracts, like what changes might we expect? Denice?

>> Denice Williams: So as I understand it, and the Mayor has professed this everywhere when speaking, he doesn't want service delivery cuts. And so he's trying to hold that harmless, which is pretty hard at DYCD. We're a contracting agency. So like 96% of our budget goes out the door but that is his commitment.

I think we are working on like six or seven concept papers and new requests for proposals. I'm wondering about the impact going forward. I don't see an immediate cut to service, and a lots of you are service providers. That is my understanding. I watch every town hall he goes to, because he's asked about this. So I like to hear it for myself. That's our understanding.

That is what we put forward is to maintain the service delivery. I am thinking about what will happen, as we're all thinking about how to refine what we do, right? How to embed mental health support. How to go from a few slots in work, learn, and grow, to the 70,000 young people who have been part of SYP to have a realistic year-round experience.

So all of the expansive ideas are the things I think we're going to have to grapple with. As a community going forward. But right now it's about, for me, thinking about with the money we have, when it's stable and I think it will be, how do we do better and how do we make the connective tissue better. I'm not saying do more with less. I personally hate that phrase. We should ban it from our vernacular.

But doing our best with what we have, to make the case for what we're doing. And that it is economic and vital to the city. That makes sense in this room. I don't think many human service providers speak the language of how we're employers.

I don't think we say that, if you're in a homeless shelter, and you're a provider or aid service provider. We are employers. Just as much as we deliver human services. And we need to better be able to speak that language about how many we employ. We're often the first employers for many of the communities we care about. We often create these career pathways.

So one thing I encourage all of us to do is to be able to speak, not just service delivery, but economic impact. Wherever you sit in the human service system. But from what he has said, and I take him at his word, has been honest and direct and forthright, even when we don't want to hear it. He is trying to hold service, human services, harmless.

>> Cecilia Kushner: A lot of what we're looking at is every single dollar we spent is an opportunity for workforce and pipelining. DC is a very large capital agency. We have a \$9 billion capital program and we have one of the strongest NWB program in the entire city, with about 40% of reach. So we're trying to make sure internally that every single time we spend on anything, we are able to also

use this as a potential for workforce.

Another way we're doing this, we're a very large asset manager. We have about 66 million square feet of real estate. We do a lot of real estate transaction and real estate development. So we are trying to leverage public lens in order to get private industry dollars into workforce. So if we do a really large life science project, for example, by using public lens to build a new life-sized tour, we are going to require developer to have funds that pays for programming in lifescience and then we can co-direct with them. So we are ensuring that we have a budget outside of the city budget that gives us some sense of stability and security, and also forges partnership between industry and workforce providers. Which I think is really important in order for anything to be very successful.

>> Did Je'Nean Jones-Seo: I don't anticipate we'll have any cuts. We've had great staff not only at SBS but with our vendors as well and they were able to provide services in a very quick and adaptive way that we didn't expect or anticipate. So I wanted to thank you for that.

But also within that there are a lot of learnings in terms of how we could do better. It's more what our focus is going to be as opposed to actual cuts. And I think with illumination of everything that's happened over the last three years, I think it's almost a prime time to really start to be creative and innovative in terms of our service delivery itself.

So I, for us, we're seeing it more as an opportunity to do more in different ways.

>> Jill Berry: For DSS it's going to be a challenge. We have a pretty high cash assistance case load right now. Our workforce mandates the population and we're looking at over 80,000 people that we're going to have to try to engage, give them the services they need and connect them to jobs.

What we are trying to do is a lot of what Je'Nean said is during the pandemic we had the opportunity to try a lot of things and be a little more flexible and we need to find ways to incorporate that flexibility, incorporate those things that we

learned. And be a little bit more nimble in the future so that we can stretch those dollars to serve people. And not just have a one-size-fits-all model, right? Because some people need more, some people needless. And that's what we're going to be looking at going forward.

>> Nicole Hong: Just to piggyback off of that, Jill, I wonder if you can talk about the Hire NYC program and the lessons learned from the pandemic, and is that something you plan to expand going forward?

>> Jill Berry: That's actually a really great story for our agency. Our business link program runs hire NYC for health and human services contracts. The vendors have to hire one public assistance recipient for every \$250,000 of contract value. And we've been administering that program for a long time. But the really great news, FY22, over 5,000 placements of public assistance recipients into jobs, real jobs.

The highest number we have ever had.

[Applause]

Yeah.

The team did a great job, right? And I think why were we so successful? Why were we so successful during the pandemic? We had people who wanted to work. We have a huge population of people who want to get off cash assistance. They want a job, they want to work. And many employers maybe were more willing to give people a chance, give our clients a chance in this economy, when it's so hard to hire people.

And that's been great. Great opportunities for our clients. And we're really hoping that employers see these are great candidates, they work hard, they want to work, they want to go to work every day. And we want to build on that success. And we hope to keep those numbers up.

>> Nicole Hong: And yeah, Denice, turning to you specifically about SYP. So the Mayor has announced this huge expansion in the size of that program. So I was wondering if you could talk about, you know, in terms of actually scaling that up, what does that look like? What do you need to see what the service

providers for that to happen?

>> Denice Williams: Well, I don't think it's just the service providers. I think critical to us all meeting the target this year was having that commitment of funding early up. If you've been in the field a long time, you know we often get the city council money announced in all these extra slots on July 1st when the program starts July 5th. Trust me, we don't like it either.

That the Mayor committed to it early was very important to us all from a planning quality experience point of view. I do think -- I think we have 65 providers in the portfolio. I think if we all -- we talk about expanding or doubling SYP. We're going to have to expand the number of providers in the portfolio. We go around saying can you take an extra hundred, can you take an extra 200, there's going to be a limit to that.

So in addition to investing in the health of our current portfolio providers, not just in SYP, but across the board, we're going have to look at the sector and how do we expand the health of the sector through investments, but also capacity building.

I think we've hit our limit. I remember one time we had funding from Wallace and they said to us if you had all the money you wanted for after school, could you use it effectively and the answer was no. Because we didn't have sufficient system capacity. So I'm not talking about any one organization. But we need to expand the system. Because we've gotten a lot of money in human services under the last two administrations.

Which means we need more partners, and healthy partners, to be able to use the money well.

>> Nicole Hong: Yeah. Je'Nean, talk a little about lessons learned from operating workforce one centers during the pandemic. You mentioned some of these new partnerships you were thinking about new wraparound services. Just going beyond job placement. How do you see the kind of relationship with service providers on the actual training and upskilling front?

>> Je'Nean Jones-Seo: Yeah. Like I mentioned before the one thing we know

is that communities have absolutely been devastated. And I think one of the hardest things is people just don't even know we exist, period. Workforce one is there. So one of the things we're looking to do is really to bring services to where the people are, to make sure that we're better serving them.

But we really have to serve them more holistically. And that means strengthening our partnerships. So it's something that we've done in the past, but we're really doubling down on that effort. So we're increasing our staff capacity for community partners specifically. And that's really our staff that's going on to communities, they're partnering with organizations all across New York City, not only to tell them about the opportunities or the trainings that we have, but to get a better sense and idea of what services are available as well, so we can really figure out how do we best leverage each other. Because it's not just this is what I do, this is what you do, let's hope it works out. It's really figuring out where that connection should and could be made, to ensure that there's really a service level -- a service level that's provided to a job seeker that seems seamless. And it doesn't seem that you're bouncing from one door to the next where people are going to get lost. So we're really being targeted and focused and making sure that we're connecting with more organizations, particularly within the regions or the geographic areas that have been most devastated.

>> Nicole Hong: Cecilia, you mentioned kind of lessons learned from expanding the tech sector here, and kind of these new jobs of the future, making sure that they're accessible to a wider pool of New Yorkers. And I'm curious to sort of what metrics you're planning to use to kind of measure that success and sort of hold the programs accountable.

>> Cecilia Kushner: I think the first metrics citywide that we're continuously keeping tabs on how is the economy growing, what type of industry is actually growing in New York City, what's our competitive advantage to try to get the biggest share of the industries we can here.

And then we do population diversity analysis. Which is like what is the

makeup of workforce in these industries and what is the makeup of ownership in these industries. And then we found where we can be the most useful, where our dollars actually carry the most impact, is really to focus on population-specific workforce program. And also diverse ownership programs.

For example, right now we have a venture fellow program, which is going to take a hundred new entrepreneurs in the tech business, all women or people -- or BIPOC entrepreneurs who we've seen have a really hard time really entering into that field, even though it's an enormous field and one where people have been able to be extremely successful financially.

And just throughout an entire year-long program, bring them to a place where they can go to venture capitalists and actually raise funding and get on their own two feet and to be able to be successful in that world. Really targeting our dollars into specific population to specific outcome of ownership and ability to stay in an occupation and build wealth over the long term for individual and family is how we're beginning to look at success for us.

>> Nicole Hong: So unfortunately we're at the end of our time. I know we could talk about this for hours. But yeah, thank you again to all of our panelists.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: How are we doing so far? Give ourselves a round of applause for heaven's sakes! By the way, by the way if I may, it's great to see -- it's great to be in a room with so many New Yorkers. It's been a long time. I hope you are feeling comfortable and confident today. And shout-out to the CUNY Graduate Center. This is a fantastic space. They've been very warm and very inviting and wonderful to us. We genuinely appreciate that.

We're going to allow for a 2-minute stretch break, catch your breath. If you get up, we're going to keep rolling because we're already behind schedule, and we do have confirmation, the confirmation is here, the Mayor is on his way. And I know you don't want to miss a moment of that. So take a 2-minute stretch break for yourself. We'll start in 2. And head on to the solution set and our

elected official panel. Thank you.

Here's your 1-minute warning.

If I could ask you to take your seats. Would love your attention. As we begin offering solutions -- once again if I could have your attention, find your seats. Thank you so much. So just by virtue of where we are, we're bouncing around a little in the agenda for timing purposes but everyone will have their place and we'll make it work. We are now sort of transitioning to the place in the agenda where we start talking about solutions, things that are working, things to be thinking about, action steps. Following that we have some council members, and then the mayor is going to join us as well. For this particular segment I would love for you to welcome Esta Bigler the director of Cornell university's labor and employment law program that is a fantastic title and the co-chair of the Cannabis Workforce Initiative in a talk on the promise of good jobs and social equity in New York's cannabis industry.

This is an important topic and a critical one to talk about it. So do me a favor, give her a round of applause and the floor is hers.

[Applause]

>> Esta Bigler: Thank you everyone. Good morning. I am absolutely thrilled to be here. As he said my name is Esta Bigler, I'm from the IRL school of Cornell and I'm from the New York City office. Not everybody is in Ithaca. So please remember that we're right here. I'm a born and bred New Yorker, serving New York City. As indicated I am the co-chair of the cannabis workforce initiative. My co-chair is the Amy the exclusive director of the workers force development institute, a statewide organization focused on growing and keeping good jobs in New York. Several of my WDI colleagues are here, so please make sure to stop and have a chat with them to learn more what WDI does. WDI has a regional director in every section of our state, including New York City.

So please make time to talk to Lisa Fudderman the New York person.

Cornell ILR is an educational institution. So what are we doing with

cannabis? We study the workplace. We study work, employment, and labor. And our purpose is to improve the workplace, and to inform policymakers on changes that need to be made.

We like to say we are the preeminent school doing research on the workplace, and providing educational and training programs to practitioners.

So Cornell and WDI together, we founded sub-UDI. Our mission is to promote quality workforce development and legal education.

With the passage of MRTA in 2021 which legalized adult use -- let's see if I can get that up for you guys. It legalizes adult use, regulates production, distribution from seed to sale, labor peace agreements, making it easier for unioning to organize. It amended the labor law which involves adult use,

And making sure that people are not discriminated against because they use it, as well as the really important social equity responsibilities here. 50% of the adult use licenses, the goal is to social equity applicants and people discriminated against by the criminal legal system have more economic opportunities.

So so with the passage in 2021, we had the opportunity and a con nun drum of creating a totally new industry from scratch. An industry that has the possibility of bringing 30,000 to 50,000 new jobs to our state. The economic impact on New York will be tremendous. The belief is that it will be measured in billions, not millions.

And many people believe that New York City will actually be the country's largest cannabis market 6789 so there's much potential here to grow good jobs. To generate income in communities of color, those most harmed by the criminalization of cannabis, and create generational wealth.

Our collective challenge together is to provide workforce education to meet the needs of this new industry. Let me step back for a moment, because we are all functioning in a legal twilight zone. We really are. Cannabis is legal here, and in many other states. However, it is not legal in the United States and under federal law.

The cannabis, the Controlled Substance Act of 1970 is alive and well with us. And that act says that cannabis is a Schedule 1 substance. It is the same as heroin. And the act says that it has no social or medical redeeming values. Notwithstanding that we know, under the Compassionate Care Act of 2014 that medical marijuana is really important to many, many people in our state.

So it's a felony to sell it, to possess it, to encourage its use. That's the twilight zone. Banks, credit unions, you can't use a credit card to buy it, won't touch anything that comes from cannabis.

Government agencies that receive federal money, universities, anyone who receives federal money, including parts of our government, put themselves at risk. We can lose contracts, grant money, federal student loans, and federal scholarships.

So while I don't believe anybody is coming to get me with handcuffs, don't believe that. However, we all have to be aware of federal law, and in the work that I do, I can't touch the plant, and I can't teach anybody else in touching the plant.

We know that New York State's DOL is working hard to meet the needs of this new industry. But traditional federally funded workforce programs, like registered apprentice programs, which earlier were mentioned really as the gold standard, you earn while you learn, cannot happen in our state, until there is a change in federal law.

So we needed to come up with a new approach at CWI. Our first step in developing our program was to conduct a national survey. A workforce needs analysis. I'm a university, we have to do a study.

With responses from cannabis employers, in 50 states, and Canada, a majority of which do operate in New York or plan to operate in New York. And please be aware, social equity employment is important. Social equity licensees are important. But there are big, multistate operators waiting to come into our state. The big guys are waiting to come. Because they see the dollar signs.

We learned from our survey that there's a high demand for education and

training resources that workers need, and employers need as well. Targeted workforce development programs, boosting awareness of cannabis job opportunities, and specialized training that involves the legal rights of people who work in this industry, and justice-involved job seekers are critical for opening up pathways to good-paying jobs that are not just entry-level jobs, but where you can indeed have a career. We augmented our survey with what was happening in other states. We interviewed industry, union, community, and educational representatives. We wanted to hear directly from the boots on the ground.

While business owners are seeking a wide group of workers for this new industry, our results show that hiring will be concentrated at the beginning in direct sales, retail dispensaries, which, by the way, leaving aside the cultivation licenses which are issued by the office of cannabis management, which is a state agency, which is regulating this new law, and growing and cultivation.

In addition, survey results indicated specific skills and knowledge is necessary. Plant knowledge. Understanding the different strains. The ability to describe and recommend products for specific needs. One size doesn't fit all when you go into a dispensary. Cultivation and processing and extraction information. And understanding the regulations and the compliance issues which are many and will continue to grow.

In addition we learned that in addition to these cannabis-specific skills, there is a demand for more general, what you and I would call soft skills. Customer service experience, professionalism, leadership, good communication skills, reliability, and ability to remain calm. In situations which could indeed be not so easy to work in.

In furtherance of MRTA's goals, job seekers with criminal records, something that's very close to my heart, need training to understand their legal employment rights, and be equipped with the knowledge of opportunities in this industry.

To meet the workforce needs in this new industry, and open doors to communities hardest hit by the war on drugs. We developed a pre-employment

certificate program. With a curriculum we believe serves the overall introduction of job seekers to the cannabis industry.

We want this program to meet what I would call my students, and but I would also call job seekers, where they are at the moment.

Think of this as a pre-apprenticeship program, or a program that gives job seekers the knowledge they need for entry level job interviews, to get those entry level jobs, and to further education and training. Our work is funded by a state budget appropriation.

We are able to offer this program free of charge to participants and to community colleges, 4-year colleges, community-based organizations, and you, workforce development organizations and of course the city of New York government. Participants completing a certificate will come away with a general understanding of the cannabis market, processes from seed to sale.

The jobs available throughout the industry and the worker protections, which to me as a labor and employment lawyer, and a recovering union lawyer, are very important. The job protections offered by labor and employment laws, of which I can talk about for hours, and what the New York's marijuana regulation and tax action act provides as well. It's an introductory program.

It's not meant to replace a more skills-intensive program.

In brief, our curriculum includes the history of cannabis laws, how they changed, and the impact of these laws.

Everyone in this industry needs to know about the cannabis regulations. OCM is rolling them out. They're rolling them out so we'll be constantly updating our curriculum with respect to cannabis:

The problems with the banks, which I just mentioned, cannabis from seed to sale, the science of cannabis, the plant, medical versus adult use, health and safety, and there are going to be major compliance and security issues as well. Especially because it's an all-cash business. You want to make sure, since employers indicated that often people don't know the opportunities in this field, that we give them a job exploration piece to this curriculum.

So what are the cultivation opportunities? What about extraction? What about -- I mentioned a minute ago -- retail? Or ancillary industries? Manufacturing, imagining, et cetera. This is an industry that's going to start here and just keep going. And my hope is that this provides the floor.

So people can move up as the industry matures and grows as well.

Not to leave my piece out, we're certainly going to talk about workplace safety laws. I believe it don't matter if there's a law in the books. If you don't know you have rights, you can't enforce those rights. You don't have those rights. So of course we'll be teaching everything from wage-an-hour law to health and safety, equal employment law. Everybody in this room knows sexual harassment and hostile work environment is alive and well in our economy.

Criminal records and expungement, since MRTA provides for expungement. And what does labor peace agreement mean? What kind of rights does it give workers, employees and unions as a broad overview.

Our program really is a hybrid. We will have live online training and on-demand video-based construction. Videos training will be placed on our website for people to review at their own pace. Maybe two or three times, if it's something that takes a little longer to learn:

On our website CWY.org. We believe that offering the full certificate is a benefit to participants. But the curriculum is designed as a series of separate modules that can be repositioned and repurposed where appropriate. For example, if you have a training, and you don't need what we have to offer, except there is a specific module that you could use to fill in a gap, to provide supplemental education.

Or perhaps you just need to use part of our curriculum as a guest speaker. We're there to do that. It can serve as an introduction to recruiting students to workforce development programs in this area, or is perhaps help them to decide which program or job training to pursue.

As an aside, it's not in my notes. As an aside, I'm chair of the New York State Training and Apprenticeship Council. The number of people who call me up and

say I want a job in construction and I say, okay, do you want to be an electrician? Do you want to be a carpenter? Do you want to be an iron worker? And they say I don't know. They don't know what those jobs entail.

This program will provide people with what the jobs entail, so they know their own strengths and weaknesses, perhaps, and they can pick the right place.

So the program is made to be multi-purposed and to serve as many constituencies as possible.

I agreed to come today to speak, because we want to partner with you. The workforce development community. This is not just for us. There's no point for us to hold this close to the vest and say no, it's our program. No. We want to partner with you, as well as with community-based organizations, community colleges, 4-year colleges, the City of New York. Any organization that wants to partner with us in furtherance of our social equity goals and commitment, we want to partner with. So that's why I came. Because this is an audience that shares the same goals that we have.

We can do programs together. We can provide you with training materials. For use that fits into your training model. Our mission is to share what we've developed, and work with you to provide a pathway to good family sustaining jobs in cannabis. Especially for those who have been injured on on the war on drugs.

A quick don't before I say good-bye. We can reimagine this program for employers, who need to have some of the same education. Especially social equity employers. Who are coming from the community, MBEs, WBEs, service injured veterans, indigenous people. We can help them be able to be successful. And we want to work with employers to help them hire and identify people who have been injured by the criminal legal system, so that they, too, can get jobs. Whether it's in this industry frankly or any industry. It is a group of people with skills, knowledge, and intelligence.

So in closing, I want to thank you for inviting us. I know that I, the CWY team, my Cornell colleagues, all of us. We look forward to working together with you,

to building a new industry, one that makes sense. And one that lifts all boats, not just the select few. Thank you very much.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: One more round of applause. Thank you very much.

Critical topic an important moment in our city's history.

We are moving on to our conversation with city council leaders. I have the pleasure of introducing the next panel in that regard. Please welcomed Gale Brewer and Amanda Farias our city council members in conversation with Brian Pascus with Crain's New York Business. These are true champions, people's champs. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> Brian Pascus: Hello, everyone. Thank you for joining us. Thank you, councilmembers.

So let's get into it. If we could, could you generally give us the details of how the city council is promoting job growth and access to opportunity in the wake of the pandemic, and specifically how is the council promoting an inclusive economic recovery that preaches those individuals and communities that have historically been locked out of opportunity? Councilwoman Brewer?

>> Gale Brewer: Thank you very much. With Councilmember Farias I want to talk about a hearing we did which addresses this. While we're making communities inclusive, making for for instance in my case I'm very concerned about the nonprofit sector maintaining and hiring. The city of New York, this is what our hearing was about, is way down on maintaining staff and making sure that they hire staff.

And that's what I think has to be addressed. Because, in order for affordable housing to be built, that to me is our number one issue, you have to have people at HBD who are in the low income tax credit office or other offices. In order for the day care center to open, you have to have a fire inspector show up on a timely basis.

So we had a hearing without getting into all the specifics, in in our briefing

paper. There's very few, because of the salary issues, and Mr. Mayor I understand I will be honest we understand you want everybody back at work but if you don't have flexibility on virtual, I'm afraid people are not going to come work for the City of New York.

>> Brian Pascus: Councilwoman Farias do you want to talk about the economic recovery and those specifics?

>> Amanda Farias: Budget tearily we've been hyperfocused on finding ways to support nonprofit organizations and different opportunities and initiatives that we have in our local government where we can best utilize putting people into the pipeline creation that we desperately need to ensure that our workplaces are hiring people that look like our communities, that are reflective of our communities, and also are as inclusive as possible.

I think two examples policy-wise, outside of the oversight that Councilmember Brewer and I have been doing, intro 179A passed, it's a bill that requires more and nontraditional careers in an industry, how logging of that, so we can say who's hiring that workforce, where are they being placed, where there's dearth of employment. Things like that are critical to making sure that we are looking at our city and being reflective on where we can fill those gaps, or where there's maybe like a lack of interest or appetite in fields that maybe need bolstering and support. Or maybe need some retraining or upskilling to move people into an industry that is either close to those skill sets that those folks have, or emerging in our city.

>> Brian Pascus: Great, thank you. Let's get into some more specifics here though. Mayor Adams initially tried to have a \$98.5 million budget. He's called himself the austerity mayor. We've had a recent report from the state comptroller's office that said by fiscal year 2026 the city could have a \$10 billion deficit. Is the city council prepared to do more with less, and are there going to be funds available to create a sustainable long-term workforce development program?

>> Gale Brewer: We're both on the budget negotiation team. I'm part of the

kitchen cabinet, I'm on finance. This is my second tour of duty on the city council. And I've been on budget negotiation teams for that entire time. I would say two things. In the past, we have also dealt with budget challenges, 2008 I was in the city council. What we don't want to do is increase taxes.

I have to say I know people are thinking that's one way. That's not how I would handle it. I always think, the Mayor talked about the 3% peg that you've heard about. I think as budget negotiation we're going to go through every aspect of the budget. At Department of Education we cannot get the data. Just as an example. They have a 30-some billion dollar budget. DOE, DYCD, HRA, Parks Department. Of course, SBS, et cetera.

There are 21 agencies that deal with workforce development. So the first show, and I know that to the credit of Jose junior is working on this, he's how in the world do you streamline the 21 agencies working on workforce development? Is that makes no sense.

And the second, my jewel is always the City University of New York and the community colleges. Where should the funding go? It should go to CUNY that then would align themselves with the businesses, whether it's tech, lifescience, healthcare, et cetera, the emerging industries. And finally on the nonprofit sector, which we care so much about. Mental health. You hear about it. It's a challenge. They're losing -- they can't hire because the salaries are so low, and they can't maintain because the salaries are so low. So the question is how do you make sure that the alignment of the 21 agencies is stream lined? CUNY is training and the nonprofit sector does some peer-to-peer work. You may not be able to hire MSWs in every case, but you sure as hell can hire peer-to-peer and train them with CUNY or other support mechanisms and make sure that the nonprofit sector and the 21 agencies that are doing workforce development are aligned.

We have got to figure out how to deal with those who need the support the most, and make sure the businesses -- EBC does a great job as an example of a solution. There's a program that takes young people from colleges or grad

school or even high school, and works with them as an internship paid in a business that's emerging.

These kinds of programs are what we're looking for. Those are the solutions.

>> Amanda Farias: Yeah -- just to add on. Round of applause.

I do think that's exactly it. We've seen other cities that have smaller capacities than ours, our municipalities that are doing things career-wise that are taking young people, building public-private partnerships, working with unions, working with municipalities and moving them through a pipeline of internship to apprenticeship model or registered apprenticeship to a job. It's happening in other cities we need to figure out ourselves how we can get a grasp on that.

On the other side of this, we have great partners and at the state and federal level. One of the examples I immediately think about is the hunt's point terminal market in the South Bronx. We have a gap of funding that's necessary. Right now the federal government filled part of that gap with \$110 million. Through the work of people like myself on the ground and others, people that are really pushing where we know there are funds that can be utilized on the ground, in our backyards to bolster up workforce, to bolster up investments in the locality. And I think the more pressure we put on using those state and federal actors, the people around us that can be supportive, the more we can actually fill those gaps and push back a little bit more against austerity.

>> Brian Pascus: Okay, thank you guys. Let's talk about a subject that's on everybody's mind. Rent. The average Manhattan apartment, one-bedroom.

>> It's too damn high.

>> Brian Pascus: You took the words right out of my mouth. A July report found the average one-bedroom rent in Manhattan was \$5100. Street Easy just published a report that found the gap between wages and housing costs is the largest it's been since 2008.

What if anything can the city council do about this, and how can we prioritize job growth for many people who are rent burdened?

>> Amanda Farias: When I hear about job growth and wage disparities, there's

a lot of thing the city council are looking at to lessen that gap. We just passed 179 age which focuses on lessening the wage gap in vocation and trades and we have 143A earlier this year we've kind of in a polite way forced private businesses to say if you're going to hire people in New York City, we're going to make you show the salary ranges, because we know our people deserve to apply and get jobs that are worth their value and their skill set. I do think when we're looking at how we can policy-wise assist in lessening the wage gap, increasing wages, or even just being more transparent in what all of us in this room can apply for or deserve to apply for, it's bills like that, it's policies like that that help do that.

And then I think we really have to look at development in the city and what it means to answer for the housing crisis. And what that means for our communities. Not obviously completely shifting what our communities currently look like, but really being intentional and deliberate on when we're building affordable and how we push for housing that can solve the needs that we have, that we've had for decades past.

Right now in the city.

>> Gale Brewer: Getting the rent down is something we would love to do. But while we're trying to do that, there are three ways at least people could apply for housing. The short numbers that there are. I mentioned that the city needs to have more people at Department of Buildings and HBD and Fire and so on to get these buildings built, number one.

Number two, even applying on this housing connect, you need to be a genius to figure out all of the friggin paperwork. And that needs to be streamlined and changed. And guess who's getting it, people who are more adept at doing that, and those are not necessarily the people who need the housing.

So there is apparently a group of people steamlining that. And at the same time we do need, I know you talked about the budget gap. But the issue is we need more attorneys at legal aid and so on to be able to address anybody who is getting, in my opinion, illegally told that they have to leave their apartments.

At the same time there's a push to have the courts on the state level flow down their process so that the attorneys and the tenants can work together.

And then we have to figure out this real challenge of affordable housing and lack thereof. We know that the asylum are here, and close to 20,000 so far with many more to join us. And we have absolutely no place to put such numbers. Not to mention those who are already in shelters. So the homeless issue is a huge challenge.

I would say developers, with all due respect, could work much more closely with the city in terms of realizing that we have a huge, too expensive a city problem and poverty, and we no longer are building the middle class. So we need a program that exists many years ago that was the best middle class housing program we had. I know that's a state level, and also single room occupancies.

Those were the places where individuals who didn't have a lot of funding but had a solid building with a kinds of support that are needed, supportive housing. Those are not great answers, but that at the very least we should be doing.

>> Brian Pascus: Councilwoman Farias, you're chair of the Economic Development Committee. . It's your specialty. We know we're seeing retirement rates rise, public safety, NYPD, FDNY, but we're also seeing more hiring in the tech sector and the life sciences center. What can we do to stoke the flame of these industries that have room for growth and how do we prepare for the fault lines in the industries that are seeing people retire.

>> Amanda Farias: Thank you for the question this is one of my favorite things to talk about. Chair of the economic development committee for the next 10 months so expertise is we're going to be nice. But we're all experts in this room.

Really I think for me the way a lot of us in the conversations I've been having have been trying to focus on this is saying how are we looking at dearth of employment where it is happening, and not actually looking at those workers and saying you either have to stay in this field or completely change your career. We're really looking at ways that we can use nonprofit organizations. CBOs,

folks like NYCETC, whom can upskill people into the fields that are emerging. So we have sectors right now in vocation and trades, and I'll give a big nation one, not necessarily impacting New York, but we look at coal miners. People we know were trying to move out. We've got big climate goals. How are we taking those workers and upskilling them in. Or even an average person, a worker that's working in transportation or logistics right now or the gig economy.

There are plenty of sectors that are emerging that we're not actually taking folks and saying you're in this job right now that has -- and you check off seven credentials. But this title, this emerging industry that's coming in, all you're missing is two credentials to move into that. That has a higher wage, has benefits, has a union, et cetera. And I think that is really part of that streamline, that pipeline that we need to start focusing on and creating here. Is giving people the upskilled opportunity. And we have groups across the city that are doing this every single day but really tapping into them, giving them the money they need, to find the folks that need that training, and move them in.

And then I think ultimately, like we -- there are places that need really investment for recovery, hotel industry is one of them right now, that both is impacting nonunion and union workers, and I know we hear a talking point of 90% occupancy right now in hotels, but those are hotels that are open. That's not impacting the hotels that are closed. That's not impacting the hotels that are up for conversion. So really if we're going to focus on getting people back to work, and we're going to ensure that we're not widening the gap of unemployment, it's finding ways to invest in industries to get workers back in their jobs, and up skilling workers into new emerging industries

>> Gale Brewer: I just want to add if you don't mind, I'm a big fan of Ken Adams who is the head of La Guardia community college. We need nurses, plumbers, many of the trades hopefully to go into the unions. As I understand it, he is saying to the individual, you can come to community college, we'll help you get

your GED. You don't need college to be one of these very-needed professions.

We will train you with the credentials that you just heard about, and we'll give you 6 credits at La Guardia community college. Which means they will come back to finish. So innovative ideas like that need to be on a much broader scale for the city of New York. I keep going back to the City college and CUNY and the fact that these professions are desperate. We're desperate for nurses, plumbers, electricians and so many others. But we're not doing the type of easy access and support. And it's privately funded. It's not costing the city anything. But it's the kind of program that government should pay for across the board.

>> Brian Pascus: The summer youth employment program, it just had over 100,000 participants this summer. Speaker Adams recently said that she would like to see it expand to a year-round youth employment will program and it would become one that partners with the private sector. Councilwoman Brewer how does the city make that happen, and who do we partner with?

>> Gale Brewer: I agree we had a summer youth employment program young woman and we hired her, so that's what happens when you have SYPE in your workplace. So I do think it should be year-round. Obviously maybe not at the same scale because people are back in school. It's going back to this issue of what are are your priorities. So you have a budget gap. What are the priorities. I think we agree workforce, housing, those are the top priorities for me anyway. It would seem to me whether it's JP Morgan and the great work Barbara Chang is doing, figuring out which agencies will work with us as they are during the summer, there's no question SYP equals jobs. So if you are having the same experience during the summer that I just described, it makes sense to do it year-round that it's a wonderful public-private partnership. You can't get the private sector to participate in everything, but they do understand we need a workforce for the future because it's to their benefit. So yes, year-round it's the kind of stream lining that would make sense.

>> Brian Pascus: Do you have anything to add?

>> Amanda Farias: I think we're losing workers as early as fifth grade. The

moment we do not tap into interests of young people and really building on those interests and to skill sets and skill sets into internships or fellowships and into jobs or into college and career, that's how we end up with this massive unemployment or people going to CUNY for one year and then dropping out. Because they haven't figured out what they would like to do or they can't continue on their education. So investing in young people is really at the core of what we need to be focusing on in workforce.

>> Brian Pascus: Let's stay on that topic because we just talked about unemployment. 18-24-year-olds have a 21% unemployment rate right now. Where does education fit into workforce development? Are we teaching our kids the right subjects in school? Are they having the right classes to prepare themselves for the 21st century economy? And how can the city help prioritize what young people learn as they prepare to enter the economy?

>> Are Gale Brewer: We're back to the CTE question, which is the programs, career and technical education. For years, decades, the city has not invested in aviation, automation, food and finance, and the list goes on.

If you go to food and finance, which is a school I know well, you absolutely get a job in the culinary industry or you go on to Cornell or you go on to other colleges that teach culinary.

Hotels, culinary jobs needed. You don't need to be a genius in any way to know that there are jobs there. So the city has not done that. Now the Mayor to his credit and the chancellor have said this is a priority. It is one of 21 agencies that needs to be stream lined. You need to work with EDC, you need to work with the other agencies.

The answer to your question is two things. Don't put kids who are not interested in culinary at food and finance. We have somewhat stopped that. And make sure that when you graduate from aviation, there's a relationship with the Port Authority and the airports. You get the picture. It sounds easy but it has not happened in the past.

So let's hold the administration to their promise that CTE is going to be

much-better funded, aligned with the agencies, and we will have people who were interested and follow up on those jobs

>> Amanda Farias: That's exactly it. We are not doing our job and saying you are in junior high school or middle school and you didn't get your first or second choice so you're just going to go to AE Smith and figure it out by the time you get to college. It's like no, you did really great in math and science, or you really enjoyed that woodworking class, and here's the next step N.

We're not doing that at the career and technical education level. We're not investing enough to have young people that are actually good -- not me, I'm not good at math or science, it's good that I'm here. But my brother, for example, college was not his thing. He wasn't an academic, but he can tell me the size of my wall by looking at it. He can make a really greatest mate. He's good at math and science.

Right now he's in an apprenticeship for plumbing. That is a thing that he's interested in. But we are not finding the investments early enough, and realistically, without those, we won't -- like we won't actually solve the larger problem. So it's up to us to really make those investments early

>> Brian Pascus: Let's stay on this theme of investments and preparation, but let's go further and think about how do we better prepare our current workers, our existing workforce, the people who are between ages 30 and 55 and 60 for the changes in the new trends --

>> Gale Brewer: I'm older than that.

>> Brian Pascus: I did not know.

So how do we prepare these workers for changes to the 21st century economy, and should the city council establish a permanent workforce development program or fund?

>> Amanda Farias: Yes, we should. I think we're in a really unique opportunity right now to see the office of workforce development or task force pipeline, it's a long name. We have really good people at least on the mayor's side that are working on trying to streamline that and trying to figure out how to get these 21

agencies in, and not looking at the empty vacancies right now saying they don't need those people, but finding those people within our city or within our neighborhoods to move them into those titles. But I do think that -- I know we've spoken a lot about investing in young people, but we obviously need to find like adult training, older adult training is important to keeping the workforce alive. And keeping that going. So yeah. I mean I just think that what we're looking at different sectors and different fields and we should really be looking at data on why people are leaving, or why people are not going into those areas, and putting the dollars behind that to move them in. I mean, I can't say up-skilling enough. That is really in direct relationship to investing in young people. How we keep people working and how we move them in through the sectors.

>> Gale Brewer: Yes, I agree. There's so many ancillary support mechanisms to keep people in, obviously education. So making CUNY available in the way that I just described, which would be free if I would suggest that. For those who are improving their courses.

Number two, language. You can't imagine how many nonprofits are absolutely back logged in terms of teaching language, so people can do better in whatever job they're working in.

And then you just have to keep working with the industry. We still seem to have some kind of a disconnect between life sciences when you need need to make it more diverse or technology to make it more diverse, you need to make sure those who are there are supported, but also to bring in more.

And it goes back to the group, the project that I just mentioned in economic development corporation where they're taking in people who are diverse to bring them into the industry. What we have is great, you just need more of everything. And that does require funding. That does require funding. But it has to be -- if that's your priority, that's what you need to work on. And it's certainly our priority

>> Amanda Farias: Can I just lastly say, we also have so many groups -- so many organizations and training systems throughout the city that their program, their training, their initiative has great retention. Has really great reporting data.

It's like 90% of people get a job or 80% of people get a job at a place and two years after are still within a title or that job.

And those systems are so replicable but we are not sharing that information across the board sometimes. I speak to organizations and I'm like how do you have this great data set and we're not doing this citywide. And it's like we kind of try to serve citywide but they have such a small amount of funding can only do 50 people at a time or a hundred people at a time.

Along with the funding, we also need to be better at finding the people we need to uplift and champion and say this system is replicable how do we scale this up to really encourage and bolster up the workforce too

>> Gale Brewer: We're serious at the city council and doing the oversight to make this happen. It's the workforce committee or oversight is both as head of investigations and oversight we're committed to doing that.

>> Brian Pascus: Okay. You can clap.

[Applause]

So to the most common words on everyone's lips when we discuss jobs, workforce development, the economy, are child care. We constantly are hearing about child care. Yesterday the council passed a package including setting the foundation for universal child care. Why has this taken so long. Please tell us?

>> Male leadership. My initial thought. Not apologetic about that at all.

>> Brian Pascus: We have our answer to that question. Maybe more a little deeper, what steps need to be taken in the years ahead to actually improve access, that go beyond just a task force to study something or make recommendations? How do we actually get there to universal child care?

>> Gale Brewer: I'm like a broken record but the package is great. It doesn't say exactly how we're going to get there, it says we should get there. The way that we get there is it's part of the priorities.

Let me give you an example. Agencies have got to work with a situation when there is a child care center, and not take it six months to open. Because the agencies together can't figure out how to do the right inspections. That has

to start. So even when you have a center, it's hard to get it open when there's been a challenge in the past or when you're brand new. So that's number one.

Number two, we have to figure out with the mayor, hopefully keeping what I call DeBlasio's premier work which is pre-K and three year-olds. Both of them need to remain. They were funded by the federal government and we do need to find the money so that's a challenge. But that's also part of the child care.

Some of those, however, don't go all day long. So when we talk about universal, you have to talk about child care that is appropriate for parents who are working. Many challenges. You also have to figure out where there's a workforce situation, what are the hours, public-private partnership that could be part of it. So many people I know have different shifts so the child care that exists doesn't work for them.

This whole challenge has to be thought out as we're talking about workforce. The hope is there, task forces wanting universal, but it has to be thought out, not only about we want it, but what's the space, what's the public-private partnership, and how in the world are the agencies going to participate. And it has to be the right hours, just to start with.

>> Amanda Farias: Yeah. And thank you for that. I think that's exactly it. It is setting the foundation and aiming us towards it. But I think this too encourages the conversation of what does the future of work look like. How do we make sure our work is hybrid or has a remote option. How do we make sure our work spaces are conducive to parents or mothers or people with children.

In the city council I had a friend visit me with her baby. Not a single bathroom in city hall had a changing table. That's concerning for an all-woman council, primarily right now, but also because it's a building that has women and potentially children in it sometimes. So really, child care is how we end a lot of the disparities for primarily women, but also families.

And I think this is a really good head start. I think it's also encouraging that we have women-led body right now, that can follow this through. We have someone leading on oversight who will make sure that the task forces give us

the data, and we follow-up on what that means.

And then I think what we need to look at in the future are different funding opportunities to make child care vendors or child care spaces, give the opportunity to be more affordable to the average person that would like to utilize them. So I think that's the next step moving forward.

>> Brian Pascus: If we could, and I don't want to put you guys on the spot too much, but we're hearing about --

>> Yes, you do.

>> Brian Pascus: We're hearing about universal pre-K, universal 3K and now child care. Are there any places in the budget in the years ahead that we're going to be okay with downsizing or cutting to make room for these programs? Because these are going to be expensive and very important programs if they're going to serve anyone in New York City.

>> Amanda Farias: I think, yes. I think generally there probably lots of money within a budget, where we can reduce spending or reduce expenses or find better ways to spend that can be more economically savvy in how we use our budgets and tax dollars.

I don't primarily want to highlight a specific space, because I don't know of any off the top of my head. But I'm share Gale has --

>> Gale Brewer: The units of appropriation, U of A is the most important budget word. What that means is you could have department of homeless -- I'm just making this up. \$10 million. It doesn't say one word as to what is in that \$10 million. To the credit of Jim Karis who is long time one of general counsels on the city council. He got 7 units of appropriations delineated at the police department. That might not make sense, what's the big deal, it's a big deal.

Because then you know what is going in in terms of technology or what's going in in terms of detective, et cetera. So what I'm saying is, the way to do the cut in the budget is to make these darn agencies give their units of appropriation and not give us a \$20 million this is for other. That is where you cut the budget.

>> Brian Pascus: I think that's the perfect way to end this wonderful discussion.

Thank you.

[Applause]

>> For those of you heading out, we're actually about to have the Mayor come on, so I would encourage you to stay to hear the Mayor speak. We'll get started in a minute.

>> Gregory Morris: Ladies and gentlemen, if I could have your attention please. Everyone, if I could have your attention this way. I'm very pleased today to let you know that we are being joined by Mayor Eric Adams. Mayor Adams, thank you for all of your work in making workforce development a central pillar of your administration in your commitment to jobs and justice.

When it comes to our collective recovery, mobility, and equity, please note these folks in this room, they're going to help you get the job done.

Ladies and gentlemen, our 110th Mayor, Eric Adams!

[Applause]

>> Mayor Adams: Thank you, thank you so much. Even before I talk about this issue, I just want to continue to resonate this entire concept. This person sat down for a portrait, he had a scar on his face. And he told the artist that I know I have a scar. But remember, I have a face.

And so there are people in this city that want to define us by our scars. We have a face. Six felony crimes on our subway system a day. We have to address them. 3.5 million people use our subway system every day to get to their place of home, work, job, safely. That's our face.

We have an economic challenge. That's a scar. But we are leading the major hotel industries in the 25 major markets, 91% of our hotels are back up and operating. That's our face. Tourism is at a high that is so impressive. 56 million tourists are going to be in the city. People want to come to the city. That's our face.

If you start your day writing in your journal everything that happened to you

bad the day before, you're going to define yourself by that journal entry. I lean into what's great about this city. And I'm not going to allow the tabloids to find the worse part of those six crimes to define what our city is about. That is not who we're about. This is a city of resiliency, invincibility, dedication, commitment, diversity.

That is our face. That's the face I know, and that's the face that I'm going to lean into. And no one personifies that more than you. Those of you who are on the ground, allowing people to be gainfully employed in the industries of this city. A job is not someplace you go in the a.m. hours of your day. It's the precursor to sleep that allows you to experience the American dream.

And void of that, you are relegated to a perpetual state of being in a nightmare and not the dream. That is why we zero in on this. And what we're doing at city caps Hall these are not my ideas. When I was running I sat down with folks like Jose Ortiz and others like you and say how do we get it right?

How do we first seek to understand, so we are understood, and craft policies that are in unison? Not this band where everyone is playing their own beat, but have one beat. I know I'm preaching to the choir, this is choir practice. Because too many people are singing off-key in this area.

So we need to streamline all of these agencies. When I sat down and spoke with some of you in this room to learn that we have this entire operation of different agencies in the city doing their own thing around workforce development placement, identifying the jobs, and making sure that as we attract jobs that come in, that we can make sure the coordination is right.

That's what we want to do. Better coordination, better streamlining and having an open communication with you in a real way, so you can tell us how do we produce a better product.

So often we sit in a sterilized environments of our agencies, board rooms, conference rooms, and try to be intellectual and philosophical about what needs to be done on the ground. No to that. You'll never be a good shepherd if you're not hanging out amongst the sheeps.

We have to get among the people and say how do we do it better. So I'm pleased to be here with the New York City Employment and Training Coalition acronym ETC. This annual conference is so important, but now you have one of your own that's in the administration. Many of you know Jose. When I spoke with him on the campaign trail, I said I have to get this guy. And we were able to get him. I am so happy that he's part of our administration.

I know he's around here somewhere. Thank you brother Jose for what you're doing. And you know that you can speak directly with him. It's even better here I'd like to say you did this for several years, you were not in-person, it's good to be back in person, and get this done in a real way. I say this to employees all the time. It's good to get back into office spaces. You cannot be afraid of COVID on Monday when I see you in the night clubs on Sunday.

It's time to get back to work. That's the way it is. It's how we feed our ecosystem. Because when the accountant is back in that office space, he's going to the restaurant, he's bringing in the business travel. 72% of our hotel occupancy are business travelers. They're dishwashers getting a job, the waiters getting a jobment the person you buy the flowers from on the corner is getting a job. That's the financial system even if it's not in central Manhattan and it's in our local communities, the goal is cross-pollination of ideas, in an office environment, even if it's four days a week we need to engage human beings that's what we want.

I want to thank the board and its members for helping assure talent and development is a key priority for this administration. So important to us. Even after the most challenging times we know we can get this city back to work.

Let me give you an encouragement. All week, week after week, new businesses are opening in the city. Coming here, setting up shop. People want to do business in the city. Not because of the Empire State Building. Not because of the different things. They want to do it because of the people. The diversity of our city, people are bringing their cultures and ideas to the business environment, and people know the good product we have.

New York is known for its people. But we must be a city of, yes, innovation, jobs, housing, and better healthcare systems. We just announced a major development down in Kips Bay life sciences, we're putting a substantial amount of money in this project, over \$1.5 billion square feet in development, we're going to attract life sciences to our city. We must build a pathway for those who are going to be employed in this important industry.

We want jobs that reach those who have often been forgotten and left behind. Then we have to recruit differently. If you are in Fort Green housing and you're looking for employment, you're not going to Linked In. You have to stop being afraid to go meet people one on one, and talk with them one on one. Have you to find the people. And recruitment can't be 9:00 to 5:00.

Recruitment has to be all hours of the day. When I'm out there 2:00 a.m. in the morning, I'm telling people about jobs. So if we're a 9:00 to 5:00 operation, then we're not going to reach those people who need jobs. A lot of people are sleeping during 9:00 to 5:00 and they don't come out at night to catch me while I'm out. That's how we have to think about this.

This is a 24-hour city, and our approach to helping people must be 24-hour. We want to tap that incredible talent. And that's why this year we launched NYC PINCC, Pathways to Industrial Careers a program that would change 2,000 New Yorkers into high-wage career track in the construction and transportation industry the next through years.

August 1st I signed an executive order that put talent and workforce development at the center of our economic development strategy. The executive order empowers the mayor's office of talent and workforce development to streamline the efforts of nearly two dozen city agencies and offices that administer workforce training in job placement programs, bringing them all together, and making sure that the agency cross government will convene regularly to strategize and collaborate through the workforce intelligence career cabinet. That's so important. And finally, we believe that it's important to ensure that we are working hand in hand in the department of

education, the CUNY system, so much talent is in CUNY, and community organizations to maximize opportunity for all New Yorkers.

We created a future for work task force to work on this important initiative, and move our city forward in the right direction. I'm excited. I'm dedicated. I'm committed. I know what a job does for one for dignity, for the opportunity, and to pursue this thing we call the American dream. You cannot do it if you're left ostracized and ignored. Our goal is not to allow that to happen. You are our partners. We take our directions from you.

Help us build this system correctly. Help us streamline, help us get the barriers out of the way so you can do your job the way it ought to be. I know and you know, I borrowed from the owner of Snapple soft drink we know who we are because we're made up of the best stuff on earth. We are New Yorkers. Thank you very much.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: Let's give a round of applause for our esteemed mayor. You know, this is my day nine on the job. I'm not sure where we go from here, but we've got a lot more to accomplish and together to build on today. A key part of that buzz will be our labor leads. They are up next, a fireside chat a conversation with labor leaders. Please welcome Henry Garrido district council 37. Gary LaBarbera president of the building construction and trades council, Sandy Vito, training and employment funds. They are in conversation with Kathleen Culhane who you met earlier our board chair president of nontraditional employment for women. Please give this esteemed body a huge round of applause. We are grateful for their presence today.

[Applause]

>> Kathleen Culhane: Thank you, Greg. I'm really excited for this robust discussion we're about to have. So it's my honor. So we're going to jump right in.

So talking about post-pandemic economic recovery in New York City. It's

unique, compared to the rest of the nation. New York City has recovered only 77% of its pandemic job losses, and the city has consistently lagged behind other major cities and states in its recovery.

The nation overall has recovered over 96% of its pandemic job loss. And we're also facing a bleak fiscal forecast, and the trend of the great resignation.

So, starting with Sandi and going down the line. Sandi, Gary, then Henry, how does this statement resonate with you, and what are you seeing right now? And how does this moment differ from previous recessions and economic downturns?

>> Sandi Vito: Well, I guess I start with healthcare specific. Because I think my colleagues will address some of the other areas. In healthcare you had folks on the front line risking their lives every day during the pandemic. And what we saw were a number of retirements. People were exhausted. Much like the rest of the economy, it is bifurcated. We have shortages in occupations, particularly in good-paying occupations. Nurses, respiratory therapists, imaging.

And then we also have, even though they're unionized, home health aides and CNAs, where the work is the kind of work that the caregivers want to do, but the conditions of the work are not good. So the union fights very hard for systemic change, but there are significant problems recruiting in those occupations. So we have to think about healthcare as a very highly credentialed industry. So I know lots of people think about job training and they want to talk about literacy.

Necessary, but not sufficient. The piece that you want to think about in healthcare is how do we orient people and get the right people into the sector post-pandemic? And it's not always just COVID. People aren't -- when we do surveys, it's not fear of COVID anymore, it's more exhaustion. And how do we create programs that reach the levels of credential that are important in the industry. So it's not a 2-week training program, it's a 2-year training program to become a nurse or respiratory therapist. I'll stop there.

>> Gary LaBarbera: Thank you very much, it's a pleasure to be here. I will

speak to the construction industry for a moment. Let me make an observation to your direct question. You state that New York, compared to the rest of the country, is lagging. I think the first thing you have to think about is the pandemic itself, and you have to realize that New York City, New York was the epicenter of the pandemic.

New York City was particularly hit harder than many other areas in the nation. That's one factor in and of itself. That's one point.

The other point is I think what the pandemic did in fact, it transformed many workers' ideas of the way work can be done. I know from talking to a lot of corporate heads and building owners, that only now are really building vacancies beginning to come down. And part of that is because of the kind of a cultural shift in certain industries where people want to have a better work-life mix. And doing that, the way to do that rather is through remote working.

So I think that's part of one of the reasons that there's this perception that we're lagging. But in terms of the construction industry itself, I can tell you emphatically that the industry, the developers, in the private sectors are very bullish on the future. Actually they feel that over the next 5-7 years we're going to have a very robust industry.

Obviously tying into the question as well, one of the problems is when you're in a financial circumstance as we are today, and in particular the fed is continuing to raise rates to try and slow the economy, perhaps bring us into a recession, possibly. But that makes it -- one of the industries that's impacted largely is the construction industry because of lending.

So I think I'll put a pin in it there. But I can say in terms of the outlook, there's a lot of willingness and eagerness to build in this city. One of the things that, you know, I heard this morning, frankly from the governor, is that data is backing up more and more people are wanting to come to New York. We heard this with Google, where Google said you have to be in an office, any office you want, over a thousand employees decided they wanted to come to New York. So I'm very confident and very optimistic that New York is going to come back as strong as it

ever was.

>> Henry Garrido: You heard from healthcare, you heard from construction, I will take an opportunity to speak about government. Because quite often we miss the fact that 10% of the city's workforce works in government. And that government suffers the same pressures and challenges that all the private industries do. And right now we are really suffering. And I will reserve comments about the collective bargaining agreement for city workers, which is far more complicated. But I will talk about the two biggest challenges that I see, in recruitment and retention. One is wages. Right now, with all the efforts that we made to raise the minimum wage to \$15 an hour across the board which is great and I'm very proud for what we did for that, we have 32,000 city workers that make between 15 and 18 bucks an hour. Now when you have McDonald's, when you have Whole Foods, when you have all these private industries trying to recruit people at \$18 and \$20 an hour with no other requirements that you have to become a city worker, that becomes a challenge to recruit and retain the best and the brightest and it's on both ends. Because right now we have a serious vacancy problem. So if you add the budget agencies, we have approximately 400,000 city workers. So just as we have a problem at the low end, we have a problem at the high end. I have 22% vacancies in cybersecurity positions. These are positions that make \$150,000 and above.

Why? Because the private industry is paying them \$100,000 above that. The same challenges that we have. Wages is an absolute necessity how we realize. And there's an impact. You can recruit in the department of buildings 22% vacancy right now, but you can't do the construction that Gary was talking about. You can't recruit lifeguards so you can't open the beaches. Not only are you affecting the quality of life of people, but the concessions are affected. The income that comes in from that are affected.

The second issue is the failure to recognize that work is changing. Telecommuting is something that should have been talked about in city

government before, and yet we insist everybody has to come back and the office has to be the same. 9:00 to 5:00 or 10:00 to 6:00 or whatever you want to say in an office set-up. We have the technology to improve that, to be able to do the work as efficiently, from home. Not every day, but there has to be a recognition that the job has changed. That the workplace and the office has changed. I'll give you an example of that. I had a meeting yesterday with all the attorneys at workers comp. What happens if you're home and you're telecommuting and you spill some milk and you fall off. Is that a covered case in worker's comp? It happened to somebody here. Guess what? Every single one of the claims that you get hurt at home is being controverted. So there's no recognition that work at home is now an acceptable and a viable way of doing that. We're going to change because otherwise we're going to remain behind in government and we're not going to recruit and retain the best and the brightest in order to get services done.

>> Kathleen Culhane: So keeping on the topic of good-paying careers, again we'll go down the line. What are the specific investments, commitments, strategies, that need to be made by the city and state in partnership with labor of course, to build pipelines to good-paying careers? How do we transition from a workforce development mind set to a career development focus? And what are the specific challenges here?

>> Sandi Vito: It's actually a fairly simple calculation in healthcare. For those of you who don't know I'm actually not a labor leader. I'm the executive director of the training fund. Gary and Henry are the real leaders. In terms of education pathways, we've been doing education pathways in healthcare since 1969. But the way our fund is structured under law, we can only provide career pathways. We have people who are working in dietary in the kitchens who have become director of respiratory therapy. We have had career pathways since 1969. Longer than most people in the country. And we've created all the wraparound services, but we -- the challenge we have right now with all these occupational shortages, we can't reach outside of the labor market to provide those same

services.

So when I think of public education and public workforce development systems, the key is to create opportunities that help the very people that we're talking about, who have not yet been reemployed, find ways to advance their careers. And that is not -- just again I can't repeat enough. It's not just very simple courses. We have to dream, and assume that somebody who's outside of the labor market right now can become a nurse with the right support systems.

I think many of you have heard me say that before. But we have to really invest in the people of New York City, in terms of education, with lots of support systems which means stipends, child care, transportation costs, so that you can reach that dream and help fill those shortages. Because it's not just nursing. I use that because that's what people know. But there are a lot of opportunities in healthcare, and we're not investing in people to be able to take those opportunities.

>> Gary LaBarbera: That's a great response, Sandi. And I'm going to tag along on one of the issues where I think the city could make an important investment, and that is in child care. One of the biggest barriers, and Kathleen is very familiar with this. I just want to -- she serves as the chairperson of the Non traditional Employment for Women. This is one of the pre-apprentice and direct entry programs that is affiliated with the New York City building and trades council and it's a very successful program, we're very proud of the work that we do together. And we're actually along with our national organization and partnering with New here in New York, we're trying to establish a pilot for child wear care in the construction industry. Why is it different? It is different and the reason it's different. The hours of work in the construction industry are certainly not 9:00 to 5:00 or normal hours of work.

Generally construction begins, if you live in the city you know this and probably complain about it, at the latest 7:00 a.m. in the morning. Sometimes depending upon the area and special variances, 6:00 a.m. in the morning, and

oftentimes it could go 4:00 to 5:00 in the evening.

So these are long days. So in order for a worker to be at a job site at 6:00 a.m., they need to be up at 4:00 a.m. and they need to drop their children off at 5:00 a.m. and they may not be able to pick up children back up until 5:00 or 6:00 p.m. So it is a barrier for females entering the industry. One of the roles and I agree with Sandi is really invest in is looking at child care, because it is a fundamental need, especially for workers.

Investing in child care and broadening the opportunity there is investing in people. That's one thing.

I also will say, it's interesting, very interesting that, fortuitous really that we're with Sandi today and she's talking about healthcare. Because just prior to this event when the Mayor was and I was with the Mayor and the Governor this morning was the announcement of the Kips Bay CUNY Life Sciences center this is going to really developing the nursing field, to be able to put them through these educational programs and actually attach a job to them.

So very important. And for that this is a long-term plan. That is an investment. That is something the city can do. And now all of that construction will result in union construction jobs. So one of the things that I've had this conversation with some of the folks right here in this room, and certainly with the mayor over the years. And every governmental elected official is that there really needs to be a cognizant of thought process investment into creating pathways into union apprenticeship programs and that's the key. And I think we've worked very successfully to this point with this administration and prior administrations, withish establishing what they called project labor agreements that require really union career pats for city work, but I want to emphasize one point.

The most important thing is without that pathway and a sustainable pathway, we can't have careers. And I think if you think about the three individuals here that are representing different labor organizations, we're not talking about jobs. We're not talking about a job that you go to and then in a year, like in the

construction industry, year and a half, two years, the project is over and that means your job is over.

We're talking about career pathways, to have a career in healthcare, to have a career in the construction industry. To have a career working for a city agency. And I am thoroughly convinced that the only really pathways are through a union job, a union career, a training program or a union apprentice program. I think the role of the city can be, and it is, there's always room to expand, is to really continue to think about investment into training.

The offshore wind industry, the solar industry, we think about renewables, this is going to create a whole new green economy. There are going to be thousands of jobs available. And we need in the building trades, we're going to construct all that work that's in statute. We need to have training. We need to be able to build new training facilities for specific types of training. In government, and the city certainly can play a role in supporting and making the investments into people to find career pathways. Thank you.

>> Henry Garrido: Those those of you who know me I'm Dominican. One of the things we do, we do a lot of family, loud music, food, all that stuff. We have two rules in our family: Do not talk about baseball, and do not talk about unions. Because one of them is going to end up in a fistfight. Even with all those rules somebody is bound to talk about the Yankees and Boston and the whole nine. And somebody is going to mention a union and most likely it's going to be like hey Henry, can you give me a job.

Nothing serious, I can do office cleaning and I just want to make \$100,000 plus. Hook me up. And you're like wait a minute, it doesn't work like that. You need to be trained. You take an exam. Most city jobs require you to take a civil service exam. You say that hey, I can send you a list -- no no. I just want you to call somebody. Right? And so this is what happens.

I know that we did everything possible to make sure that people who are hired by government are the most trained, the most qualified. But we have gone overboard. We have made the hurdles of employment so high, so difficult, so

convoluted. You have to get fingerprinted, you have to pay \$300 for a test that you may or may not pass. We have 500 sanitation jobs, 92,000 people applied.

Yeah, they make \$100,000, but you've got to be trained. And up until 2017, for architects and engineers in IT, this is a fact. The city was spending \$2.85 in training them every year. Most of that training and recruitment and retention are left up to the union. To Gary's point, apprenticeship programs, is education funds like Sandi's and ours, do exactly that. But we haven't made the investment.

We haven't made an investment for workforce development that many of you represent here. And it seems like we're always begging to do what we're required to do. And if you think about the history of labor, the history of development in this country, there's always been a recognition that you have to train folks to get them prepared to do the job. And if you're not willing to invest that you're going to get what you get now, which is problems in recruitment, retention, high turnover rates.

I have a 38% turnover rate in social workers right now. 38%. We have a problem with mental health in this city. Right? I can't get anybody to do a subway run to pick up problem people with mental health, and I can't get anyone to accept, even with a higher salary, when there's a mental health call. One you don't pay them enough, two you don't respect them enough to listen to their opinions. And third, they feel like they're just shuffling people around. And they got into government because not of the salaries, believe me.

They got into government because they believed in something. And you're not listening to their voices. You're not listening, respecting the very professionals who do that. And I think that's the definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over again and expecting different results. That's what Einstein said. What we're doing in the city is insanity. We are not respecting the people who do the work, and if we continue to do it, we're going to continue to have the same results.

>> Kathleen Culhane: So we're unfortunately at final thoughts already. I know.

We talked about opportunity, we talked about careers, we talked about wages. We want to touch on equity and a short final thought and we're going to go down the road.

>> Sandi Vito: I guess I would be remiss if we're talking about equity if we didn't talk about home care workers. So we know as a society that home care workers allow us often to do work, because they're taking care of our parents. They allow people with disabilities often to be in the workplace. They're really essential to our economy. And we don't treat them like that.

So when we think about workforce development and equity, it has to be surrounded with some better public policy that values jobs, just as Henry is saying some of the public sector jobs, when you're thinking about service workers, particularly service workers where the history -- I'm just going to say it. It comes from the whole industry was built in the past on exploiting immigrant workers and before that the free labor of enslaved workers.

So if that's where the industry was built, we need to break through that and think about different policy options that value that work appropriately. Because right now it's just contingent labor at a very low wage, because of the shortage of hours -- there's like a demand for it, but only in short-hour jobs. So we have a lot to work through to make those jobs better.

The union did fight and get a \$3 increase for home care workers. So that's a real step in the right direction. So we're making strides. But there's a lot more to do.

>> Gary LaBarbera: Well, that's a really good question and it's very hard to put it in a final thought, I've got to say. But let me say it this way to you. In terms of when I think about equity. If you think about the construction industry, and obviously there are union projects and there are open shop projects where there are nonunion workers that work for non-union contractors. I'll tell you most of the time those non-union contractors are unscrupulous contractors.

This is a fact. There's an underbelly in this industry. I think about those workers, who are regularly exploited. If you think about the construction industry

and you think about -- and Kathleen you're very well aware of this. Several years ago we had 21, 22 fatalities a year in the construction industry. 85% to 90% of those workers were non-union workers. Those workers, over 50% of those workers were non-English-speaking workers. And when I think about the level of abuse and exploitation in the non-union sector, this is something that, as the unionized construction industry, we fight against this. We don't just fight for our members, we fight for all workers. And certainly all construction workers in this city. And we would pass the law, local law 197, which requires mandatory training for every construction worker. We had Carlos's law where we're waiting to have signed.

Where Carlos was killed because of an unscrupulous contractor forcing him to work in an unsafe trench and it was the unionized construction that got a passed in al bane that has penalties. The individual for that what I would say is a murder was \$10,000 for the contractor and no criminality. So you're telling me that a life is worth \$10,000?

So we've changed that now and now there are criminal consequences as well as a minimum of \$500,000 payment, half a million to the family. Same issue on wage theft. Wage theft is a big problem in the non-union industry. We passed a law which was signed into law, wage theft protection act. When I think about equity, if you are in the union ionized construction industry in the union, collective bargaining agreement is the great equalizer. But if you're a non-union worker, that's where we have to work and really have to understand what they're going through. And how much they are abused. And we try to organize, we do organize, Kathleen you know that.

One of the things that we have focused on in the last decade in particular is really bringing diversity into the building trades through our pre-apprentice and entry programs. I can tell you statistically today the building trades membership is majority mine norty. Almost 70% of people coming into the building trades apprentice training programs are minorities. That's part of equity too.

Making sure all people from all communities, in particular marginalized and

underserved communities have an opportunity to come into the middle class with a career pathway. I'll put a pin in it there, but I could really talk a lot about the situation in terms of equity and the difference between a union career and a non-union job.

>> Kathleen Culhane: Henry final thoughts?

>> Henry Garrido: If you see my picture you see I had hair once. When I started this, it's not photo shop. Part of the reason I lost my hair is I feel like I'm yelling at the wind at these concepts. I say look, you don't need to reinvent the wheel. At the height of the industrial revolution in this country, we had a concept called hiring halls. You bring people together. If I were to say to this group I have a hundred jobs in five agency, it pays \$50,000 here are the requirements.

Come to one center, send as many qualified people as you can and train them, and we can connect them. They can understand whatever bureaucratic requirements they have to do, we can have the union rules here, we can have the benefits here. They can get fingerprinted, they can sign up, we can waive the payment. I think it would be a great idea to implement.

As opposed to to have 50,000 hiring centers all bifurcated and all that stuff. Case in point at the height of the Black Lives Matter protests here, we had 100 jobs in the police department. Nobody wanted to apply for it. It was not an attractive place to be, he they were trying to attract people of color. We said leave it to us. We did a hiring hall and they claim, it was posted at every precinct, including Staten Island, we did a centralized hiring hall. With community churches, community groups, community organizations.

With a lot of the groups that are here. 1,200 people showed up for the jobs. And we hire on that day not only enough to fill those 200 jobs, but enough to have a bank of folks who will be on the waiting list should the position become available. That's a prime example of hiring working. So if you heard what I said before, we need hiring halls back in government. And we need to connect the people who are doing the training, the recruitment, with the jobs that are available and make it as simple as possible for people to navigate a

good-paying -- yes, union job. That won't make you lose your hair.

>> Kathleen Culhane: Please join me in thanking our esteemed panel.

>> Thank you all.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: Give these folks one more round of applause. We have one more presentation and then we'll break for lunch. Okay. One more presentation this morning. And then it's on to lunch. When we get back from lunch, after lunch is all about funders, it's about providers, it's about more solutions and strategies. And there's also going to be a significant announcement that's going to benefit I think some folks in the room on tech training.

So this is mapping the skills of New Yorkers to drive place and industry-based development and reskilling. Please join me in welcoming Keri Faulhaber, vice president of JobsFirstNYC and Alison Lands head of strategy at SkyHive technologies. Round of applause please. Keep it going.

[Applause]

>> Is it still morning? I don't think so. Good afternoon -- it's not working? How about now? Okay. You've got to push the button. Note to self.

Greg introduced us, so I can skip that. For those of you who are not familiar with jobs first, we are an organization that is dedicated to advancing economic mobility for young adults and their communities. And I'm joined today with Alison Lands from SkyHive technologies. SkyHive is a technology platform that is using intelligence to re-skill the workforce globally.

You can see our missions are very well aligned. I won't go into them. Alison will tell a little more about that later. But we're here to tell you about a solution that we think is very timely, and very important, especially listening to Mayor Eric Adams for what the city needs now in recovery.

So why is this important? Place matters. The community that you grow up in -- the screen went dead. Sorry I'm going to have to twist a little bit. The community where you grew up in, where you were born, is still the greatest

determinant of your future opportunity.

And the skills that are in that community help shape you, help shape your future. But there are communities that don't have the same access to skills and training across New York City. And the community also helps determine what industry is in that area, and what skills the industries need and look for. But if there is a mismatch, your future is not quite on the same career trajectory of somebody born in a different community.

And really to maximize the effectiveness of workforce development, you must include the role of place, the state of industry, the social capital of the community, and the attributes of the individual.

So what's the opportunity here? And what's the challenge here that we're really addressing? I want you to imagine being able to build re-skilling and upskilling plans for an entire neighborhood, for a community, for the city. Plans that really showcase that community. And of its residents.

Build upon the unique strengths of the people who live in that community and the needs of that community in the industries and create direct pathways to higher-wage jobs and lay a foundation for long-term economic mobility.

>> Alison Lands: You've painted an amazing vision, Keri. SkyHive is very happy to partner with jobs first. Some of you may not have heard of SkyHive technologies. We are a skills intensive platform that parses the world's data using AI and machine learning where do we get the data from? We get it from many different global sources including things like online job postings, CVs, resumes, or online provide files.

We also get it from educational data, workforce data, publicly available census data and in the case of SkyHive job first partner we get it from community intermediaries are helping their populations complete skills passports and surface the transferrable skills that they have.

We use all of this information to answer four key questions that are core to the meat and potatoes of workforce development. What are my current skills? How do those skills align to the labor market today? And what is the gap between

where I am today and the skills that I will need either to get a better job or in the future? And what are the most efficient path to bridge that gap through up skilling, reskilling, training, education, et cetera?

You can answer those questions at the individual level but you can also answer them in aggregate at the community level and in doing so this partnership will create a system of intelligence for workforce development that can anticipate labor market demand shifts and where the economy is heading for New York City and connect job seekers to meaningful employment.

If we take just an example, I'll use David as an example. He's a use case that we see very frequently, hundreds if not thousands of use cases. He's a customer care specialist, he works in a call center. This is the type of job that exists in almost every community in our country and he's got a lot of transferrable skills. He might think that customer service is his core skill, and this job, I apologize, this is a slide that would have an an mission but I'm not able to do that today.

But he would have communication, empathy, problem-solving and judgment, skills that actually transfer to quite a few of the in-demand digital jobs of today user experience design, sales enablement, digital or product marketing or even jobs he hasn't thought of. The big takeaway here is in his community because of his social capital, because of the training programs available to him, David might not be able to be what he cannot see.

Things like SkyHive reveal to him viable career pats and transferrable skills that he may have overlooked. It helps him expand or narrow the focus you have his job search or his upskilling work in ways that align to the ways that the real labor market exists today and where it is going, very maybe where it was or where it is been.

And in doing so, we also work with the global 2,000 and Fortune 500 employers who use SkyHive as a tool. So this is giving David a trajectory and a step up into the labor market in a very actionable way.

I'll hand it back to Keri.

>> Keri Faulhaber: David is an avatar representative of thousands, hundreds of thousands of workers in the workforce. But Michael, Michael is a person, a participant from east side house settlement, a partner that we worked with to launch a pilot with SkyHive. And Michael was affected by COVID. Stuck at home, he was on a career path that changed dramatically with COVID and with some personal injuries. He couldn't leave his house.

He had some skills, he had worked on some small businesses, but he wasn't sure what to do now that COVID hit and he was home. He uploaded his profile into SkyHive. It told him his own skills currency, the things that he did, how it translates. How his experience translates to skills. And it suggested for him some training that might bring him into another career path, or continue him on a career path that he was on.

He was really interested in entrepreneurship. He took three courses, built his own business, ended up making swag for east side house printing logos on things for them. And Michael told us that he actually felt empowered and enlightened. He had a window into himself that he did not have before SkyHive.

So this is important, because skills mapping improves workforce outcomes. We saw it firsthand. SkyHive uses it all over the globe literally. It improves outcomes on an individual level because skills awareness equals adaptability that's what Michael found. And adaptability is the highest-demanded skill in the workforce right now. We don't even know what a career pathway looks like anymore but we know you need to be adaptable to succeed on it.

It improves workforce outcomes for community, because it addresses skills deserts. Not every community is equal. Not every community has access to the same high-level skills training. And skills mapping can tell you what is needed in that community to get people from where they are to where they need to be.

And it improves outcomes for industry. We know there's a talent shortage right now. There's a fight for good talent. And overcoming -- training people helps overcome skills shortages and encourage employers to partner with the workforce development sector. And it increases hiring too. Aligning workforce

programs to the unique skills foot prints of the communities they serve provides residents with the strongest possible path to economic mobility.

And we believe every community can benefit from skills mapping. There's a QR code you can scan it here. This is your way to get in touch with us, find out more. I'll give you the last words

>> Alison Lands: Sure. We believe not just every community but every corner of the workforce development ecosystem. We know that eight minutes is not a lot of time to share details with you, but please scan the QR code, visit our respective websites, catch us later at the conference or over lunch and we're happy to share more with you. Thank you.

>> Keri Faulhaber: Thank you.

[Applause]

>> All right. It's been a packed morning. Lots of dancing and fluidity on our agenda. So I know you're all ready to go to lunch. Just a couple of points before you do that.

Because of the variety of changes we had in our schedule, we're going to push back lunch to finish at 1:15 so please try to be back here at 1:15 and we'll start then the afternoon.

There has been -- there are inserts that will show a different afternoon agenda than what is in your program book. You can find those at the registration desk or you can just hang out and watch the whole day because it's all here. It's all correct on the website. You can go there as well.

So thank you, enjoy your lunch and we'll see you here at 1:15.

[Lunch break]

If everybody could take their seats, we're going to get started in about a minute.

All right, everybody. We're going to get started.

Thank you. Welcome back to the 2022 NYCETC Conference. We're kicking off our afternoon with a slate of programming with a conversation with ETC's leadership which is myself and our new CEO Greg Morris. We have the

privilege of being moderated today by Ben Max, who's executive editor of Gotham Gazette. If you are not reading Gotham Gazette yet you should be, a lot of insider stuff on New York City politics and social world so appreciate having been with us today and appreciate all of you for sticking around. So we'll take it away ourselves

>> Gregory Morris: Give yourselves a round of applause.

[Applause]

>> Ben Max: There should be more self-introductions at conferences today. Couldn't find anyone else to do it is what happened there.

So again, my name is Ben Max. I'm the editor of Gotham Gazette. Pleasure to be here again. I've been at the last several in-person conferences, I think. And very happy to join you for this conversation.

Since we don't have a lot of time, with our leadership here let's jump right into it.

So Annie, where are we right now? How has ETC grown over your decade-plus at ETC? How is the workforce development landscape shifting in recent years and to this moment? Give us a little lay of the land overview.

>> Annie Garneva: Sure. When I started as an intern, about 11 years ago, I described the coalition as a start-up.

>> Gregory Morris: Give it up for 11 years.

>> Annie Garneva: I described the coalition as a start-up, and I still describe it as a start-up. Lots of hustling, that is the world of advocacy and politics. We have grown exponentially to five staff from two, which is a miracle.

I used to be so proud and still continue to be so proud of being told that people are shocked to hear what a small team we are. And that really is only possible because of the membership and the partnerships that we have.

We learn from you. We can only do our work from you, the work that you're doing on the ground: So over the last decade the coalition has really been focusing on making our voice a legitimate and professional one that is reflective of the work on the ground. So the way that we do that is through regular

conversations, focus groups. We have now established a member policy council. We have regularly published reports, the most recent one being the landscape report that we published with WPTI and the new school who you'll hear from later.

A decade ago we were not publishing resources and literature. Again, 14 four of you answered that survey. So we can only do that with your support. And that in turn serves our advocacy.

Prior, 10 years ago when we started, our advocacy was focused on really making sure that you all know who your councilmembers are, making sure that you're engaging with them and know what the process looks like. Now it is a much more robust organizing force, where we're able to connect you to be the ones that are actually doing the speaking and the pushing with the council members that you see with you today.

I'm so proud that we had over 20 members testify at the economic development hearing at the beginning of the year. This is the biggest and most packed room I've seen in the last 10 or so conferences that we've done. So all of that is to say that we can only do what you all do. What we can only do, what you want us to do, with your support over and over again, and with you showing up.

And our focus has been on building that infrastructure so that we can actually represent your voice. Not just as the mayor had said, theory on paper, things that you read on the Internet. And that has just been such a miracle of advocacy to me. Because advocacy, it's not a short-term gain. You don't have gains, you can't point to a million dollars right away. But we have now have robust council members that are allies speaking for our communities.

We have the first time ever a deputy mayor that has the title workforce that comes before economic development. That is purely our recommendation that turned into reality from us and you pushing it. And we now have a mayor and an administration and a set of institutions that are both listening and speaking the language that we have been developing together for the last decade. Best

reflected in the blueprint that the mayor put out.

>> Ben Max: Personally covering these issues and covering city government, I've seen, and being here at these conferences, I've seen some of that growth and I've definitely noticed the influence growing that the workforce development has on city government. It's been remarkable to watch. There's a lot of room to grow and places to go. But just the mayor coming here and talking about these issues as he did today was indicative of that.

Speaking of that, Greg, congratulations. Where is ETC heading next? Where does the workforce development community in the city need to head next? What are a couple of the pillars of your vision for the future

>> Gregory Morris: Thank you for joining us today, it's great to see you. And thank all of you for being present today.

I guess I want to sort of start by saying I think the morning itself sort of told a story about the complexity of kind of this moment that we're in. When it comes to thinking about where workforce is and where it is going, you heard about the complexity as how the trades think about this, city council members, you heard from the city agencies, and I appreciated during the course of all of that, the claps and the snaps that were happening from you, because you were engaging with our speakers. The reality is we're in a moment in time when this coalition needs to hold itself accountable and hold its members accountable, and hold all of the folks who have a hand to play in how we reset the workforce and think about career development. We have to think about how we hold each other accountable for executing on really significant and meaningful priorities and actions.

And what I mean by that is, if we're going to change the way we educate kids so they're on a path to careers, we're going to have to hold a lot of folks accountable for making that a reality.

We're going to have to think about what it means to put employers in a position where they're actually creating opportunity at wages to keep their families safe and secure over time. What has to change to make that a reality if

our city government is talking about what it images for itself, what it imagines for the city, in terms of taking care of workers, no matter the hour that they worked, as the mayor talked about earlier, we really have to figure out how we hold ourselves accountable for that. That means we're going to have to talk about what skills

and training we're providing, how it's connected to our education and career platforms. We're going to talk about how we track success and what it is we expect of our partners regardless of their starting point, regardless of what entity they're representing about what they're achieving and what they're executing on with us on partnership. If you're the New York City Training Coalition we have to be able to tell the story about how our members are finding success.

That means your voice and your commitments and your focus needs to be driving sort of what our city thinks about when it comes to workforce development. But also we need to be able to tell the story that says the workforce has grown. We've bounced back in a different way. We are actually seeing equity in a way we haven't seen before.

When I think about the pillars, look. Not to be fancy here, but the reality is, we've got to talk about data and tracking. We've got to talk about more dollars to support this particular workforce. And we've got to think about our economic engines. And that means how does our workforce connect to our economic engines and communities and how it is that we're working directly to see neighborhoods that struggle to find pathways for folks to find stability to be doing better. Those are sort of the key sort of pieces, the key points along the way that I would say to suggest our path.

>> Ben Max: For either of you, is there something specific you heard the mayor say that's ringing in your head now? Greg you just mentioned something. Is there anything he said, or is there anything in particular you wish he had said that he didn't say, but you know is sort of percolating in city hall?

>> Annie Garneva: I would say it's this idea that we've been nurturing now, at least at the coalition for the last decade, that has now landed within the

blueprint, which is around inclusive growth. Which is how do you make sure that the economic development processes actually are made in planning and in structure and institutions for local communities so that when you're building something in that neighborhood, we'll have a panel on this later and talk about it in detail.

Making sure that local individuals are getting trained in order to then actually participate in whatever economic development output occurs through the investment that the city puts into that economic development where there is a building or whatever it might be. Today we'll present ideas how that could actually happen, but would love to actually start seeing what that looks like in day-to-day practices within such a giant system. So again we've moved forward, we have movement in workforce development under one roof, under one deputy mayor. We have the right players in place. And now your organizations need to start thinking much more collaboratively how you can tap into this system as well, and how on our side we push people like the mayor and people like the mayor's office to be putting dollars into that collaboration.

>> Gregory Morris: The only thing I would add, if you've had any length of time in the workforce development space, and I certainly during the course of my career I helped to be engaged in developing some programs and working with funders, whether it be city agencies, whether it be educational institutions, philanthropy, et cetera. You know, mayors come to the table and talk about how it is that they see. The last administration talked about career pathways that was an Mississippi and focus and desire. And before that there was a resetting about some of the ways we think about the department of employment and some of the recasting of some of the other parts and that helps to get us to the place where we've got 23 agencies with a hand in workforce development.

I mention all that to say I'm excited at this point when our mayor says I've helped to make connection that's resulted in dollars for apprenticeship. That was new. That's real news, a meaningful thing. You as provides know apprenticeships can be fantastic pathways. You hear investments in industries

and construction. You think yes, that's another great pathway, that can mean something for the folks we might connect with, we might build relationships with and help them find success. When we talk about tech investments, all those things, those are encouraging. Like it's encouraging to hear about an executive order that says, in writing, we want to reset the workforce models and systems because they don't work. And to Annie's point, using language like inclusive matters, economic mobility matters. Equity matters. That's good stuff.

But the track record doesn't always show, meaning if you think about the different administrations that we've had, we are still struggling to I think fix a system that is -- we're still struggling to fix a system that we can start by saying we're not in a no wrong door entry type of thing.

You start at one place, you end up in three different places and we're not coherent, we're not consistent and we're not creating true long-term paths to success. So there's been some good news, good press releases, good commitments about dollars. But we're familiar with some of this before. So the challenge for this body and the workforce task force is to really think about how to execute on that, to hold our mayor and our leadership and ourselves accountable for actually steering in a difference than something we've seen before

>> Ben Max: As we wrap up our short time together here, I'm say on behalf of the conversation, thank you again to Annie for your service.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: Thank you.

>> Ben Max: Greg will get a lot more future words. Annie, a public word of advice here in closing? Something you want to see him taking forward, humorous or otherwise?

>> Annie Garneva: I gave it to him two days ago, lean into being the best person that you already are, not trying to be a different type of person we all have something to offer. And really think about when you say things like equity

matters or inclusivity matters. I'm a big language person, I'm an immigrant so my brain is constantly spinning in different directions.

But I also take those words very literally and seriously. So when we put our policy forward, we have to be very, very choosy and provide specific examples and definitions of what we mean and push other people who are actually having the power and decision-making to follow on with that path.

So again, the blueprint is you all. This is the first time, at least in my short ten years, that I've seen so much of the language that we've written together, show up in the policy space. So that has now opened the door for us to actually say cool, you've said the words. What does the policy look like? And Greg needs to now ask you all, not just two levels of sentences about policy, but what does it look like on the ground.

So back to you all, you need to tell us what implementation looks like. What does a non-siloed system look like? How much money do you want for collaboration? How do you actually live and breathe this work? Because we are just the kind of the megaphone. We're just the emails and opening the doors. Ultimately we can't do it without you. We are nothing without the actual coalition. So always lean into other people.

>> Ben Max: All right. Thank you.

>> Annie Garneva: We're going to introduce our next panel. Ben is going to stay here.

>> Thank you for coming out, Ben. We appreciate it.

>> Ben Max: Let's have our next panel come up. I get the easy job of staying here.

>> Gregory Morris: We have a tremendous afternoon set up, and I know the morning was very intense and we had a lot of really exciting speakers. We really dig in this afternoon so please keep your energy and spirit up. And here's a great way to start. Because I would like to welcome Angela Pinsky. She is the head of government affairs and public policy at Google New York.

She wants to present some information on the New York City tech fund. So I would love for you to give a round of applause to Angela.

[Applause]

>> Angela Pinsky: Hi, good afternoon, everyone. Thank you, Greg and congratulations on your new role here at the NYCETC. Your announcement coincides with an important inflection point and I'm excited to see what your experience, perspective and leadership bring to the organization and to the workforce ecosystem.

Again my name is Angela Pinsky I'm the head of government affairs and public policy for Google New York. But I'm also a former city employee, a former head of a nonprofit, a lifelong economic developer. So the room and today's discussions and seeing so many smart and motivated minds engaged on these important issues have been music to my eyes and ears, so thank you everyone.

It is also why I'm excited to announce today that Google.org has provided a \$1 million grant to NYCETC. The \$1 million is to identify gaps in the workforce development system and over the upcoming month we with NYCETC will be granting funds to organizations like yours to help address those gaps.

It is part of Google's tech opportunity fund strategy to create pathways to careers in tech for all New Yorkers who seek it.

So what is the fund for? During COVID all of us, but especially everyone in this room, had to pivot to the new normal. And in a lot of ways many of you had to be everything and do everything for your communities. And hopefully in this post-COVID world I'm hoping that this grant can help the city and NYC ETC better assess where you will all pivot to and what you will do differently and go back to.

And then figure out the best ways to work collaboratively and focus our organizations on what we do best together. So why are we doing this? Just a few weeks ago Google as a company celebrated its 24th birthday. It's hard to imagine that a company like Google would barely be old enough to drink. But that is symbolic of the tech sector. It is a relatively young industry. We are

seeing in one generation, a whole new set of needs, curriculum, skills, and opportunities enter into the landscape. The great news is that these jobs are attainable. Over 40% of the jobs in the tech ecosystem do not require a bachelor's degree and they pay well. Jobs in the tech ecosystem pay over 40% better than other industries and taken together tech jobs represent a promising pathway to good paying careers for many.

But all of this does put the responsibility back on us. The public sector, the education system, the nonprofit sector and the private sector, to work together better to address these needs. And I for one am excited to see your faces today and I'm excited to get to work with all of you. Thank you so much.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: Thank you very much. That is an extraordinary commitment and we are going to put that to work and you will all hear more about our plans as the weeks rolled ahead. Another round of applause to the tech sector and to NYCETC. Super secretly, this is my most favorite panel of the day. These folks are difference makers in a variety of ways and what they bring to the table presents the different sectors and different thinking that's going to drive us forward in many ways. This is the post-pandemic economy and skills for the 21st century economy panel. Angie Kamath, Matthew Klein, Merrill Pond, Angela Pinsky who you've met, and of course, Ben Max continues his conversations with our team.

Once again if you can give this crew a round of applause I would be grateful. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> Ben Max: All right. That was an exciting announcement. So a lot to build off of there. Thank you all for being here. So if you could each take two minutes and hold yourselves back from solutions and ideas for the future in this initial answer, but just take two minutes each and talk about how you see the sort of economic landscape right now, the workforce workplace landscape in New York City, and beyond if you would like. But sort of set the stage how you're thinking

about it from your perspective, your organization's perspective. Where we're sort of at right now. It's been referred to by some as a very mixed-signals moment. There's been a lot of growth, a lot of fears of recession, maybe we're already in recession, et cetera, et cetera. Where are we? Merrill, go ahead.

>> Merrill Pond: I think right now we're at a tenuous point in the economy. We came through the pandemic with an uneven impact across different sectors as many of you know. The city's economy actually did quite well, because the highest-paying jobs were able to be done remotely. Wall street was strong. Now we're shifting. And Wall Street is not doing well and we're seeing lots of hiring freezes happen at these top financial firms which is important because that sector represents about 75% of personal income tax revenues for the city which support a lot of the programs and organizations that you all work from and we support.

I think the Great Resignation is over. I think now we're seeing people taking account of where they're sitting, their jobs. They're fearful of losing jobs at all levels. I think we're at a very much of a tipping point.

>> Ben Max: Thank you. Matt?

>> Matthew Klein: First of all, thank you for having me. It's a pleasure to be with you and all the folks in this room who are Robin Hood's heros. You are doing the work. To state the obvious but first and foremost the pandemic hit the folks we care about the hardest. Higher job loss for those who are low income, Black, Latino. Slower recovery for those same groups.

On the plus side, going into the pandemic we saw wage growth on the bottom, which was the first time in a long time increasing share wage growth was going to the low end.

And more recently we've seen pressures wages just go up.

One thing to notice the impact to the minimum wage has been extraordinarily positive, and that's a key aspect that affects so many of the folks we care about.

Similarly, lots of concerns going forward. So we're at the moment now where, as hard as it is, it's likely to get harder we have at this point folks coming back to

the labor market at the lower end which is good, attracted in part by the lift in wages. But going forward there's obviously an intentional attempt, given the concern folks have about inflation, to tamp down that economic growth.

That's an intentional effort to slow hiring and potentially to head into layoffs. That's really troublesome and worrying for folks. So I think we're heading into a tough spot.

>> Ben Max: Thank you. Angie?

>> Great. Thanks to the coalition for having this event and welcome and congratulations to Greg Morris for his leadership in the organization.

So I won't repeat what my really smart colleagues have said, but I'm usually very optimistic so I will kind of put an optimistic view out there. Which is --

>> Ben Max: We needed that.

>> I'm going to try. I don't know if it's going to be compelling or true.

>> Ben Max: I almost asked you for it but I had a feeling.

>> Angie Kamath: We are on the cusp of a great recession, yes. What I will say about New York and the moment we're in with new leadership, there are outlines things that grow. There are always recession proof areas and there's always growth.

We're looking at major infrastructure investments across the country and I think that's really important. Critical sectors. Again, all of us here, when times get tough as Matt said, folks look to nonprofit organizations. They look to community-based organizations. There are teacher shortages. There's shortages in healthcare. We were just looking backstage in the green room, 250,000 open jobs in New York City right now.

So there are opportunities. It might not be plan A for anyone, but there absolutely are always opportunities. And we know in infrastructure, in healthcare, in education, in community-based organizations and nonprofits, there's a lot going on. Also within the creative academy there's a lot going on right now, those are smaller amounts are jobs maybe thousands rather than tens of thousands, but we have to play the long game here

and I think maybe we'll talk about this a little later in our conversation. But there's short-term relief that we have to make sure we're poised to give. But there's a long game here in terms of diversifying the New York City economy and we reinvent ourselves as a city every I would say two decades and we are at this moment where we absolutely have to reinvent ourselves. There's opportunities we can see squarely and we have to make sure that we are playing the short game and the long game.

So I think that again critical moment right now, and we can see pretty clear what's in front of us and we can't freak out about it. We have to plan for it and make sure that front lines are covered, but make sure that we are not spending all of our time dealing in a really short-term focused manner, because we're going to miss out on really important infrastructure-building opportunities and infrastructure kind of meaning in the widest sense possible.

>> Ben Max: Thank you. Angela?

>> Angela Pinsky: I'll take a page from Angie's book. When I started working in economic development now decades ago, our number one objective for New York was to diversify the economy. I think in that sense we've come a long way.

After 2009 with the financial crisis, I had a lot of very panicky moments where I was looking for someone to tell me the answer and someone gave a speech which I'll always remember which is that New York has these natural disasters, has these man made disasters, but each in its history it's come out stronger and I believe that's going to be the case again too. The question is are we going to make smart decisions as we rebuild.

I think we have a lot of opportunities right now, again, there's a lot of stimulus dollars floating around that will eventually make its way down to a person level that we should be encouraging people to look at strategically. We have interesting moments like the fact that students in the public school systems have more computers than they've ever had in history. And what can we do to make the most of those moments. So I think it's up to us to kind of, you know, again, assess and pivot quickly and adapt to these changing times and opportunities.

To make the most of what's in front of us.

>> Ben Max: I don't know if I've ever moderated a panel where everybody did what I asked and you stuck right to the assessment. I'm happy. That was really great. So now let's get into some of where we should head, where we are headed. The point about there still being a lot of federal stimulus money in New York, in New York City, in New York State around while there's a lot of concerns around dropping tax revenue there's still a lot of that money plus the infrastructure law money, the inflation reduction act that's hopefully going to make a big difference in terms of economic development.

Before we get into some of those sort of policy solutions and so forth, let's talk about skills. The title of our panel here, post-pandemic economy and skills for the 21st century. So what skills are employers valuing right now? Those hundreds of thousands of open jobs, are there certain skill types that are most prominent? What are we seeing right now in terms of that landscape for what workforce development organizations really need to be thinking about in terms of skilled development, up skilling and so forth? As far as I'm concerned, anybody can jump in but it's also cool to just go in the same order again.

>> Angy: I'm happy to start. I think this is probably at this point this is four years old and I want to say burning glass had a skills wheel and I feel like I've seen it attributed to other organizations. There are three sets of skills. There is business enabling skills, there's technical skills and there's human skills. And those are -- so again examples of business enabling are project management.

Excel and kind of data types of skills. On the technology skills, whether it's coding or data analytics, rather than kind of data kind of management. And on the human skills, just really good time management, really good surprisery skills, we'll good communications skills.

If I had a dime for every time an employer said I'll train them in technical skills, I just need someone who shows up on time. Raise your hand if you've heard that and are sick of hearing that. It's not really about that. So I think the skills have to be something in each of those three categories, the human, the

technical and the business enabling. So again it could be any version of those, but I do this, which it's an educational system, whether it's in a college system, a post-secondary system or nonprofit job training system we have to work on some skills that are in all of those categories. I think it's not one track. I think whether you're in healthcare, education or manufacturing or supply chain, you still need human skills, you need some technical skills and you need some business enabling skills

>> Merrill Pond: I would add to that, the shift I've been seeing in the last couple of years, really in the last year, employers wanting employees who can be flexible and have all of those three different buckets, but also have the human skill and business skill to change because the jobs are changing so quickly. And employers are asking employees to shift on the go.

And I will say just project management comes up as number one in almost every single sector. And that to me is flexibility. Because that's what you're doing as a project manager you're pulling together different people, you're figuring out whose strength is where and figuring out what needs to happen when and that's all about flexibility

>> Matthew Klein: I'll just say I don't pretend to know what every business in every sector is looking for. I agree with the general statements being made. It does say for me that, as folks who are outside of that specific -- we need to be close to is doing the hiring. I know this group is sector-based, employer engaged. Being able to be close to the folks who are doing the hiring to have them tell us what they need and program models linked to that as well. Adding to the general list learning how to learn. That goes with the flexibility, things do change so much. So demonstrating and having people understand that that's a life-long approach.

>> Angela Pinsky: Yeah. The one other intangible I throw in there is the problem-solving skills. As a person who participates in a program as someone you need to know how to problem-solve what does that mean, I have no idea how to learn that skill. But I think what has become a norm is the project-based

learning experience.

So the apprentice model, the internship model, being able to work on a team in an environment where you're replicating the actual types of work experiences that you will face has become a critically important component of some of these training programs.

>> Merrill Pond: Which is why the DOE's initiative embedded career learning from 9th grade does two things. One, slight touch in 9th grade for both the person and employer. You have to bring the employers along and let them figure out how this works too, and moving up through internships and apprenticeships in the 12th grade and even into CUNY or their postsecondary which I think is critical. What Angie is saying, you're not going to get where you need without those skills.

>> Ben Max: In a past life I was a high school teacher and project-based learning was everybody's favorite thing. Teacher, students, and clearly so helpful for future endeavors. And yet undervalued across the board in many, many places and ways.

So that ties into the landscape of workforce development programs. Higher education, K12, you're mentioning the DOE. If you would each sort of assess a little bit where we're at, but what are some changes, maybe something that's a little bit low-hanging fruit, something that's big idea, to change things, and to improve the ways that people are being prepared in New York for the jobs that are available for these skills that you just outlined. Maybe you each have one and one, a lower hanging fruit solution and a big idea. What's on your mind, in terms of advancing things?

>> Merrill Pond: I'm going to disappoint you we decided in the green room there's no low-hanging fruit. If there was low-hanging fruit it all wouldn't have happened.

>> Ben Max: Big ideas, only. Angela, go ahead start us.

>> Angela Pinsky: I'm relatively new to the tech sector. In my time at Google what I've realized is that the demand for skills in tech is so very, very strong

everywhere. And so what I'm seeing is that a lot of the tech companies themselves are starting to produce a lot of content for learning and teaching, and they're developing a lot of the curriculum for creating skill sets in people that they want to then employ.

And that is something that I haven't seen, at least in the other sectors that I've worked in. And I think it's an interesting model. It kind of fractures the different sources of where these curriculum can come from, but I also think it presents an opportunity.

What I also am observing is that Google as a company, it sort of -- I call it the last mile of delivery. That trusted partner to the person who could potentially be someone who acquires these skills, who doesn't know that they want to work in the sector, doesn't fully understand. It's very hard for a company like Google to adapt to every market that it's in to provide those skills.

So that bridge is a critical component for us to rely on the nonprofit sector, the public sector heavily in order to do well.

New York, I think, has a ton of really great organizations. Not as many -- not a lot of cities or places have sort of the infrastructure that we do. So I think in a lot of ways New York can be a model that can be replicated in other places if we can do this well.

>> Matthew Klein: Just two things that come to mind. I mean one is basics. Getting more folks who otherwise wouldn't get good jobs into good jobs.

And second is making more jobs good jobs. The two go hand in hand. I'm getting more folks, it's all the stuff we've been talking about all day. And some of the -- I mean to give credit to the administration and the future of work, I do think they are pointing at critical pieces of doing more of what works, of using data to do that, of integrating different education and workforce systems.

All things that are very easy to say, very hard to do.

On the making more jobs good jobs, we can't lose sight. The minimum wage again moved more people out of poverty than almost anything except child tax credit. With inflation we need to be thinking about time that minimum wage

increased, inflation increased so it doesn't continue to erode. We need to think about classification challenges in the sector.

So there's got to be a similar effort to make jobs that people are getting better jobs. Robin Hood is a funder of the families and workers fund the coalition came out with what a definition of a good job is, economic security and opportunities for mobility but also voice and choice for workers. So that's got to be part of our dialogue as we think about the workforce environment.

>> Angie Kamath: I'm going to jump in. Two ideas, at a macro level terrifies me if you look at all the economic data when we're at 3.2 days in the office, that is a huge economic hit to the city in terms of our tax revenue.

We really have to shore up getting folks to work. So if you believe that to be true, I've got two ideas. One is I think we need to figure out as a city kind of at scale 24 hours, 7-day a week child care. We cannot figure out our local economy, I believe, without figuring out child care. And it's incredibly important. You look at that could involve policy recommendations in terms of where and how child care and types of facilities that we can use for child care, but I think we cannot imagine kind of full and robust and inclusive economy without that. So I do think it's low-hanging fruit. It's hard work, but it's so obvious. And I actually think it's so critical.

The other piece on the education side. That's the short game. The long game for me I've become mildly obsessed with I would say the durable skill of design thinking. Years ago we had security science for all. I think design thinking for all. The reason why I love this it gives people agency, it teaches people how to be a entrepreneur. You can apply design thinking to yourself, to your life to your community to your education, to your family to a business idea and I think that getting skills like that into our elementary schools, middle schools, high schools, colleges, I think as we look at baby boomer age bubbles, as you look at people at or nearing retirement helping them to be entrepreneurs through a design thinking lens would be important. Design thinking for all would be my second idea.

>> Merrill Pond: I think that goes into the flexibility we were talking about as well. That teaches you to you to be a flexible thinker and work within your career pathway no matter which way the road goes.

Two things, one big ping tour one smaller picture. Big picture this is starting to happen we need to start thinking about the workforce development system as over here and education as over here. K-12 is workforce development. That is what it is.

[Applause]

So we need -- and that's starting to happen. I think earlier today the future of workers task force, you heard a bit about the work they're doing. They're the the table, that group is pulling together, DOE, CUNY, Angie, et cetera as well as the workforce development you and employers. That's a good start.

Hopefully we can get to a system where all of the systems within the system speak to each other so we can see where people end up and then direct them in the right way, whether they fled to go to a workforce development for skills force training. I also think picking up on Angela's idea of using the material that's coming out of the private sector.

You see it in every sector, tech is one of of the stars in it. A lot of companies have material they want to share and it can't just be a one-off. It can't be just Google goes in for a day and does one thing. It has to be consistent throughout the school year. And also into the workforce development organizations. Like why not? I know the schools are always the easier target for that stuff, but let's broaden it out and get the private sector more engaged and the workforce development on day to day.

>> Ben Max: So you each have under a minute for this last one and unfortunately we have to wrap up. There's a lot of -- you're getting at this a bit. There's a lot of players on the field here. There's organizations representing this room obviously, which may or may not include some of the following: CUNY, the mayor's office, state government, on and on. Lots of players on the field here, because this is talking about all of society basically, right?

Name one entity that needs to start thinking differently about something, or some way of doing things, some way of thinking that needs to change somewhere in this larger ecosystem, the socioeconomic reality that it exists right now. There's a lot of reinvention happening, post-pandemic economy, task forces, et cetera. Who's got to start thinking differently about something? Matt, start us off here.

>> Matthew Klein: All right. Look, I'll say ourselves, private philanthropy. I think one of the -- and I know it's come up today. And some of the points have been made today. New York has it all. We have the strong organizations, we have the civic kind of perspective and philosophy that focuses and cares about equity. We have enormous resources and capabilities.

We also don't have enough like working up together or honoring the resources that it takes to work together. So to Angie's point around child care, child care is a huge driver on whether or not people can be successful in entering the labor force. So, by the way, is mental health access. So, by the way, is having stipends to be able to participate. So is emergency cash to be able to -- so there are the elements that are present in the city represented by different organizations, and it's so hard, because we're all so busy, to think about the connections.

>> Ben Max: I'm getting --

>> Matthew Klein: More work together and philanthropy has to be a part of that.

>> Ben Max: You're getting applause and I have to cut you off. It's not a good situation. Angie?

>> Angie Kamath: I'll take a cue from you. Higher education, everything about our business and financial model is for degrees and we have to wake up finally to the fact that we need postsecondary pathways that are affordable for individuals that give real skills that can lead to jobs. And I think postsecondary institutions were just not structured for it. I don't know how long or what it's going to take, but there's a role of government, there's a role of philanthropy to think about that economic and financial model that really rewards and pays and

makes accessible non-degree postsecondary pathways. I don't understand why we don't have that yet. Again there's a lot of advocacy and TAP and other places but we have to figure this out.

>> Angela Pinsky: I used to work in real estate and real estate in New York was a New York-centric activity. The portfolio was in New York, the people who lived anytime and worked in it was New York. The workers came from New York and it was all about New York. And so therefore there's a participation and a willingness and an ability to participate in New York-specific things when that comes up.

Now I work for a global company and I'm getting some insights into how a global company looks at the different places that it's in. And a home city definitely has more of a presence than a place where the company is not. But it thinks about hiring differently than New York-centric-based organizations. And I think when we design programs, we have to start thinking about how many more global companies we have, and if they are migrating to this new way of thinking about hiring, can we adapt to how they look at it.

The other thing too, and this is a general comment, I used to work in nonprofits and I work in the private sector now. I would like us all to stop looking for new ideas and start assessing programs that work but need some tweaks or keep funding the programs that have been working, as opposed to starting something brand new. I think it's really tempting when there's new money on the table, but I would hope we can all hold hands on that one together

>> Merrill Pond: I second that. We have another report that says we have to do skills training and et cetera et cetera. We don't have to do that anymore. We know what the problems are. The right people are at the table and I'll take a cue from my panel members on the private sector side, getting rid of degree requirements is not enough. We need to look beyond that and move hiring from nontraditional pathways out of CSR.

This is happening, it's happening a little bit more slowly than I would have hoped but we'll get there. I think the main point is that every group that's

involved in this system needs to be thinking differently. And needs to realize that we need to work towards a career pathway's goal. Whatever career that individual wants, that's where we need to get them and that starts with good jobs

>> Ben Max: We went a little over, but I think that was pretty worth it. Thank you panelists.

[Applause]

Just in kicking it to Greg, I'll say as a political journalist listening to that, I'm hearing in those ideas some of the pressure points to really work with leaders on pushing government on. And that's your new job, so congratulations.

>> Gregory Morris: Got my hands full. Favorite panel of the day, I told you. Thank you very much. One more round of applause. Pivoting. Secret words to stay here in this crowd. I think if you say the words stipends, round of applause for that, I would guess, right?

[Applause] we're already doing good stuff, we don't need new stuff. I heard that. Just checking

This solution set is an interesting one for us to bring to the table. This is about bridging the college-to-career gap through mentorship and foundational 21st century skills. I'm pleased to introduce Kilsys Payamps-Rore the founding executive director for Braven in New York City. Round of applause.

>> Good afternoon, everyone. I just want to make sure that I know how to use this clicker. There we go. My name is Kilsys Kilsys Payamps-Roure.

So in America, each year there's 1.3 million low income first generation students that enrolled, but only 900,000 graduate and secure strong opportunity. 900,000. These are students that bought into the narrative that as long as you go to college you're on the path to the American promise and income equality. But that's not the case. They've done everything right. They've earned the right to compete, but they're really facing significant challenges that doesn't allow them to get a role that's worthy of a degree, and often they're overlooked in the workforce development space

So while a college degree is still the surest path to up yard economic social

mobility in this country, underrepresented students, students who are first generation, students who identify as a person of color and students who come from low income backgrounds, they often need additional career preparation that their wealthier peers just have more access and exposure to.

So at Braven we've identified four gaps that we help our students close. The first gap is skills. Keep preparations to those skills that we know employers are looking for. These are skills that students are expected to have mastered, but typically they're just not taught.

The second gap is battling stereotype and imposter syndrome. They are expected to understand and be able to leverage their personal assets but they're not really taught how to do that.

The third gap is access to professional experiences. Employers look at internships as a gauge of career readiness, yet underrepresented students, first generation students, they often don't have access to these experiences. To put this in perspective, at large public units, students who are first generation are 13% less likely to have internships than their peers.

And then the last gap that we help to close is those networks, that social capital. Our students are often lack access to the network of people who will mentor, who will endorse them and open up those professional opportunities. These gaps all tie together. Mentorships can help students gain and expand their networks. Via those networks they're more likely to learn about opportunities which will help them to develop those skills that employees are looking for and honing those skills and gaining those experiences really helps to lift up their confidence.

So here in New York City, we're seeing these gaps play out. In New York City, 68% of the population identifies as a person of color. But yet in a high-growth industry like finance, managerial roles isn't reflective of that.

Only 6% of managerial roles by someone who identifies as Latin X. We have all this talent in our own backyard in our city that is not being tapped into.

So Braven is a national not-for-profit, I have the honor and the privilege of

servicing as the executive director for Braven here in New York City. We partner up with universities and with employers in order to support underrepresented students from college to career.

We are embedded within higher-ed as a 3-credit course, during which our students that we call fellows are empowered with the skills, with experience, with the confidence and with the networks. That social capital that is needed in order for them to transition from college to a strong economic opportunity.

So these are the 20% of the skills that we focus on. Self-driven leading, problem-solving, operating and managing, network and communicating and working in teams. These are skills that students are likely not going to learn in an accounting class, in a sociology class, in a psychology class.

But they're needed in order to navigate and succeed in the workplace.

So these competencies that I just went over, they're woven into all facets of the Braven program. And then additionally, across the whole Braven experience, partnerships with employers really play a key role in fueling it with the volunteers that are necessary in order to provide mentorship and open up doors of opportunities for our fellows.

So these volunteers include roles such as leadership coach, the leadership coach is the main facilitator throughout the 15-week course in a college setting. And also roles like professional mentor, which are people that volunteer in order to coach our fellows once they take the course.

So I'm going to give you a breakdown how we embed 21st century skills and also mentorship throughout the course.

The first part of the course is design your career. We help fellows create their own core value story. The importance of this is they're often told what their story is, as opposed to them deciding the story they want to tell. Too often people try to write our story based on things like race or income bracket or language that we speak. They're making assumptions about us.

But by telling their own stories, fellows can take back that narrative and determine how others understand who they are. And by knowing who they are,

and telling their story, fellows practice skills employers are looking for. Like authentic leadership, like communication.

During the second part of the course, fellows work on those key artifacts that are really necessary when they're going out they're looking for internships and jobs. Their Linked In profile, their cover letter and resume and so forth. They later put these things to use as they apply for jobs, internships and as they network.

We also host a mock interview night where fellows practice their interviewing skills. This is a real high return and low stakes environment for them. They get to engage with local volunteer professionals. They get to incorporate the feedback immediately when it comes to interviewing, and they're opening up the New Yorks by engaging with these professionals, which is really important. -- networks.

The last piece of the course is the challenge. By the end of this fellows get to practice all of the 21st century skills that I spoke about before. They participate in a design thinking exercise called the capstone challenge. They solve a real-world business problem that a local company poses. Throughout the five weeks students take roles within a group. Which is really key.

This is similar to how you would engage on a team and take roles when you're working on a project at work. So it talks to them having an experience that would help them on their career journey. It allows them to practice the leadership, the problem solving, the networking and communicating, the operating and managing and working in teams.

Students present their solutions before a panel of judges that includes the sponsor organization. This is also another opportunity for them to tap into networks. Because they're actually engaging with the sponsor company. Some of our capstone sponsors have been wait watchers, Brooks brothers. This is an amazing opportunity.

This past school year alone, nationally at Braven, there have been 1,700 volunteers that have contributed over 23 thousand hours. Here in New York

City, we've had 324 volunteers that have contributed more than 4,000 hours. This is fantastic because these are mentors that are opening up their networks and are also coaching students on their path.

So at Braven we really believe that the college-to-career gap is a solvable problem, though it's a big one. We believe this because we've seen thousands of students transition from college to strong economic opportunities.

In 2021-2022, 680 Braven fellows graduated from college. They are out-pacing their peers nationally by 15 percentage points within six months of graduating from college. So what that means is 61% of our fellows got a strong first job or got into grad school within six months of graduating, versus 46% of their peers that are in our public universities.

And then what's also key to note is that 55% of graduates are out-earning their parents within their very first job out of college.

To put this in perspective, by age 30, most Americans have about a 50/50 shot of out-earning their parents.

So whether you are an employer, a college, or a university, an individual, we can really help to level the playing field for our talented young people. Together, and really with great intentionality, we can close the wealth and opportunity gap that exists not only in the United States, but right here in our own backyard in our city, in New York City. So thank you so much for allowing me to share on how Braven is helping to solve the college-to-career gap.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva. . Give her another round of applause. One of the best outcomes I've definitely seen in the field. Excellent. Next up we have another solution. It is my pleasure to introduce the next solution called the emerging leaders program -- opening doors to new careers for people with convictions. Please welcome Ed Lucus with the Center for Employment Opportunities.

>> Ed-Lucus: Okay. I was going to do this off the top of my head but I know I can't stay within 8 minutes so I'm going to do this by going through a script.

Good afternoon, everyone. And it is truly an honor to be here. To be able to

speak to fellow colleagues and leaders of New York City, my hometown. One of the best cities in the world.

To the CEO that's in the house, as well as board of directors of.

My manager asked me if I would be interested in speaking today, it was like an excitement. I haven't been on this stage in a while. COVID came, the pandemic. And so we weren't able to really be around people in public. And then also virtual meetings came out. I wish I would have invested in Zoom stock, because I think I would not be here as CEO right now.

But all jokes aside, this is a great segue to share some of what the CEO does. And a brief history of CEO, starting in New York City back in the '70s. It was a demonstration program through Vera institute of Justice. And in 1996, it became an independent 501(c)(3).

There we go.

So in 1996, it became an independent 501(c)(3). It started out with one site and it actually grew and grew into 12 states, 31 sites and we serve over 8,000 people every year, and then some.

And we have made more than 34,000 placements. With individuals that have been incarcerated.

So I want to share a story about a young man that made some bad mistakes at a young age. And spent 25 years in prison. Paying his dues to society, while incarcerated. He had a plan to use this time to develop himself. And started his educational journey.

First obtaining his GED. And his associate's degree, bachelor's degree, and even his master's degree. While incarcerated.

So upon his release, he struggled seeking employment. But then he was instructed, and introduced to go to CEO. He enrolled into the program as a participant. And was working general labor on CEO's work crew. He wanted more, and we wanted more for him. He had put in the work, in his education, character, and he had served his time.

But we struggled to help him break through into the employment world. And

so he was introduced and he applied to the ELP program. Program-seeking and looking for something more in his career.

As an ELP member, he had the opportunity to work on CEOs -- in CEO's IT department. And for 12 weeks, while also completing Google IT professional certification program, he also paired with CEO's CEO, Sam Shafer who was also a mentor to him.

So one of the things that I love about CEO and this ELP program is that our executive leadership team, our leadership team, mentor the individuals that come into this program. And that's one of the priorities that we put in front of all the ELP members.

I would like to introduce you to Andre who is that person. So this is Andre blocker.

So going into the ELP program. The ELP program is a 12-week intense program. It's like an apprenticeship and training program, where they go through three aspects. Our goal is to boost economic mobility of ELP members, respond to feedback for more pay, support CEO teams with additional staff capacity, and the most important one is walk the talk. If you're talking about it, be about it.

And that's one of the things that CEO has done is inclusive hiring, and bringing in participants with full-time employment. These individuals are making 10 dollars, \$15 an hour, now making \$50,000, \$60,000 full benefits.

The way CEO has it and the key program elements, on the job learning, general professional development. And as I talked a little about, mentoring. The mentoring is about a one-hour per week with their mentor. The general professional develop. There's two days that they attend for two and a half, three hours on a Tuesday and a Thursday, and the rest is on-the-job learning and actually doing different jobs depending on the pathway that they use. There's an IT pathway, vocational pathway, we have an advocacy pathway, a supported service pathway, as well as social enterprise which is working on crews.

So specific job skills, they learn Salesforce. A database that a lot of

employers and organizations use within their own businesses.

We also teach them about security skills, IT. We teach them Google Suite. We teach them basically how to manage a calendar. The biggest thing is a mind set. Changing their mind set and getting them to understand that they are better than just having a labor intense job. Bring them into the human service field, bring them in to workforce development. Bring them into IT. Bring them into more professional jobs which are more a career than just a job. So what's next? CEO policy priorities. Paid training is critical for people. The immediate financial support for people when they come home is a critical bridge. Helping them address their immediate needs and create a pathway to permanent employment. Apprenticeship programs should consider the life experience of the candidate as it relates to the specialization of the apprenticeship.

And not create unnecessary education for work experience barriers that are not relevant to their training. Many individuals experience employment discrimination, even after they have training programs and have advanced certifications. We must ensure these qualified individuals have equitable opportunities regardless of their pasts.

So in closing a call to action is what I'm asking for every person in this audience and I would love for you to pledge, walk that talk. And consider partnering with and bringing the ELP program such as ours, and to fight for policy change that affect the people that we serve. Thank you very much.

[Applause]

I did not know a lot about NYCETC. So I practiced NYCETC. I really did. Those acronyms they was a tongue twister. But the way I learned it was using R-E-S-P-E-C-T. Saying N-Y-C-E-T-C. Like I said I appreciate everyone's attention and you know let's get out there and do the work.

I did that in 8 minutes? All right.

>> Annie Garneva: Wow another applause.

Was more popular than the mayor, it sounded like.

Next up with a big job to follow Ed is Bryan Lozano talking about the

partnering for impact, the Per Scholas model. Take it away, Bryan.

>> Bryan Lozano: Amazing. I heard that Ed got so much applause and laughter, so if you guys don't, just wait. My name is Bryan Lozano I'm the senior director for partnerships in Per Scholas in New York. It's a 25--year-old national nonprofit in the Bronx we connect our leading talent to leading businesses.

Like many of you -- there it is. Like many of you during the pandemic, we shifted to remote options for our learners. It was a steep learning curve to figure out ways to make sure the service delivery and the training and virtual support services for the classes were the same.

And on top of that the barriers of technology and access to broadband for our learners. But it forced us to create new and more accessible options for network New Yorkers and Americans across the country.

As a technology-driven nonprofit, we saw an opportunity to continue driving toward accessibility as a human service organization, we understood by experience the gaps that exist that prevent our learners from either succeeding or taking our classes in the first place. We know that one of the biggest barriers of entry into our program is location and transportation. Where you live should not dictate whether you have access to programs and services like ours in this city.

So I'm excited to talk about a model that we piloted actually originally in Dallas, that connects New York. This is a cool photo about that, that really hopes to bridge the gap there.

Let me start with a learner story. This is Ron Domingo. Ron lives with his family in Staten Island. He is an actor by trade. The pandemic forced him to rethink his life and how he's spending his time with his career. He was working at Amazon and he was talking to employees and they were telling him look at an A plus certification. He did his research and found out about per Scholas.

He knew there were campuses in Newark and the Bronx that were cost and time prohibitive for him to think about us. If Ron were to commute to the Bronx from where he lives, it would be an over 2-hour commute on public transit and

over 1-hour plus commute by driving with tolls.

Back in January he revisited his research and found out we were doing a partnership with the JCC and built a classroom there and that was 10 minutes away from his home. Ron joined our second cohort ever at the JCC and he graduated this past July.

And more importantly, I'm excited that Ron and a bunch of the graduates were also offered first-time ever IT support jobs, their first jobs in technology, right on the island.

[Applause]

Staten Island represents just 1% all of our learners annually in New York City. The reason why we created this model was to create an opportunity and invest in maybe neighborhoods that need programs like ours. We don't know what we don't know. I love it. We don't know what we don't know when it comes to neighborhoods that we don't have pipe lines and partnerships in. So that's where this model comes in.

The satellite model aims to identify training partners in neighborhoods underinvested with tech can career training programs. We work with parents, they offer us space, and we rely on them, on their expertise and history in a neighborhood, to build local pipeline-to-talent. From there we configure the classrooms, we connect it to our training to a blended learning model and we create scales of economy by working together to combine our services to provide learning support and professional development coaching to our learners. Importantly the key for our partners is building expertise in technology which is a first for many of our partners. And I cannot just thank the partners that we've been able to work with. We've been so lucky to work with incredible partners. We first piloted this with the team at Commonpoint. Shout-out to them. Also go Mets. There's always next year. I'm a Queens kid. I like that there's no applause for that. How dare you.

We also piloted with the JCC with a team of cathy and Amelia and this year we launched with the Isaac center. And lastly, we just launched our most recent

class with cypress hill. Our first ever-in east New York. I see that team over there. If you haven't been to that building, it's incredible and the work they do is amazing and all our partners are amazing and we've been lucky to have them.

Our classrooms are based on a WebEx and Cisco framework. We have a front and back camera that is completely customizable. Ceiling microphones are able to capture learners, and coaches and we have a fellow dedicated to work as an entire staff to make sure our learners from both sides and both boroughs in this case are connected.

You can see from the photo on the left, our senior instructor is teaching an IT support lesson right now. If you look closely on the right is the class in Queens. Behind him is actually our Brooklyn campus which is where he's located. On the right is our campus with Commonpoint Queens as they're getting instruction and the teaching fellow as they go through the course.

And the early findings of this model are incredibly impactful. As you can see in the chart on the left, in 2019 the vast bulk of our learners were coming from the Bronx, then Brooklyn, then Manhattan, then Queens and Staten Island. This makes sense a lot were word of mouth and a lot of them were living near our campuses in the Bronx and Brooklyn. Fast forward to 21, we launched a satellite in these neighborhoods and we're seeing a huge increase in enrollment to over 600 New Yorkers and on top of that, more demonstrable equity distribution within the five boroughs including a notable increase in Queens and a 500% increase in Staten Island. The important part of the early findings it adheres to our KPI success. A starting average salary of \$21 an hour.

This model is centered on the idea of how we think impact can be done at scale. Through partnerships and through technology.

We can't thank our partners enough for the first time in our history we are in all five boroughs.

[Applause]

Now while we think this is a great opportunity for this model to be utilized as a way to work on barriers of transportation and location, we think that a future of

the model can be applied. A demographic investment creating a satellite to increase our role of women in technology or people with a disability for example. And we hope to continue utilizing this model as a way for us to think nationally and even go across different regions in a cost-effective way. Importantly we are a workforce ecosystem. And if we're going to serve New York City, communities across New York City, we're going to have to do this together as all stakeholders. As nonprofits, philanthropies, we're going to have to work effectively to do this together. This provides in partnership we can create economies of scale and have good results.

So we launched this pilot in late 2021, and we had two amazing pilots and obviously we launched four classrooms since then. In 2023 we're expecting that this pilot is going to account for over 200 of our learners, which we're incredibly excited about. In support of, and in collaboration with Barclays, we're releasing a support about the model with further insights about our early findings, partner profiles and more, and it's going to be released next week on Tuesday so please be on the lookout.

I'm going to end this with a quote from one of our partners. People are influenced by what's around them. It's interesting how you hear people in the neighborhood talk about job opportunities. Now we're hearing kids ask what's up with that tech program. I am a first generation immigrant so building a classroom in Queens was incredibly important for me as someone who actually went to a CT high school and wished programs like this existed. Access matters, investment in neighborhood matters, period. When I hear kids and neighbors in my neighborhood ask about this program, it gives me absolute joy. So let's keep going. Let's keep building partnerships and with all our partners here, let's make it happen. Thanks all.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: Wow wow wow.

So after all of that excitement, we're going to give you a 15-minute break. 15

minutes will fly by so the bells will chime in probably 5 seconds. Please come back for the rest of the afternoon for more of these solutions, inclusive growth panel as well as some remarks from our founders. So be back here in 15 minutes. Don't know what time it is, but in 15 minutes. Thank you.

[Break]

>> Hello everyone. We're going to reconvene. Grab a seat if you can. When you run conferences you think to yourself how do we keep people engaged and focused? It's a long day, we want it to be as productive as possible.

I want to make sure that your time is used as effectively and efficiently. We want to make sure you're feeling about and carrying on. So if I could have your attention this way I want to introduce the next very strong panel and then we have another set of solutions and another very strong panel and another one after that. The content

I do think every hour of what we have to go counts a great deal. This is inclusive growth. So when we think about where our future is headed and what it means, this panel is about inclusive growth. Please join me in welcoming Nikki Evans, executive director of Jeremiah project Brooklyn. Christian gonzalez-rivera director of strategic policy initiatives at the Brookdale center. Yahshaanyah Hill senior vice president at the upper Manhattan empowerment zone development corp. Daphany Sanchez kineticic communities and Mirtha Santana housing advocate.

They are in conversation with Angelique Molina-Mangaroo of New York nonprofit media. The floor is yours. Have fun. Round of applause, please!

>> Angelique Molina-Mangaroo: Hello, everyone. I'm excited to get this panel started. Panelists, tell me about inclusive growth. What does it mean to you? How does inclusive growth strategy differ from current economic model and feel free to use think examples you have on hand. You can start.

>> Okay. So inclusive growth, I think that the word kind of says it, is that no one is left behind. That communities -- especially communities that have been marginalized and have been left behind through the years in the city are

included in the development of the city. That's sweet and short answer. I'll pass it to Daphany.

>> Daphany Sanchez: Exactly that. To add on ensuring intentional reinvestment in historically disinvested Black and Brown communities and to ensure that the future is a clean, healthy, and sustainable one.

>> Inclusive growth to me is on a personal level. It really means creating systems change on a local level, to make sure that we are empowering and recognizing the creative assets of community organizations. So that they can help to kind of set and inform local economic development policy.

>> Hi, everybody. So of course I wouldn't be surprised to you since I work at a place called the Brookdale center for healthy aging, that to me in my case inclusivity means making sure people of all ages are included in the future workforce.

In the early '90s, about 12% of workers were over the age of 50. Today it's one in four people. It's 25%.

So certainly I mean it's there's that need to include various generations in the workplace, because there are more people who want to and need to work longer. But at the same time the other piece of that is including the future you. Because if all goes -- the future us. If all goes well, we're going to be older workers too.

And so a lot of the ideas that we think about here, whether it's career pathways throughout the length of your life, whether it's education, not just at the beginning, but in different pieces of your life. All of those different pieces that we talk about, as a workforce community, are essential for a workforce that's going to be a lot more intergenerational. Where you're not just expected to learn everything when you're young, work in the middle of your life and then just retire.

A more dynamic work life is going to involve more dynamic connections with learning, skill-building, and reconnecting to jobs. So age inclusivity.

>> For me inclusive growth is also thinking about what are the unique

challenges and barriers that keep people from fully participating in the growth of our economy.

Because we have many people who are participating. They're going to work every day. They are, you know being active citizens in their day-to-day life, but they're not necessarily fully participating. They're not gaining access to quality jobs. They are not clear in the pathways that are in front of them. They have unique challenges. Parents, single parents, even dual income households have unique challenges that we don't talk about, and that we have long not fully discussed when we talk about inclusive growth.

Because inclusivity is also about families, it's also about recognizing that we have a invested interest in like not just the parents but the children as well. And that there is a dynamic piece to that. I think we have gotten to the point where looking at it from a very siloed perspective is no longer okay, because people are living very dynamic lives.

And we as the workforce system have to respond to that.

>> Angelique Molina-Mangaroo: Thank you, Nikki. The mayor's plan for economic development came out last month including driving sector growth and a pillar about connecting New Yorkers to quality jobs and in-demand skills. It essentially promotes many of the he recommendations and strategies laid out in the blueprint. How can city leadership anded Adams administration work to include --

>> Nikki Evans: I think one of the first things we can talk about how we start to include these strategies is one, be clear about what our system is now. I think we have a lot of competition within the system. I think we have a lot of gaps and holes. I was so excited to hear Google say they were investing in NYCETC. Simply to at least look at the gaps within tech education and tech training. But there's a lot of gaps in our system.

There's a lot of competitiveness in our system. And I think we really have to start recognizing that there is no one solution. That often times it takes multiple programs to make someone fully ready to move on to a quality path job, or to

move on to a tech job. It's not a 6-week coding class. And so understanding what our system already has, and how do we encourage collaboration, how do we support it, how does funding and policy support it. Because it's going to take many hands to lift this ship.

>> Christian gonzalez-rivera: I like the idea or I forget how exactly it was worded in the mayor's economic development blueprint, but it was something along the lines making the workforce development system isn't just something for the poor, it's for everyone. I like that a debecause we have so many programs in the world. Which makes sense we're the biggest city. We also have the City University of New York which is an extremely important resource.

The fact of the matter is, as we were talking about before, a life that is in which you're working longer, in which skills the skill needs for any job are changing, is also a life where you're going to have to learn at a different part of your life. You're not going to get a bachelor's degree. When you put it that way it makes sense, but it's something that still not -- how do you say this in English?

Some of you know what I'm talking about. It doesn't fit well with the system that is still very much designed to go to school when you're younger, work in the middle of your life, and then retire. And so that's something that needs to change. We've been talking about it for such a long time and I feel like once again I'm talking about the same thing, as are many of you.

But I think this is a clear time than ever to realize we really need to learn across the life course. So it's encouraging to me that at least this is recognized in the language in the economic development report.

>> Yahshaanyah Hill: Coming from an economic development standpoint, I know we spent a lot of time really making recommendations towards workforce development and economic development, and the one thing that we wanted to make sure was that we weave the two together, and make sure that we promote the fact that workforce development is as much an economic policy as it is a social policy.

So happy to see that the mayor's office has really adopted our

recommendation around reinvigorating the mayor's office of workforce development. So we commend the mayor's office on that.

Also happy to see that the focus is on economic development and workforce development. And what I would love to see more of, and love to see change, is more focus on that. In terms of making sure that when we have love economic development in the community, that there is workforce development that is weaved into that, and that the mayor's office can take an intermediary approach, to make sure there's accountability around that. To make sure that is actually happening, and that we're not looking at economic development just as job growth, but making sure that there are quality wages tied into -- weaved into a lot of these initiatives.

>> Mirtha Santana: There is so many components of economic development that intertwine with climate resiliency from me on the climate perspective you'll hear people talk about what's happening in 2050, what's happening in 2030. For those of you that know me, I'm always like F that. There's bodies right now dying and there are people getting asthma attacks. There are people that are living in crappy positions, they're living in mold, living in lead, living with asbestos. So for me when we talk about economic development and inclusive engagement with communities and New Yorkers is ensuring that any climate solution, any economic development solution, any renewables that are being developed, forget about large scale and really think about the hyperlocal, really think about the existing ecosystem within these communities.

Really thinking about the existing ecosystem of school, really connect the dots between workforce development, between education, between renewables. Because if we don't have a pathway forward, we're just going to continue to exacerbate the issue of Black and Brown bodies dying every day, today. So it's very important to intertwine all of the components together for a Klein energy future.

>> Daphany Sanchez: I'm going to continue inter-2009ing as you're talking about economic development and workforce -- Mirtha Santana all I'm thinking

about is housing. If we think about a minimum wage worker, a home attendant for example earning \$15 an hour. That worker working 40 hours a week cannot pay the rent, unless it's subsidized, unless they have section 8, they live in public housing, somebody's doing a favor for them. The.

The bottom line is that we need a home. We are not human beings are not working machines. We are human beings with families. We need quality child care, so that mothers, fathers, parents, feel comfortable leaving their children and going to work. So there are -- I saw the report and I am reading about the jobs of the future and also welcoming visitors back to New York. We all love our tourists. They bring a lot of money to this city.

But many of those jobs, are service jobs that do not pay enough money for people to live a quality lifestyle.

>> Angelique Molina-Mangaroo: Thank you. You all attached on this a little bit. Yahshaanya, how can economic and housing development weave together with workforce development towards an equitable recovery?

>> Yahshaanyah Hill: I think in terms of housing, I think we have to understand that workforce development or job training is not just a poverty focus. It's not going to just promote economic mobility on its own. We need affordable housing. We need healthcare. We need mental health. We need a holistic approach to making sure that, you know, workforce development can be beneficial.

And can promote upward mobility. And what good is it for you to have a job and not have a living wage, and you can't pay your rent. So that's what I would say about that.

>> Thank you. Mirtha?

>> Mirtha Santana: I think I said it already. It's that minimum wage, 40 hours a week, cannot pay the rent of a 1-bedroom apartment in this city. It's that simple.

>> Daphany Sanchez: It's so important upward mobility. Many times people talk about economic development, Black and Brown bodies can be service jobs, they can do solar panels. But we're more than just our bodies. We're more than

just physical labor and the city really needs to think about what does that upward mobility look like. What are the artificial barriers that are presented that prohibit Black and Brown bodies to get these higher-paying wages and what are some other infrastructures, whether it's policy or quite frankly structural racist practices that prohibit people to move from that service job into another type of job. It's important we talk about housing and understand that interconnection of upward mobility and economic development, whether it's in climate or in other sectors, to be front and center in every conversation.

>> Nikki Evans: I want to add that also raises the question too about our siloed approach dealing with populations. Because a single person making \$15 an hour is not going to be able to afford a home. Or an apartment in this city. So oftentimes we kind of think about it it's like oh, if I help the youth, that's going to end poverty. If I help the adults that's going to end poverty.

The fact of the matter the youth in your program and the adult in your program are probably in the same household and they're probably trying to work together to keep their heads above water. When we used the siloed approach we forget the life these people are living they have parents. I come from a lower income family. If my mother needs something my disposable income is going to pay for that. Same thing for parents.

If your child needs something, you're going to take care of that. I think a lot of our workforce thinking is oh, if we just help this one population, if we do this one thing here, it will fix it. But we have to start realizing that this really is about a lot of interplay between generations, the communities, and families. And so we have to take a longer-term look at it. We have to build a more comprehensive system, to Christian's point. That allows people to move along a pathway at different stages of their life and we have to recognize that. And right now we don't because we are so geared because of the way funding and finances works in nonprofit, to only think about special populations and special groups.

One group is not going to solve the problems that we have, especially coming out of COVID.

>> Christian gonzalez-rivera: Now that you mentioned that Nikki, do you mind if I jump in as well? I wanted to throw in really quickly, in terms of help across generations. One thing that's -- now because of COVID it's a lot more recognized but the fact is there are a lot of people who are taking off of work or working fewer hours because of caregiving. Of course it's like they put their own livelihoods and their own housing, et cetera, at risk, because I mean it's like they're working less hours to fulfill those caregiving roles.

On top of that, almost all people who do this, are women. We talk about gender pay gap, it's yes, you have women who step out of paid work in order to do other kinds of essential yet unpaid work. So that means on the policy level there needs to be more support for caregivers and benefits need to be rethought as well. It's like what do you do for someone. Who might be able to receive a benefit because they're older but their caregiver is not old enough to receive that benefit.

They fall in between the benefit cracks. There's a lot of re-thinking that needs to be done along those lines. As more and more people are either people who are cared for or are giving care.

>> Yahshaanyah Hill: One thing last piggybacking off Christian, we need to be proponents of the nonprofit community-based workforce development organizations that are in these communities, trying to help promote economic mobility and making sure that they have the capacity and the funding and the resources to be able to help individuals that are in need. And I think that's something far too often we don't keep in the conversation.

>> Angelique Molina-Mangaroo: All right, y'all. We are at time. Thank you so much to everyone who came to the panel. Thank you panelists. It was an interesting converse.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: Thank you everybody. We're going to take one quick minute and we'll move on with our presentations.

Okay. We are back to our solutions strategy. This one is very significant in

our neighborhoods. It's not something always that we think about, but it's about land use and land use changes. This is a solution about making rezoning work. Integrating workforce development into land-use changes.

This is going to join us in a minute, Eli Dvorkin center for an urban future. You may not be thinking about this normally, but I can tell you neighborhood by neighborhood in New York City, a serious conversation is taking place, and workforce development should be at the fore when we think about rezoning.

On that note, give your speaker a round of applause to start.

[Applause]

>> Eli Dvorkin: Good afternoon. Not bad. Let me try it one more time. Good afternoon. All right. Now we're cooking. My name is Eli Dvorkin it's my pleasure to be here today representing the center for an urban future. We are focused on building a stronger and more inclusive economy here in New York and across all five boroughs.

There are a lot of city leaders can do. Our latest report city of aspiration offers up 150 concrete ideas to do just that. But I don't have 150 minutes, so I said I would stick with one single idea for this talk, so here it is.

New York City should seize on the enormous but largely untapped opportunity to integrate strategic investments in workforce development into and in advance of major zoning changes. Now, we made this case, a case for this approach in our 2021 report entitled making rezoning work, that we produced in partnership with Jobs First NYC. What is this idea, why is it necessary and how exactly would it work?

Well, right now policymakers across New York City are reckoning with how to move land use change forward amid a severe housing shortage with a recession looming in a city which is still down 141,000 jobs from February 2020.

But when it comes to land use changes that can unlock new housing and spur job growth, New York City faces a major logjam. Many elected officials, community leaders and local residents are understandably concerned about the risk of displacement if zoning changes accelerate gentrification, if the population

growing, everything from sewer systems to public parks and schools.

In other cases land use changes can enable commercial or industrial development that can spark job creation and can build up the city's tax base but unresolved questions over who benefits economically have caused divisions within communities and have slowed or stopped projects that can otherwise benefit the city and its residents.

There's little doubt to the status quo is unsustainable, but there's far less agreement out there today how to move land use changes forward equitably and what steps are needed to maximize benefits and mitigate the risks.

City council have laid out principles of their own, but while many of these principles are intended to ensure that new housing is deeply affordable, that current residents are not displaced, another side of the equation has been almost entirely absent.

Investments that can help local residents get on the path to better jobs and paying careers. After all what makes housing affordable isn't just the cost of the rent, it's the income of the resident. That's why city officials should make investments in career training and workforce development an integral part of the rezoning process and partner with local nonprofit intermediaries, community-based organizations and effective workforce development providers to lay the groundwork for these investments in advance of major land use changes. Our report which you see here making rezoning work revealed that investments have been almost entirely absent. In exact while neighborhood rezoning plans have included numerous commitments from housing productions, from current renters to new community spaces and play grounds, workforce investments have been minimal or nonaxis event.

City government budgeted just \$462,250 for job training initiatives focused on just two of the major 6 neighborhoods since 2016. Of that just \$312,500 had been spent on new job training programs as of last year. In fact investment in workforce development have typically come too late or not at all.

And the need is pretty clear. As you can see here the neighborhoods that

were rezoned recently, the poverty rate is about 27% compared to 19% citywide. Unemployment rate was significantly higher. The share of adults with a bachelor's degree significantly lower.

In so many ways those economic opportunity indicators were lacking but these investments weren't being made.

It doesn't have to be this way. To earn the trust of communities that have been hit the hardest by the pandemic and ensure that new development benefits New Yorkers most in need of economic opportunity, New York City will need to develop a bold, new vision for building, infrastructure at the neighborhood level.

This approach should have three key ingredients. One, the Adams administration and the city council should focus on strengthening neighborhood level workforce networks by investing in the lower east side employment network to a cooperative. New York is fortunate to have models up and running. Too little has been done to invest in these approaches, grow them and replicate them.

The mayor's team and council should work with small department services and other agencies to help seed and scale these networks in every community citywide starting with those where income is below the citywide average, ensuring that every community has the tools, resources and capacity needed to connect residents to education, training, and employment before a major rezoning occurs.

Second develop community tool kits for designing and planning workforce investments as part of any future neighborhood rezoning. City officials should work with those intermediaries and community-based organizations, workforce prepares educational institutions to develop a menu of options for building and strengthening local work networks

And share them at the beginning. Without a framework like this individual community members are left to advocate for these investments on their own with limited results.

And third, these investments can be paid for in part through a system of

citywide linkage fees for developers of projects. This wouldn't be a new idea. Boston's jobs trust does just that and has for 30 years. Requiring developers to invest for a project over 100,000 square feet into a fund set aside specifically for job training education support services and in Boston that has generated over \$80 million since 2014.

We can't just rezone our way to a more equitable city. But by finally incorporating strategic investments in workforce development into and in advance of major land use changes, city leaders can help expand economic opportunity in the communities that need it the most. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> Gregory Morris: That was a pathway to hiring local talent. When you think about pathways to employment, rezoning is the way to do it, and it's an opportunity. Keep it in mind because it's going to come up mor and more often.

Our next solution the future of work is cooperative. I have the pleasure of introduction our next solution. Here it is Rebecca Lurie and Anh-Thu Ngyuen the director of strategic partnerships at the democracy at work institute. Please welcome them with a round of applause.

[Applause]

>> Hi, everybody. I know many of you, Rebecca Lurie. I'm going to speak today on how cooperatives are a solution for the future, and really I want to say in many ways cooperatives are of the past.

So I want to offer a land acknowledgment to the Lenape people here and now. This was the holiday we just had this past week, I want to offer recognition to the Lenape and the Hodasawnee people to recognize that the indigenous people in this region were skilled in cultivating processes that were inclusive and cooperative with all beings. So thanks be to them.

[Applause]

So let me turn to what we face today. All these pressures come raining down on working people, and you can just randomly choose any UC on the slide. I will not be reading my slides. There is trauma from it all. When serving those facing

trauma based on all and any of these hardships, how can we help, I suggest the future is cooperative.

And through workforce development, with a goal to train and place people into good jobs or upgrade their employment.

We aim for good jobs, quality jobs, and here I refer to the Aspen Institute who just published this report on a working definition of good jobs, highlighting economic stability, economic mobility and equity, respect and voice at work. And Matthew Klein from Robin Hood referenced this earlier today as well. So I want to suggest that people look at this and see what we mean when we with an to place people and help people achieve good jobs.

Much can be said here, but I will underscore an important point. That having respect and a voice at work is significant. I offer a shout-out to the revival of the union movement today. And those activists -- look at Amazon and Starbucks, workers who use voice and collective power to raise the bar for that good job.

So today we see a trend with 40% of the workforce in America are self-employed. And whether that's truly self-employed or misclassification of their work, I will leave that for a different conference.

School of labor I must and we can pay attention to that. But suffice to say, when people are not employed by a company, that puts them on payroll, they face other challenges for their income. There may be a joy to being an entrepreneur, but the challenges abound. With this high rate of becoming self-employed what happens to folks who go through our programs who may become entrepreneurs or self-employed?

How can we help these workers and what additional skills might we contribute in workforce development? Another fact impacting small businesses is that there are not enough buyers for succession planning and selling a business to a workers is a layoff aversion strategy we should keep our eyes on and be part of.

Is Angie Kamath spoke about this in an earlier panel. People need skills, advocacy skills, organizing skills and cooperative skills and these are not skills we traditional teach in workforce development.

This is far beyond soft skills. They are skills that can be brought into our workforce development programs in order to help folks be successful and possibilities that might not be that secure first job.

So there are seven principles to cooperatives. And this is internationally known from the international cooperative alliance. Businesses that run this way follow these seven principles. And without getting into them in detail, we can see, membership, democracy, opportunity for education and community as important values that people expect when they're running their businesses as cooperative.

I draw your attention to education training and information. This is a commitment to workforce development already embedded in the philosophy of what it takes to be a good cooperative business. This suggests for members -- this suggests for members, education before, during, and after becoming a cooperative business. It is career exploration, skills for job seekers, training for program graduates who may want to take this cooperative direction and training for workers as well.

We all recognize the importance of continuing education and education is needed is already in our social lexicon. These are life skills applied to cooperative businesses. We say our solution incorporate cooperative skills, education and training wherever we can. I will add a shameless plug here because the the CUNY school of labor and urban studies, we now have a graduate program of four courses aimed to help mid career people, many like yourselves, to learn what and how to incorporate, community and worker ownership strategies into our broader efforts. I brought a flyer if anybody wants it, you can find me after. Or reach out to me.

Many of us are familiar with Maslow's hierarchy of needs and highlights self actualization with the highest to achieve with love and belonging along the pathway to get you there. Cooperatives include belonging and message to all, you are not alone. Healthy team work invites active listening and deep compassion traits required to heal from trauma that can promote work to be a

place where some repairing can occur.

The pandemic has shined a light on the ancient and indigenous practices we now refer to as mutual aid. Cooperative enterprises perform like mutual aid where those who come together, work together, to find and create solutions to their economic life together. Although this might look like cognizant work, it can also be the work that is accomplishing two things at once.

It's bringing people closer to their self-actualization and collective power, and helping them get decent income into their pocket, expanding own capacities to build wealth.

I'm going to turn the mic over to Anh-Thu and she's going to speak some of how this has worked with radiating consulting.

>> Anh-Thu Ngyuen: Thanks, Rebecca. I'm going to speak a little to what we've been doing at democracy at work institute on worker cooperatives for people who are facing barriers to work. And it's basically, to Rebecca's point, about 40% of our workforce, not working in a traditional employment relationship, but rather self-employed as independent he been contractors, precarious workers, contingent workers and so forth.

What we in 2019, 2018, 2019 piloted with the CUNY Institute of Mexican Studies a rapid response cooperative basically which is a worker cooperative business, worker owned, democratically managed, of CUNY graduates, who had been recipients of a scholarship for immigrant students. Ed I am grants especially are in a space of precarity of work, especially if you're mixed status. That's the reason why so many I am grants end up being self-employed or starting their own business.

You start a business because you don't get into that workforce pathway. You have to figure it out yourself. And so what did in partnership with the institute of Mexican Studies was set up a worker cooperative called ratate consulting. And it was our first pilot. The focus was on individuals who already had pathways to work opportunities but couldn't be employed by those workplaces.

And they -- so they were able to start a professional services cooperative

providing administrative services, operations interpretation translation, all these kinds of things that keep our social services running in the city, especially in immigrant communities. And doing it as owners of their business.

So what does that mean? It's a business-to-business relationship between the cooperative business and whoever is contracting with them.

The client contracts with the business, the individuals who otherwise would be working as 1099s would be working as contractors with limited amounts of protections. They're compensated as owners, they're building their own business and they're developing their business.

And then the cooperative business itself has a back office component to it that facilitates invoicing. If you remember who started work, their first job, as an employee there's so many things that you don't have to do. Like you don't have to invoice clients, you don't have to worry about insurance, you don't have to worry about -- paying your taxes. If you're a consultant, when you start doing it for the first time, you realize actually there's so many different things you have to do just to basically stay afloat and legally do your work.

So with this cooperative model, individuals who are just coming into the workforce for the first time have this covered for them. That's paid out of their invoices. That's a little bit of how that works.

So we've been able to successfully pilot that with institute of Mexican studies and now we're working with cun John Jay immigrant student success center to launch a second one with graduates there in the coming year. That's an example of how we can facilitate these kinds of cooperatives and be a little bit of a transition for students and graduates into the workforce. Pass it back to Rebecca

>> Rebecca Lurie: Thanks, Anh-Thu. Very hard in 8 minutes to tell you all about what we want people to know. But suffice to say that there's other ways that people can use this entrepreneurial spirit or the self-employment or consulting space that actually is cooperative. And you do it together and you start learning skills together. There are a number of organizations now in New

York City doing this training, including what I have mentioned at the Cuny school of labor and urban studies.

And democracy at work institute does this work nationally with education school of democratic management. Take it on, talk to us, figure out how we can integrate it into our workforce solutions. Thank you.

[Applause]

>> We have been bringing solutions, strong panels. We've got an announcement about a tremendous grant opportunity through Amazon. -- Google. We've been work very, very hard throughout the course of this day to bring to the table great opportunities. I hope when you look back you find the gems of the day as you think back. I think this next panel might be one of those gems that you look back on.

Partially because of the amazing talent as part of it. This conversation is about the workforce development landscape catalyzing a robust and equitable recovery. This is about us. And I think it's important for us all to be aware as we think about our advocacy strategies and our plans moving forward, to know what we're made of, what we're accomplishing, and obviously what we're capable of.

Here's the group coming to the table now. Lowell Herschberger, Lia Moe, Evelyn Ortiz, Robert Taylor, Kevin Tse deputy director of strategic initiatives and development, and Andrea Vaghy. Wow. What a list. In conversation with Ethan Geringer-Sameth of Gotham Gazette. This panel is stacked. Give it up. Have fun.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Thank you. So this panel is -- we're going to be talking about the workforce workforce, and the conditions that it's operating under. As we discussed a devastating pandemic to our economy, great opportunities for growth in new sectors. But there's one industry in particular that's essential for this, the workforce industry that is struggling. That has a lot of congress strengths and difficulties.

Andrea you wrote a report about this a couple of months ago. Tell us a little about the overview of the city's workforce landscape now, the populations, the

programs. What does it look like?

>> Andrea Vaghy: The report that WPTI and the coalition and the center for New York City affairs worked on was really to look at the workforce landscape including the workforce, all of you who do this work, what sectors people are doing training in, what are some of the challenges that organizations are facing around things like staff recruitment, participant recruitment. What kinds of resources organizations are using or are not using, where they need support for their organization. Was really to get an understanding of where we are at this moment in time in the post-COVID economy.

>> Thank you. So what are some of those challenges that you saw in this post COVID economy?

>> Andrea Vaghy: I think two of the biggest challenges we saw were around staff recruitment and participant recruitment. I think one of the things -- and this also comes out of some work that WPTI has done from our voices from the front line work is that we saw that 67% of practitioners are reporting looking to leave the field in the next three years. That's a really startling number.

And I think for a lot of reasons people are talking about leaving. They're not paid enough. We know COVID has required a lot of workers to do double the job they were doing, do tasks outside of their jobs. They are struggling with administrative burdens for their contracts on performance outcomes didn't change tremendously different COVID. All kinds of things are leading people to say I'm not sure I want to do this work.

But I think the biggest one is pay. People in the field aren't making enough to be able to pay the rent to stay in New York City.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Lena I think you have data points on this. Care to share?

>> Lena Moe: Yeah. The landscape report is really trying to tell a two-sided story. And one is about how the workforce sector can be a tool for economic recovery, and the other is about how the workforce sector itself was impacted by

the pandemic.

This slide is from a survey that the center for New York City affairs did with WPTI of workforce providers and it found that workforce providers were incredibly motivated to do their best during the pandemic. I was talking with several providers before this panel and they talked about how they took on a number of roles that weren't inside their official job descriptions.

Yet at the same time they faced enormous challenges, and that was transferring their programs online, creating programs that could be delivered remotely. All while facing often unemployment in their own families and connecting just an enormous number of job seekers to new opportunities.

And so we found that workforce providers on the whole really believe in their work. An enormous number. 95% of respondents said I understand my job and I believe in its mission. But this is the other side of the story, which is showing how workers feel so stressed, so burned out and that they can't make ends meet, that a lot of them are thinking about leaving not just their job, but leaving the profession altogether and leaving New York City.

So that's a sobering message.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Thanks. What exactly -- I mean, what is creating -- the report talks about a pressure cooker environment for these workforce providers. You talked a little about having to adapt to new working models, new industries. But at the same time there's drying up of funding, less city contracts dollars, less philanthropic funding. Can you tell me a little about that?

>> I'll let the providers speak about how the funding has been really challenging during the COVID period when workforce providers were really pushed to meet job placement numbers. But also I do want to stress one thing, which is that we did hear that funders saw COVID as a moment of being more flexible, of saying okay, well maybe we can meet numbers in different ways or at a different pace. And I feel like that opportunity needs to be extended to be the new normal. To reconsider the way that funding is tied to placements. But I would really defer to

some of my colleagues up here to talk about the on-the-ground impact.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: One of the things you mentioned was adapting your trainings and this being a -- you know, a new problem that workforce providers are experiencing. I wonder if any of the providers on the panel have experience with this. Lowell, you and I were talking about this a little before.

>> Lowell Herschberger: Sure. I want to prove a few comments with a story. I want to talk about Javier. I met him in first grade. He was the middle child of seven children. Rumor had it he was on the autism spectrum. I lost contact with him for a little while and during the pandemic I heard he got expelled from high school because he was cheating.

And then I also bumped into him again and heard that he was having trouble engaging during the pandemic, in terms of education. And this phrase that I quoted before, he said it was like I was chained to nothingness during the pandemic. He was really struggling. I bumped into him again and he signed up for my running team after work. And that's not in my job description, nor any of my staff.

But we started running, and this kid could not even run a half mile. And for the first nine months when he was on the team, he came in dead last every single time. Nine months. Three days a week. And I told him, I said you know what, Javier? I said running is 70% mental. Even though you've come in last every single time, I think you might be the mentally toughest one on our team.

And he looked at me like really? I was like yeah. Fast forward last month, Javier and I ran a marathon together. So Javier, this kid is motivated, right? How many of you have run a marathon? This is a 17-year-old kid, one person. It's painful, right? But this kid did it, at 17. This kid that would be, by all measures of all of our funders, would be considered high risk.

The same kid started for SYP but he didn't start SYP until week five because you know it's a six-week program because he didn't have his working papers because his mom lost his social security card and he was disengaged in school.

He starts in week 5, he works for two weeks, he earns about 400 bucks. He

turns around and enrolls himself in the private school in our neighborhood and pays for his own tuition for the month of September to get back engaged in school. But he needs a job now to pay for the school, right? So he calls me up and he asks about helping him get a job. Try to get him a job in one of our after school programs. I can't do it because the school goes too long. Just this morning I called the principal of his private school now that he's in, and I asked him if he could get out of school early so he could work this job so he could make money to pay his tuition and the principal was great and said he could do that. This was literally this morning I had this conversation. So here's the interesting thing.

None of that story would show up on any outcome report to any of my 20 funders. And a good 80% of that work wouldn't show up on my paycheck either, right? And it's because of creative partnerships, community of faith. It was this private school that was flexible. It's this kind of creativity that we need, we need staff. Like you said 95% believe in the mission.

I think there's staff out there, they have to be rewarded for doing things that are off the record, right? And I think of my colleagues here, youth build, the Door, I'm a big fan of that. We need these holistic models to serve our young people like Javier

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Thank you for that story. You mention the data and the ETC WPTI report is great because it gives some actual data points to latch on to when we're talking about the challenges that the workforce development sector is facing. Evelyn, NYATEP has another report on inequity within the workforce workforce. Can you tell us a little about what you found in that report?

>> Evelyn Ortiz. . Yes of course we are the statewide workforce association. And we came -- we -- excuse me. We came upon this initiative because during the pandemic, very similar, we saw a lot of our colleagues saying hey, we can't do this anymore. It's just too much work. And at this moment I can't continue to put this burden upon myself. It's affecting my mental health. It's affecting my day-to-day life.

And what we saw was that it was really impacting leaders of color in particular. And we were seeing an exodus at that moment as well. And we were trying to figure out well, how do we support leaders of color from within the system, across the State of New York. And we said well, let's figure this out. But we didn't have any baseline information.

So we decided to come together and say, well, let's collect the information. So we came up with a sweat scan which is really the state we had workforce analysis tool to really measure how hard we really are working to make our workplaces more equitable and inclusive.

And we're really trying to really understand what equity gaps exist. So the survey really is designed to collect this baseline of information that we don't have access to right now, and we really need in order to take a deeper dive and look at ourselves as model employers. As a key industry. Because that is what we are. And when we analyzed, and went around, we realized we had like 98 organizations that participated across the State of New York, half of that represented New York City.

And we had about 36,000 full-time and part-time workforce professionals that were represented through this data. To me that was a very like surprising number. When we see that. And imagine that's just less than half of the sector statewide. And one thing that we realized through this was that how difficult it was for folks to even fill out the survey.

And we received a lot of feedback from a lot of New York City providers that were saying Lynn, we want to do this, we care about equity, but it is hard for us to do it. We have so many competing deadlines. We don't have any staff capacity.

We don't even know where to find the information, because there's so many different data systems that we have to look at. And that's problematic, right? Because we're trying to really support our workers internally, really support the work that's being done externally. But the infrastructure is lacking. The capacity is lacking. And I think that's just what we see, even when you read through the

landscape report.

That these are similar themes across the board. And it's not just happening in New York City, it's happening all across the state.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: So what were some of the findings of the survey that you did? What were some of the demographic landscape of the sector?

>> Evelyn Ortiz: A couple of things we see, we know that our services support BIPOC communities. Like what we've realized is there's really a lack of support to support BIPOC staff. So we're not really necessarily kind of practicing internally what we're preaching externally. And the data really showcased that 17% of respondents said that they don't -- necessarily they don't have these policies and practices in place.

Beyond that we also see that in order to really advance DEI within our organizations, it is essential to have dedicated staff to this type of work. And unfortunately only 11% of organizations have that type of personnel that is available to do it. And most of the time what happens is that like folks who are in senior leadership roles are the ones that are being charged with this type of work.

And they have multiple types of things that they have to address at the same time. Like multiple functions. And it's not something that they can necessarily prioritize. So that's -- some of the clear things that really came about. And also just the lack of supports overall to support individuals of color from across the system. So there's a lack of mentorship and employee resource groups that are available within organizations to support BIPOC communities.

In particular, BIPOC staff. And even organizations in like who provide let's say professional development opportunities, what we saw through the data was that very few organizations offer continuing education as an opportunity to take paid time off. So they're not necessarily offering them paid time off to do this type of work. So we won't really see any type of movement from front line positions, from folks who are in front line positions and overrepresented in front line positions into now senior leadership roles.

You're going to see like folks that are going to stay in these positions for ten years or more. And not see any progression.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: So that's sort of -- we talked about the staffing recruitment and retention side of things. What about client recruitment and retention? How has that been going? I guess I'll start with you, Andrea, because this is something that the report touches on and we'll get to the providers. Tell us a little about client retention.

>> Andrea Vaghy: When we started the report one of the things we were looking at and hearing from employers, people can't find workers. What we started seeing regardless of how well performing organizations were, they were struggling to find clients for a variety of reasons. From not having their trainings were not reflective of what's happening in the labor market, clients were not interested in -- because of COVID, not wanting to come out.

Or because we haven't done the kind of infrastructure investments we need, like programs aren't able to provide stipends or child care transportation costs that would allow clients to come to training. So I think we really were starting to look at where those challenges are.

I think the providers can also speak to their own experiences with recruitment

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: To the providers on the panel, what were some of the challenges with getting clients to take on your services, and what do the clients need to be able to remain in your programs?

>>

(Speaking) from the youth action youth building perspective, our biggest challenge was the first two years of COVID when everything went remote. Having our students adjust to a remote setting where they were used a high-touch environment and extra time and staff that could meet their needs.

Then going into the remote situation, I think it kind of proved to be a little uninspiring, discouraging for a lot of students. Students live in households where they don't have dedicated space to study. They're also competing with access to the computer with their own siblings in their own family. Resources

was a real issue at that point.

I think the other challenge was anxiety about coming out and not knowing what to do the virus and how they're going to protect themselves and feeling safe inside their own homes.

And with the vaccine mandates a lot of resistance, we still encounter folks not wanting to get the vaccines because they don't trust it and then having mandates saying you've got to have the vaccines to be in the program.

So that's some of the COVID-related challenges. I think we're rebuilding our recruitment strategies. We also had to go out and find the young people where they were now, where they were at now. Our biggest challenge around that area is that, you know, with the stimulus money that a lot of our young people were getting, it was almost a disincentive to come out. To continue pursuing education, to continue earning a stipend and those kinds of things when you can make more money getting a gig job or living off a stimulus check. I think now that's starting to turn around. But that was through aggressive outreach and really creating a dedicated position in the organization for someone that was specifically targeted the populations that we serve.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: How do you meet all these different needs that your clients have with the sort of limited and narrowly prescribed funding that you're given. Kevin, do you want to speak to this?

>> Kevin Tse: Sure. For CPC we had a reduction in terms of the funding that we received for a couple of years. For our workforce side we've seen a decrease about 42%. In terms of understanding the most critical services that are needed, we had to basically pick and choose what is the most important service for our community members. At that time it's job placement. It's no longer our job training sectors such as hospitality, as well as the customer service training.

So in that case we also found it a little bit more difficult in terms of retaining individuals that are or wanted to join programs, when they were talking to us they wanted to find positions that could hire them on the spot. So then they

could bring food to the table. Also at the same time they asked about remote positions, a lot of flexibility. Child care, does it include transportation, does it include stipends.

Most of those training programs does not include those as well. And then I think for us as really trying to think about with the amount of money we have, we also have to rely on our staff members to sort of pivot and support each other's programs. I'm also actually very grateful that my colleagues in the back from CPC, they've been really supportive in supporting each other's programs. Just because we do have other staff members on the workforce side.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: This is for all the providers on the panel. What do you need most from the city -- let's start with the city. What are your top priorities? And maybe let's frame this in terms of the fiscal year 23 budget is set, but let's look ahead to next year and what could the city be doing to meet these challenges?

>> In terms of recommendations on the CPC side, I would say any type of training programs, think about the stipend portions increasing stipends to incentivize individuals to think about the long-term investments in the career they're trying to get. And also think about transportation costs. Think about the costs also covered for child care as well and wraparound services that would help this individual succeed in their programming.

We see a lot of individuals who have a lot of limited English proficiency. Programs that would allow those individuals to be also be engaged in all the opportunities such as tech and can -- healthcare.

>> Lowell Herschberger: I'll add to the story earlier, the definition of flexibility outcome. The earlier panel talking about skills, we need to figure out how to measure the skills that employers are saying they want so we can get credit for that outcome. Because we see that. We see young people achieving those skills and not really getting any credit for it. Figuring out a way to do in a way that's not oppressive, in a way that's not creating another hurdle like the workforce credential did a few years ago. Really being creative about real-life

outcomes that a person can achieve, that have value in the workforce. And I will just do a shout-out. I think SYP did some things during the pandemic that I think we need to be positive about. The income requirement documents, the online time sheets, things that we've been asking for for decades all of a sudden happened during the pandemic.

So I think we need to applaud those positive steps when they happen as well.

>> Robert Taylor: I'm going to put on my ED hat here to me with the city the biggest burden is sometimes the contracting process going from the point of allocation to getting reimbursed from your funds which can take more than the a year, more than the length of a contract itself. That puts a big burden on us as a small organization where our cash flow is always constrained. Which means that we can't respond to on-the-ground needs, because we have to sort of manage when we have moneys to do things. It impacts how we can pay staff, it impacts the kind of services we can provide students.

The other piece is around flexibility in funding. If there was a way to think about general funding that could go with your reward, that allows the agency to respond to the on-the-ground needs as they show up. If you see an increase of hungry students you have monies to tap into to feed them or if there's transportation those would be my top two priorities.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: What about the policy people on the panel?

>> Andrea Vaghy: I want to back up. What we have not seen in the field. We've seen investments in higher participant costs or we've seen state investments, but we have not seen any real investments in the infrastructure of workforce. That means higher pay for workers. There hasn't been money for organizations to invest in their data systems or money for organizations to invest in adapting curriculum or changing curriculum for new sectors, or covering things like child care, food, transportation, stipends.

So I do think there really is a need for flexible funding. Because some organizations are really good at fundraising for those things and others really need more depending on how their population is. I think the city really needs to

think about a real infrastructure investment in organizations to get them to the capacity, and also to retain the staff that they have. Because if we lose 60% of our workforce in the next three years, we're going to be in a desperate shape. And also the other piece I forgot to mention was professional development. As Evelyn said, we have a largely -- staff of most workforce organizations are people of color and they are not always the leaders in organizations. And if they're to be leaders they need to be invested in, they need to be trained, they need time to take off so they can finish degrees or get their master's degrees or do whatever those things are to help them take those leadership position so the organizations reflect the clients

>> Evelyn Ortiz: I want to echo all of Andrea's sentiments. There's been such an onerous task that everyone here in this room right now has been expected to meet outcomes, contractual obligations, to meet the crises that they see every day, and it's not fair that you're also asking well, you also have to pay for your own professional development, you have to fund raise, you have to do this.

I completely agree with Andrea and I cannot stress enough the need for a data system right now, because that is yet another onerous task that organizations are tasked with and also have to fund raise for and also have to have multiple staff to be able to input information into all these multiple data systems. So that will also take away some of that responsibility and hopefully help just alleviate some of that strain

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: What have you seen in your research in this area that the city needs to get on top of?

>> Lena moe: Sure the landscape report was trying to acknowledge the scale of the problem. I do have a slide here. So at the New School we've been tracking job losses since the onset of COVID and we've found it helpful to divide it into three kinds of jobs. There are remote workers who largely didn't lose their job. They can work from home. There are essential workers who were similarly not impact the through job loss, although they were exposed to greater health risks. And then there were face-to-face workers.

These are retail, construction, arts and entertainment. And these workers saw catastrophic job loss. Huge, huge location and that's what the workforce is dealing with. Part of the landscape report was to reach out to the nonprofit workforce providers, and we're hoping to supplement this with a second report that's coming this fall that's going to look at the whole workforce system including CUNY, including the one stops.

And to see how the system can be a tool for economic recovery. We asked providers, we got responses from 143 organizations, to talk about the programs that they offered, as well as the challenges that they faced in developing new programs and adjusting those programs to meet this changing labor market environment.

And so one thing I wanted to point out in this slide is that face-to-face jobs still haven't recovered. We have a deficit of 170,000 jobs. And these are jobs that workforce providers would be putting entry level workers into.

It's also important to note that New York City's unemployment rate is much higher than the national average. It's over 6%. The national average is 3.5%. So New York City needs information about the workforce system in order to help coordinate and meet this economic dislocation.

And so we asked what are the trainings that are out there? And if you see at the top, the highest number are in tech, construction, and healthcare. And that's great news, because those are growing sectors. Those are sectors that we want to put New Yorkers into.

But down at the bottom we see transportation and child care, and we really need to support more program development in those areas, because those are also growing sectors. There's a huge childcare demand. If there's one theme today, it's the need for child care. So we need more childcare workers and we also need those wraparound supports for while workers are doing educational programs.

And so last, we were trying to reconcile these two sort of complicated stories that were hatching. On the one hand there are a lot of unemployed workers who

are trying to reconnect to jobs. Maybe different jobs. Maybe they went to trainings during the pandemic and they want to shift fields.

On the other hand, workforce providers were having difficulty recruiting clients to fill all of their programs. And that's for lots of reasons. It could be for childcare, it could be for anxiety around health or commuting. But it's also because these wraparound services were oversubscribed. So if you look at the areas of programming where they can't meet demand, those are the kinds of things that enable workers to go get training, to go get re-skilling. Those are those support services that we need to offer.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: I want to hear from providers how have you in your programs gotten creative to bridge those gaps with the necessary wraparound services that your clients need to be able to participate? Anybody?

>> I think one thing worth saying is that the settlement house New York in the city is uniquely positioned, and that's what we do and it's a real asset that I don't think is lifted up enough. In-house we're already doing a lot of that stuff and we can do more of it. I think settlement houses are by their very nature are there for the community. So when the community has a crisis it's what we do is respond to that. So we're able to pivot and do a lot of food distribution work, SNAP benefit sign-ups, a lot of vaccine education. So I think tapping into those existing networking and existing agencies that are poised to do that work is really important.

>> Robert?

>> Robert Taylor: I want to echo that. For an agency like mine, we work a lot through collaboration and partnerships. So where we can't directly meet a need, we look to our network and our partnerships to help offset those needs. For example a lot of our students are food insecure and we want to make sure that at least they have one hot meal a day. And we get that through our partnerships.

And then if we can't meet the need, then we try to figure out a referral outside of our organization to support the young person.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Kevin, we have not that much time.

>> Similar for CPC every weekend we have distribution programs and also trying to understand the needs that the individuals are facing and try to do in-house referrals and if not refer them outside to partners.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: The last thing I want to ask, WPTI and the New School have a new report coming out, Andrea and Lena do you want to talk about what that might show? Of course we've been talking about how important it is to have data around all of this stuff so we know what we're talking about when we're planning for the future, which is the theme of the day.

>> LK moe. Part of this is we want these to be a tool for other organizations to know what programs are out there and what programs are doing. But we also want it to be a tool for the city because the city wants to reinvest in workforce. And in order to do that, it needs to draw on expertise that's out there. That's in this room.

But it also should help coordinate what I described earlier, which is this economic change. So there are sectors that are growing, and there are sectors that have lost jobs. So we need an active labor market policy that's going to assess workers' skills and their aspirations, to support them in connecting them to programs, and support workforce organizations in developing new programs in these areas of growth.

And to coordinate this at scale, as only the city can do. So we are looking to release this new report in December that it will give a more detailed description of the change in labor demand, what is this post-COVID labor market going to look like, and how can we inform the city and workforce organizations in order to train workers to seize those opportunities.

>> Ethan Geringer-Sameth: Great. Looking forward to seeing that report.

Thank you all for joining us. I think that was a great conversation.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: We've reached the last stretch. We have three mile an hour Ted Talks and we'll hear from our founders and we'll get you on your way to

chatting with another once again.

So I have the pleasure of introducing a solution to our stage. Building the best peer workforce, authentic interviews for individuals with limited work histories. Please join me in welcoming Curtis Dann-Messier, the founder director of the H and H academy at the New York City health and hospitals.

[Applause]

>> Is hello, everyone. And good afternoon. And give yourselves a round of applause for sticking around.

[Applause]

And I really appreciate you being here.

So first I just want to talk really quickly about peer workers, and then I'll talk a little about authentic interviews for this population. So peer workers are individuals who use their lived experience with mental health or substance use challenges to support other individuals on their path to recovery.

It's a really amazing, in demand middle skill occupation and it gives the people who do this work such meaning in their life. It's a really powerful way to help other people say I've walked in your shoes. Let me show you the way to recovery.

What I also love about this workforce is it takes something that's traditionally a barrier, having a mental health or substance use challenge, it takes one of those barriers and flips it on its head. Now it's a prerequisite for employment. It's a really powerful and important workforce.

It's been growing. The peer workforce has really been growing steadily in New York City. It's a -- we expect this trend to continue. As we heard from many, many people on the stage before, there is just not enough behavioral health workers out there right now. I think Henry Garrido said there was a 38% vacancy rate for social workers. So there's not enough of this workforce and behavioral health out there in this post-COVID world is so important:

Peer workforce has been growing and a way to fill those gaps. And it's growing into new areas. It started in mental health and substance use and that's

still the backbone, but now there are family peers, youth peers and justice peers which I helped to start and we have a New York City justice peer initiative with a new director for individuals who have a experience with criminal legal system involvement and they can help other people who are ensnared in the system get out. And the same thing with housing pairs. If you have a lived experience with homelessness, you can help other people maneuver out of that situation. I talked with someone this morning who works with domestic violence survivors. I've lived through this and gotten out the other side.

So this workforce is really growing and you know, mostly just because it makes sense. Right? If you have thissish eye, who better to talk to than someone who has a shared, lived experience.

But very often this workforce, this population doesn't have strong work history, whether they have been incarcerated, whether they're on disability, whether they have dropped out because of mental health or substance use challenges, they don't have a strong work history. So a traditional way to select this population can be difficult. The resume might not show it. So how do we recruit and select an individual?

So we've done this for many workforce programs, it especially works well with the peer workforce but it's transferrable. Is we do authentic interviews. The first thing I like to do is draw and doodle a little bit and I like to draw what's the ideal candidate. An ideal peer has big ears is a great listener, they have a big heart, they're really empathetic. They've got super excited legs that keep them walk, they are willing to fly that flag of recovery and talk about that.

So the first thing you do with an then particular interview is you really make sure that you're clear on what are the skills you need.

And then you design a process to figure out what point in your process will you be assessing for these skills. It can be anywhere from the application to these authentic interviews, online classes, all the way through. And you have it kind of planned out of when you want to assess for these different qualities.

And so at the peer academy, we have a very rigorous process for selecting

our students. So first we pair individuals off to answer some scripted questions. Where are you in your recovery? What does medication do for you in your recovery?

What has been your experience with social workers? And we don't ask the questions, we have each candidates in small groups ask each other. Because one thing that traditional interviews don't do is to watch how someone listens. And a peer worker, probably the most important skill is that you're great at listening.

How do you get to that in a traditional interview? They're just talking. In this one we actually watch more how an individual is listening to their partner, than what they're saying about it. So that's a really great way to assess that, and it really comes to what is the exact characteristic we're looking for.

The second and probably the most important part of our authentic interview is role play. We actually have scenarios, real-life scenarios from our peer counselors working throughout the hospital, write up some scenarios for us. And during the interview process we have everyone gets one chance playing the patient or the participant, and one chance playing the peer counselor and we just watch.

Some people really shine in that and it's amazing to see how strong they are in this role and you can picture them and they can picture themselves in this and they just got it.

And then they switch and play both ways. It's really an amazing way to assess someone. Not like what would you do or tell me about it, you get to watch them. We have clip boards and we're assessing. It's been amazing to see who can step up in that moment to show they have the skills.

The last piece is we do a group project. Again, when we think about traditional interviews, how do you assess group work? That's one of the most important skills that anyone can have on a behavioral health team in health and hospitals or anywhere throughout the workforce.

In a traditional interview they can say I'm great, I'm collaborative. They're just

saying that. Here we really watch people and we'll do an art project. We'll see those who slink off who don't want to do any work or we'll see those who try to take over. Red flag, right? Which you would have no idea of that if this were a traditional interview.

So these interviews are great for really any job, but really the power for this is they work really well for special populations.

The individuals that we work with, and I'm sure that many of you work with might be justice impact the. They might have a mental health or substance use challenge. These are individuals who are so often overlooked for our jobs, because they don't have it on a piece of paper: But when you have an authentic interview, an authentic process, it's not what's on that piece of paper. You let an individual in those 90 minutes really shine and really show you what they have.

And we were able to select some amazing human beings who are now working for us in our hospital and able to help all those others, and they were overlooked for so much of their lives but they really stepped up in that authentic interview, they were seen and we saw something in them. And now they're working for us in the hospital and helping other people.

So authentic interviews are wonderful. Peer counselors are wonderful and if you know anyone who wants to be a peer counselor, scan that QR code and send some applicants our way. Thank you. Thanks for staying of.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: Thank you, Curtis. Next up we have unlocking employment opportunities for job seekers involved in the legal system. Please join me why welcoming Elena Sigman the director of collaborative learning at the John Jay college institute for justice and opportunity and Kiana Walbrook from Henry street settlement. Welcome.

[Applause]

>> Okay. Good afternoon, everyone. So I'm Kiana Walbrook with hentropy street.

>> And I'm Elena Sigman.

>> And we're here to tell you about a new, free, online training to help workforce development practitioners better partner with individuals who were involved in the legal system.

Can you hear me? Okay. I'm sure everyone in this room may know of some of the challenges that individuals who have been impacted by the criminal legal system goes through when looking for a job. Just by a show of hands, how many of are you currently working with individuals or job seekers that have been impacted by the criminal legal system? Okay. Quite a few.

Is it also safe to say that at some point in your career you didn't have the right training or the resources to support said job seeker get what they needed and be successful. There's no surprise why so many hands were raised. In fact between the years 1980 to 2019, right before the pandemic, New York City arrests resulted in 3.3 million criminal convictions, leading to over 745,000 individuals left with a criminal record. Now, I don't know about you, but those numbers are alarming and it hits home. I believe that if workforce practitioners don't feel confident in supporting a job seek are with a criminal conviction, therein lies the problem. One, as practitioners we feed and get most of everything that we do in the work and the breadth of the work that we do from our confidence. Our confidence in helping our members and clients land a job, and navigate employment. Just to let you know, at Henry Street we do call our clients members. We believe they're members of our community, members of our organization, members of society. We also believe that they look to us to give them high-quality resources, high-quality support, and our ability to mitigate any barriers and challenges for anyone that is dealing with a specialized circumstance. So hopefully by the end of this presentation you'll have a better understanding of how this training tool can support you and your team.

>> Elena: Thanks, Kiana. The issues are exactly why the CUNY school of professional studies and John Jay college institute for justice and opportunity reated this e-learning course. I'm excited to tell you about the course.

Unlocking employment is a 90-minute online self-paced course. Registration is free, and is open to front line staff and leadership at New York City workforce development programs. The goal is to provide practitioners with this foundational knowledge so that there is no wrong door across the whole workforce development system for job seekers who have been involved in the legal system to get help navigating the job search.

The course has four modules, exploring the impact of the legal system on job seekers, getting to know your job seeker, supporting the job search, and legal protections from discrimination against job seekers.

And there is a very extensive resource library if you want to do a deeper dive on to any of these topics.

I want to thank our many partners who contributed to developing this curriculum, starting with you, Kiana and your team at Henry street Settlement, along with job seekers who have lived experience in the legal system, who advised the development of the course. Attorneys from the legal action center, and practitioners from the workforce professionals training institute, Osborne association, women's prison association, and many, many more.

How many people here have taken some boring online trainings? I see quite a few hands here. This one is not like that. This course emphasizes a strengths-based approach, effective practices and resources you can really use. Like a sample resume when someone's work experience was while they were incarcerated. And a sample personal statement if a job seeker gets turned down after a background check.

So the course is interactive. It's designed with characters and realistic scenarios, and exercises in a downloadable workbook. Practitioners learn with examples how to support people who have been impacted by the legal system, and it's also got automated video in sections explaining aspects of the legal system.

This is not really a sit back and listen training. It's designed that you use the workbook with the online course. The feedback we got during the pilot is that it's

best experienced when you take the time to do the exercises right along with taking the course in the moment. That's how you get the full benefit of the training. But you don't have to believe me. We're going to hear from Kiana. She's going to tell you about her team's experience in the course pilot.

>> Kiana Walbrook, thanks Elena. I have my beautiful team in the back was able to participate in the pilot and their feedback was spot-on. Most of the staff reported an increase in confidence when working with someone that had a background, especially when it comes to resume writing and interview support.

Also, they were less likely or less reluctant to take on the challenge of supporting someone with a criminal record. Much of the feedback that we got is that they totally enjoyed the exercises and the case studies, because it allowed them to practice in realtime the skill that they needed in order to support their members.

They found that they had an increase in their strengths perspective blends. A lot of unconscious bias was peeled away, and thinking about how can I really support every member that comes in with specialized situations.

Last but not least, they no longer felt intimidated by all the legal jargon that tends to be the biggest barrier when supporting someone with a background.

And they absolutely loved that resource library, because there was so many articles and materials that they could put their hands on even after completing the training.

I personally saw a few uses for supervisors that wanted to benefit or better engage their staff. You can absolutely use this training as an onboarding tool for some of your newer, greener staff that may not have experience in working with individuals and job seekers with a background. Also you can use it as a professional development support for your veteran staff. You can bring the case studies and the topics to your team meetings, and work at it together, collectively.

And last but not least, you can also use the training as a springboard to create more discussion around how to help specialized populations in supporting them

more effectively and in depth.

All in all this training has the ability to open up your empathy box and curiosity to go the extra mile to really support job seekers that need it the most. It's also a professional development tool that you and your team can pull from as you see fit.

I will now pass it back to Elena who's going to tell you how you can get your hands on this free training tool.

>> The course will open in November, but you can use this QR code on the screen to get a sneak peek at a video from the course, and really preregister and find out more information. Thank you all so much. Looking forward to hearing all of your impressions of the course.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: All right. And for those of you who are leaving, I want to make an announcement that it seems like some of the information about us having a reception has not gotten to everybody. We're having a reception upstairs after this, so please everybody attend. Just one floor up to the left. Please stick around.

And so we have our final solution. It's about resources. So those of you that need more funding and hope to be a little bit more connected to the growing energy economy, this is it.

So last but not least, we have Beth workforce development and training team talk about energy transition workforce training programs. Welcome, Beth.

>> Thank you so much, Annie. Good afternoon on behalf of the NYCETC workforce development team. It is so good to be here with you in person and online to focus on the critical task of advancing talent and equity for New Yorkers across the city and our great state.

Before I dive into what I want to share with you about the work that we do, can I see a show of hands of organizations that either have received funding from NYSERDA workforce development in the past or currently are being funded by NYSERDA workforce development. I see some hands. We are grateful for

the important work that you're doing.

Today I'm going to provide an overview of our workforce development funding opportunities. Two goals here. The first thing is to inform you about those funding opportunities. And two, to invite you, hopefully as a result of some of the information I'm going to share with you, to apply for one or more of those opportunities.

Our workforce development and training program support New York State's clean energy and jobs agenda which is putting our state on the path to a carbon neutrality economy under the Climate Act which is the shorthand for the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. This is really about the 21st century economy that you heard Greg speak about earlier today.

We've committed \$120 million to support existing workforce development training initiatives and these efforts prioritize programs for the state's most underserved communities, populations, including priority populations and disadvantaged communities. And it also has a focus on helping to integrate displaced workers into the clean energy industry.

About half of our funding has been committed to date, and we are well on our way to our goal of 40,000 individuals trained for the growing clean energy jobs in our state. And we need your help to get to that 40,000 goal.

The climate act formalizes a commitment to ensuring that the benefits are directed as disadvantaged communities. The current interim definition of disadvantaged communities is a location-based analysis that's based on census groups that fit income thresholds and environmental justice criteria among other factors.

I also want to highlight a little bit about the priority populations that we work with. They include, and it's a list that's quite extensive. Veterans, individuals with disabilities, low income individuals, incumbent or unemployed fossil fuel workers, previously incarcerated individuals. 16-24-year-olds who's completed a comprehensive training program, for example, through a career technical high school, conservation core, youth build, homeless, individuals, and also single

parents.

So a rather extensive list of those populations that we are especially interested in working with.

And as part of our work, we periodically fund research that illuminates where the greatest workforce needs and opportunities are in clean energy across New York. Our 2021 clean energy industry report shows that the state had just over 157,000 jobs in clean energy at the end of 2020, which represents 6,000 jobs that were lost amidst the pandemic.

But despite this loss, clean energy employment remains 12% higher than the 2015 baseline year.

Amid the pandemic New York made modest employment gain in key sectors which include wind energy, clean and alternative transportation energy storage and grid modernization.

And according to a second report that came out from the climate justice working group, the job study which you see here on this slide, the demand for clean energy jobs is expected to increase more than 60% from 2019 to 2030. Adding at least 211,000 new jobs here in New York State.

The vast majority of these jobs fall within these four sectors that you can see here. Notably clean energy jobs in the subsectors are expected to grow by at least 346,000 jobs through 2050.

The job study also showed that 60% of the jobs lost in a number of displaced subsectors for the time period of 2019 to 2030 will be from the lower wage paying category, those paying less than \$28 an hour. Conventional fueling stations, or gas stations, if you will, represent almost half of all displaced jobs in the third category Joe noted in this report.

Other displaced job areas include those in petroleum, natural gas, vehicle maintenance and nuclear.

The good news is 70% of the jobs added in subsectors. Between 2019 and 2030. Those jobs will be in the middle range rate that, is \$28 to \$37 an hour. Or higher, paying more than \$37 an hour.

Geographically speaking, the good news continues. Job increases through 2030 are found in every corner of the state, with each of New York's five regions seeing an increase of up to 48,000 net new jobs.

To give you a little bit of context of work that we on do in workforce development.

How do we do this? How do we help residents across the city, across the state, take advantage of the job growth that's coming in these clean energy sectors? We do this by funding a number of program opportunity notices or PONS in NYSERDA speak, that advance clean energy workforce development. Our marquis program is the one you see here.

This supports technical training, hands-on learning, job placement and supportive services for new and existing workers, apprentices, journeypersons and students.

I will also tell you some of the projects that we fund also include training stipends. And this PON also covers technical training conducted in languages other than English. So there's a lot more there that you can certainly review on the website.

One other note, of course we are especially looking to fund projects that train individuals who represent priority populations and who live in disadvantaged communities.

What is particularly exciting about PON3981 is that it can also fund those wraparound services I mentioned a few minutes ago. For example transportation subsidies, mental health counseling, among several other categories.

We and most importantly our training partners find these kinds of supportive services often can make a big difference. We heard about this in some of the panels earlier, for people who have barriers to employment so that they can successfully move into or up in a green job.

Having said that, we wish we had more funding available for supportive services and we would be more than glad to talk with any philanthropic

organizations that may be interested in further leveraging NYSERDA funding for these services.

The need is great and there are definitely opportunities to expand coverage of supportive services for New Yorkers who want to move into clean energy jobs.

To give you a sense of what some career pathways programs might look like, I would like to highlight a few of our current or recent projects. Our first one is a new project with the fund for public housing which is the foundation arm of the New York City housing authority. The fund is delivering a comprehensive training program delivering heat pump installations and maintenance, energy performance contracts and other energy retro fits at NYCHA properties across the city.

The goal is to accelerate building decarbonization by developing a custom train workforce individuals from environmental justice communities. It will serve 100 residents and we're excited to hear good things in the coming months.

A second project that we want to showcase for you is one with non-traditional employment for women. NEW who I think you all know very well. NEW developed a training program for 75 low income women, particularly women of color for jobs in apprenticeships in the green color economy. This is a hands on course that includes skills training, soft skills workshops, physical conditioning, mentoring and networking opportunities with subject matter experts, plus site tours in the construction industry.

NEW partners with major employers and apprenticeship programs including Con Edison, national grid and PSE&G, Cushman and Wakefield, the city's department of environmental protection and more than 30 registered apprenticeship programs.

The last one I'm going to highlight for you is the stacks and jewels. They partnered with the UA maker academy, the south Bronx community charter high school and the lower he's side girls club to prepare high school seniors in low income communities for jobs in the building automation system industry. Yes, there is an industry that's focused on that.

In addition to rigorous technical training, career exploration, hands-on learning and close mentorship by industry professionals, the program leads to credentials preparing students for careers in the energy efficiency and clean technology industry. The project which recently wrapped up had robust interest with stacks and jewels training twice as many students as they originally expected when the program began. So pretty exciting stuff.

You can see here a list of many of the organizations that we're working with or that we've recently worked with. We need your organization on this list.

There are also some other ways that your organization can guide people into the clean energy workforce here in New York State. Our portfolio at NYSERDA is designed to be modular or stackable. Someone could complete a 3981 training program and then step into an internship or a job that's part of our on-the-job training program that I'll highlight in a moment. This provides them with a ladder or a scaffold, if you will, into a clean energy career.

And so in fact a number of the training partners and community-based organizations we've worked with actively highlight these programs in talking with their employer partners. So it's a win-win all the way around.

Our internship program provides wage reimbursement for internships on a sliding scale depending on employer size. Internships can be full or part-time while that student goes to school. Businesses can onboard their own interns or they can choose from a qualified candidate list of people who have applied directly through NYSERDA.

Employers can have up to 30 interns while MWBEs and SDVOBs have no cap on the number of interns they can bring on.

The program is open to businesses, not-for-profits, municipalities, direct entry preapprenticeship programs providing clean energy services.

Finally our on-the-job training program provides organizations hiring new workers in clean energy with a wage reimbursement on a sliding scale depending on eligibility, lowering the risk of bringing a new team member on board for them. In general, this program provides a 50% to 75% wage

reimbursement to eligible businesses for 4-6 months of a new-hire's training period. 75% for MWBEs, SVDDBs and heat pump hires and 50% for all other hires.

Also indicate here that individuals from priority populations or disadvantaged communities receive 6 months of reimbursement compared to four months for all other hires.

So in closing, I hope that you have heard something here that inspired you to take a look at these opportunities to be a part of the clean energy jobs that are coming to New York State. Can I see a show of hands of anyone who's interested in learning more about any of those programs? Wonderful. Please do check out the QR code. That will take you directly to the NYSERDA workforce development training page on the website.

And again, we really appreciate the opportunity to share these funding opportunities with you, and we hope that we will be working with you very soon.

One other quick point I'll mention, we recently streamlined our application process for PON3981. It is now a concept paper. You do not have to do a whole proposal, unless -- hopefully your concept paper would be approved and then you would be invited to do that. So we are really trying to lower the barriers to applying for that program, and we hope that we see an application from you very soon. Thank you so much.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: Thank you, Beth. Beth will be also upstairs at the reception so you can talk to her then.

And we'll of course be posting all of these materials on our website so you'll be able to get all of these resources after the fact. You don't need to be scrambling

Last but certainly not least, thank you all that you've stayed until the end of the show, we are going back to the beginning to learn from some of our founders. This is our 25th year anniversary and we are so proud of the work

that we have done and have many lessons to learn from how the coalition began. So please welcome Ginny Cruickshank and Cathy masters in conversation with Valerie Payne who's from rebuilding together NYC who's also on the board of NYCETC. Welcome.

[Applause]

>> Valerie Payne: Thank you for sticking with us for this final session. I'm really competed to be here with Kathy and Ginny to have a conversation about the origins of the coalition especially since it's our 25th year. We have a couple of questions that we'll go through. And the first one is why did you guys start the coalition? What was the impetus behind bringing people together to start this conversation with the workforce practitioners at the time?

>> Thanks, Valerie. First of all let me say I'm glad that you did hang around hopefully knowing a little about where we came from might give you some insight on where you're going.

The coalition was formed actually to fill a very significant need. At the time there really wasn't a field of workforce development in New York City. There were people doing the work, but they were mostly attached to other fields. So there were job developers who were working in the refugee program. There were ESL teachers. There were GED teachers. There were people doing job development in various programs. But if you think it's siloed now,ed it was incredibly siloed.

And incredibly lonely in the sense that we didn't have a community. We didn't have a field.

And Bonnie Potter who was the first executive director of the coalition, was then working for Non traditional Employment for Women and she started to gather together some of the executive level folks that were doing this work, to try and figure out if we could create a community of interest. And that is how we started.

That led us to beginning to analyze some of the programs that were happening. And two other big things were happening right around that time.

The Workforce Investment Act had been passed, which turned everything on its head, in terms of federal funding for workforce development or for job training and placement, is what it was called then.

And welfare to work was happening. And the city of New York was all in on Welfare to Work. All in on rapid attachment. Very negative about training of any sort. And these were big major factors that we felt we had had very little input into how things were going. And wanted to sort of create an advocacy arm or an advocacy organization that could speak for what was then the nascent field of workforce development

>> Valerie Payne: I also remember performance-based contracting became a thing and some of those contracts were large and there was some concern about the smaller providers and them being squeezed out and not having the opportunity to compete for those funds.

>> Virginia Cruickshank hi, I'm delighted to be here with you all and thrilled it's 25 years. Kathy and I and Valerie, we've been talking about what these Errol years were all about. And I really that the main thing for me was I needed somebody to talk to. I was all alone. And you know, from a personal standpoint, and professional standpoint, even in my own organization, there was nobody for me to come miss rate with, to talk to, or how do we do this.

We were basically inventing this as we go, and it turned out that this was also happening in other organizations, as Kathy mentioned. That we were all trying to figure this out, by ourselves. And at the same time our experience with the-then Department of Employment was -- we were somewhat pitted against each other. We heard of other organizations, and they would say oh, well so-and-so is doing this in a different way than you are, blah blah blah.

So basically so that was very uncomfortable for us. So we really wanted to change the environment. So we gathered together at the Nontraditional Employment for Women in Bonnie's office and we started forming a coalition. As we began our discussions, RFPs were issued and we realized that we needed to talk to one another about what are the demands in these RFPs and to

come up with ways of questioning why certain things are being done.

And we also were able to collaborate with one another, subcontract with one another, and go into proposals together because we had learned to trust one another because we were together at meetings.

So it was an exciting time, challenging time. But we were still sort of forming our way of looking at the world, and as Kathy said, the workforce development did not exist. And one of the things I'm delighted to learn today or in the last couple of days that the new deputy mayor has the name workforce development as part of her title. So that is a long way we've come in 25 years.

>> Valerie Payne: Definitely deserves a round of applause.

Our next question is really around so what were the things that you all implemented early on, the activities? What were the changes that you were trying to make and the impact that you were trying to have, once the coalition was formed and operational and off the ground?

>> Kathleen Masters: In the beginning about trying to gather the information and share the information more broadly with the people who were doing the work. We start the doing informational situations particularly around the changes that were happening that were going to radically affect the way people did their work. Around Welfare to Work and around the WIOA changes.

And the philanthropic community became interested, or we were able to get some interest from the philanthropic community, which was then actually beginning the New York community trust and a variety of other funders getting together in their workforce funders group, assisted us in developing the coalition. So we started doing a regular newsletter. We started doing more of the educational or presentations around available funding and that sort of thing. With the help of philanthropy, created and spun off the Workforce Professionals Training Institute, which was actually a creation of the Employment and Training Coalition. We got rid of the Department of Employment. Which at the time was a great victory. Because it was a very small department that distributed only the federal money. And what we were trying to do then, just as the mayor is trying

to do now and you are still trying to do, is to try and bring these funding streams into more coordination under a single deputy mayor. Which only took 25 years to do that.

So getting rid of the Department of Employment was the beginning of that. I understand now you folks are advocating to have a similar department, hopefully a more successful one.

>> Virginia Cruickshank: Where everything can be aggregated in one place. That's the main thing. I still hear about the silos today. I've been retired for eight or 10 years but I dabble in the work because I'm a consultant. But I'm sort of amazed that there's still, what is it, 23 or 27 organizations that still do workforce development. And part of me wonders about how success is measured.

I know that that was one of the things we had raised during the Bloomberg administration. Because there wasn't one definition of what is an outcome, what is a placement. How long does a placement have to be for? How do we measure some of the work that's done and then the person goes on to college. Is that a good outcome?

So I think that some of those issues probably still remain to this day. And so I know that those are some of the things. I think Kathy you remember going to the Bloomberg administration and we were hoping that that system of data, and the metrics that they had set up, were going to outlive its administration. But did not.

>> Kathleen Masters: I noticed there were some folks here that presented today that were involved in that process, both as consultants and were in government at the time. You know, enormous amounts of energy spent on trying to define what is a placement. And when the administration ended, it all went by the wayside. This is a problem, I think. It's a problem with city government generally, and the way in which administrations choose to jettison things or bring things back that maybe weren't as successful.

But it's unfortunate to see that with all the progress that has been made, there's still some of the same problems that we were struggling with 20 or 25

years ago

>> Virginia Cruickshank: The best news, there's at least 300 of you who can talk to one another and you have each other's voices and you have each other's back and you actually have a career. A career in workforce development did not exist. Somebody would assign that person, go find them a job and they would be scrambling around. Now we do have an official, bona fide organization.

With as I mentioned the deputy mayor heading this up. I remain hopeful that that task force has now been formed, and hopefully gathering everyone together. And I was very struck by some of the comments that were made today about bringing the educational system into this whole process. K-12 is as involved as all of us are. So I think that's very hopeful. I keep seeing hopeful signs back from where we started, and when we're sitting in the room climbing up three flights of stairs, if you remember doing that, Kathy.

And then we got our own building. Our own space which was funded by the city of New York. They enabled us to have our own office there. Now is there a staff of how many? Five. We started with one and a lot was done with volunteer work on our behalf and on behalf of the board and the early board members that helped us out along the way.

>> Kathleen Masters: It was very -- the conference, Annie, was fantastic. And very impressive. And impressive numbers of people here that are working in the field. And the degree to which the field has professionalized is really quite impressive. And you all deserve a great amount of credit for having moved it along in the way that you have. I think now the struggle is to make sure that you get paid what you're worth.

And of course the only way that that can happen is if the institutions that the organizations are getting paid what the work costs to do. Which is a big struggle

>> Virginia Cruickshank: I would echo that I think NYCETC is the place to go for workforce development information policy and ideas and so forth. That did not happen many, many years ago. Where the newspapers now will call legislature -- the city agencies will call and they were really on par with others

who are in the field, and also from the funders to the city agencies and to the foundations, they do look to NYCETC for that kind of background.

So I think that's a credit to the staff of NYCETC to have done that. So I'm really proud to have been associated with the organization from the early days and to see what it's grown into.

>> Valerie Payne: So the final question is really -- and we touched on it a little bit. There are some ongoing challenges that were identified way back when, such as what are the metrics, how do we define them, how are we tracking them. And nonprofits are doing it five different ways for each funder, et cetera. And we have made some progress, as we alluded with the current administration really focusing a lot more on workforce development.

I think with each administration there's been some progress made. But what I guess advice do you have for the group, and for the current -- for Greg, who's just coming on as the new executive director of the Employment and Training Coalition, what kind of thoughts and suggestions and advice do you have as they continue to go forward?

>> Kathleen Masters: I guess the main thing is to actually try and get things completed during the course of an administration so that they might actually stick into the next. To try and figure out ways to institutionalize things so that they don't get tossed out at each new administration that comes in with new ideas, that may or may not be better than what's going on here.

I'm not sure -- in each situation what the way to do that is, whether it's about getting things into law, going to the city council and having things in law has certainly helped on the legal services program side. It might be a strategy, I don't know. But it's disheartening, I think, when you work on something and you spend a lot of time on it and you know, it just absolutely dies and goes no where.

>> Virginia Cruickshank: I would -- the thought that occurs to me is that we've always been reactive to the funding sources, and I would love to see how the field could be pro active in establishing from the ground up the needs of our constituents, the needs of employers. Because we also do represent both parts

of the economy. The employers who need the workers and how we represent the people on the ground. I think of the CVOs as being closer to our constituents.

We are their voice and it's often a violent voice and we represent them. Where else would they go. So I would love to see how we could get the direction of how this occurs from -- in a proactive way rather than reacting to always with the funders coming down we want you to do this, which is also forced the silos in my opinion.

>> Kathleen Masters: One of the speakers earlier on raised that issue and I thought that's absolutely right. There are programs that are doing good work. It should not have to be that you have to turn yourself inside out for a philanthropic funder to create some new program, to do some new thing. When what you're already doing works quite well.

So I think advocating for that is a really important thing.

>> Virginia Cruickshank: I totally echo that when I heard that said today somebody said oh, can't you come up with something new and innovative and I'm thinking this works very well. That was like a caution to me when someone said new and innovative how can I repackage with new words this is new and innovative. Oh, really. Famous last words. I don't know. You're all laughing so I know it resonates with some of you.

>> Kathleen Masters: It's still happening.

>> Virginia Cruickshank: Right.

>> Valerie Payne: All right. Well, that might be a great place to end, unless there are some other thoughts that you have around continuing to focus on the work. I mean, I think the field has certainly really evolved. I know I was just starting out when the coalition was starting. And a bunch of us in the room have been kind of soldiering away and will continue for some time.

And thank you so much.

>> Virginia Cruickshank: Congratulations and good luck to all of you, really and truly.

>> Kathleen Masters: Thanks so much.

[Applause]

>> Annie Garneva: Thank you so much. It's been a wonderful journey today. Appreciate all of you staying around for the entirety of it. Just some final thoughts.

Weception upstairs. If you go right back up to floor 1, take a left. And you'll see it right there. It will be going on until 7:00. So coat check is still available until 7:30. Please make sure to join us to celebrate. There's alcohol, snacks, lots of good chat. So hope to see you there!